



## DOCTOR OF EDUCATION (EDD)

### **Examining the impact of participating in a high dissonance service-learning program on the global perspectives and global citizenship of college students studying abroad**

Pietro, Roy

*Award date:*  
2017

*Awarding institution:*  
University of Bath

[Link to publication](#)

## **Alternative formats**

If you require this document in an alternative format, please contact:  
[openaccess@bath.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@bath.ac.uk)

Copyright of this thesis rests with the author. Access is subject to the above licence, if given. If no licence is specified above, original content in this thesis is licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC-ND 4.0) Licence (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>). Any third-party copyright material present remains the property of its respective owner(s) and is licensed under its existing terms.

### **Take down policy**

If you consider content within Bath's Research Portal to be in breach of UK law, please contact: [openaccess@bath.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@bath.ac.uk) with the details. Your claim will be investigated and, where appropriate, the item will be removed from public view as soon as possible.

Examining the impact of participating in a high dissonance service-learning program on the global perspectives and global citizenship of college students studying abroad

Roy Edward Pietro

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Education

University of Bath

Department of Education

December 2016

**COPYRIGHT**

Attention is drawn to the fact that copyright of this thesis rests with the author. A copy of this thesis has been supplied on condition that anyone who consults it is understood to recognise that its copyright rests with the author and that they must not copy it or use material from it except as permitted by law or with the consent of the author.

This thesis may be made available for consultation within the University Library and may be photocopied or lent to other libraries for the purposes of consultation with effect from December, 2016

Signed on behalf of the Faculty/School of. Education

**Signature:**

## Table of Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	6
<b>Abstract</b>	7
<b>Chapter 1 Study Overview</b>	
1.1 Chapter Introduction	8
1.2 Defining Global Citizenship	9
1.3 Introduction to the Study	13
1.4 Purpose of the Study	14
1.5 Research Questions	15
1.6 Organizational Overview of the Study	16
1.7 Assumptions	17
<b>Chapter 2 Literature Review</b>	
2.1 Chapter Introduction	18
2.2 Study Abroad	18
2.2.1 Student Development Benefits from Study Abroad	20
2.2.2 Critique of Study Abroad	21
2.3 Global Citizenship in U.S. Higher Education	23
2.4 Philosophical Roots of Service-Learning in the U.S.	26
2.4.1 Assessing the Efficacy of Service-Learning	27
2.4.2 Service-Learning while Study Abroad (ISL)	28
2.5 Theory of Transformational Learning	29
2.6 Connecting the Dots: Linking Study Abroad to Global Citizenship	31
2.6.1 Critical Service-Learning as a Pedagogy for the Privileged	33
2.6.2 Potential Challenges in Critical Service-Learning	37
2.6.3 Related Theories: Critical Global Citizenship and Transformative Citizenship Education	38
2.6.4 Evidence of Perspective Transformations from High Dissonance ISL Program Participation	38
2.7 Summary of the Literature Review	42

## **Chapter 3 Research Methodology**

3.1	Chapter Introduction	45
3.1.1	Research Questions and Initial Propositions	46
3.2	Research Paradigm	46
3.3	Research Approach	49
3.4	Research Design	50
3.4.1	Collective Case Study	51
3.4.2	Research Sample	53
3.4.3	Program Context- UConn Study Abroad Program in Cape Town	54
3.4.4	Use of Qualitative Methods	56
3.5	Data Collection	56
3.5.1	Collection of Contextual Data	57
3.5.2	Multi-Phase Narrative Data Collection	57
3.5.3	Guided Autobiographies –Retrospective Re-Storied Accounts	58
3.5.4	Archived Documents –Personal Experience Reflective Journals	60
3.5.5	Data Analysis	61
3.5.6	Interpretive Biography	61
3.5.7	Systematic Thematic Analysis	62
3.5.8	Template Analysis	63
3.5.9	Data Analysis Process	64
3.6	Methodological Limitations of the Study	68
3.7	Ethics and Protection of Human Subjects	69
3.8	Validity and Trustworthiness	69

## **Chapter 4 Initial Data Analysis and Presentation of the Findings**

4.1	Introduction to Chapter	72
4.2	Presentation of the Findings	72
4.2.1	Findings	74
4.2.2	Finding 1 Major Theme: Perspective Transformation	75
4.2.3	Finding 2 Major Theme: Global Citizenship Development	76
4.2.4	Finding 3 Major theme: Transformative Global Citizenship	78
4.2.5	Finding 4 Major Theme: High Socio-economic Dissonance	80

4.2.6	Finding 5	Major Theme: Strong Personal Connections with Individuals from Host Communities	81
4.2.7	Finding 6	Readjustment Issues upon Re-entry to U.S.	82
4.2.8	Finding 7	Instances of Persistent Readjustment Struggles	83
4.3	Summary of Findings		84

## **Chapter 5 Analysis, Interpretation and Synthesis of Findings**

5.1	Purpose of the Chapter		86
5.2	Systematic Approach to Research		86
5.3	Analytical Category Development		88
5.4	Analytic Category 1: Transforming Global Perspectives and Enhancing Global Citizenship		90
5.4.1	Global Perspectives		91
5.4.2	Meaning Perspectives --Based on Ideology (beliefs system from socialization process)		92
5.4.3	Global Citizenship Development		94
5.5	Analytic Category 2: Persisting Perspective Transformations and development of Transformative Global Citizens		97
5.6	Analytic Category 3: Reconsidering Ideologies, Assumptions and Relative Privilege from High Cognitive Dissonance		100
5.6.1	Critical Reflection		104
5.6.2	Critical Reflective Discourse		104
5.6.3	Systemic Critical Reflection –Questioning Hegemonic Ideological Assumptions and Relative Power and Privilege		105
5.6.4	Consciousness-Raising: Service-learning with Social Justice Focus		111
5.7	Analytical Category 4 Personal Connections with Individuals of Considerably Less Privilege		116
5.7.1	Readjustment Issues		121
5.7.2	Lingering Negative Effects from Personalizing High Socio-Economic Dissonance Abroad		124

## **Chapter 6 Discussion**

6.1	Purpose of the Study	126
6.2	Discussion and Conclusions	126
6.3	Significance of the Study	129
6.4	Contribution to Theory	131
6.5	Contribution to Informing the Practice of Study Abroad	133
6.6	Issues regarding Generalizing the Findings of the Study	136
6.7	Legitimate Challenges to the Study	137
6.8	Directions for Future Research	144

<b>References</b>	146
-------------------	-----

## **Appendices**

Appendix A	UConn in Cape Town Promotional Materials	159
Appendix B	Participant Recruitment Email	160
Appendix C	Consent Form	161
Appendix D	Guided Autobiography Questionnaire	163
Appendix E	Follow-up Questions Email	166
Appendix F	Sample form for Extracting Data from Individuals	167
Appendix G	Participant Background Information	170
Appendix H	Templates for Key Statements from Participants	171
Appendix I	Tables for Analytic Categories	189
Appendix J	Operational Definition of Key Terms	193

## Acknowledgements

I have been privileged to work with many supportive and insightful faculty and professional staff from the Department of Education at the University of Bath (UBath) over the past eight years. Special thanks goes to Dr. Mary Hayden, whose class on *International Education* was the nexus for this research study. Of course, I could have never made it to the finish line without the sage advice my research supervisors, which included Dr. Manuel Souto-Otero, Dr. Robin Shields and Dr. Richard Watermeyer.

My journey towards attaining a doctoral degree in Educational Leadership actually started almost thirty years ago at the University of Connecticut (UConn). I was blessed to have Dr. Harry Hartley as my graduate advisor and mentor in 1988 as I started my initial doctoral studies which focused on the relationship between higher education and social development. While Harry moved on to become the President of UConn and I put my doctoral program on hold to accept a career opportunity outside of academia, his passion for harnessing higher education investments as a tool for positive social change had a lasting impact on me. When I subsequently returned to UConn as an administrator years later, and decided to follow my academic passion and pursue my research interests at UBath, the support of UConn's Human Resource Office, especially Patty Geissler, was invaluable and much appreciated. I also need to recognize and thank my family, including my wife (Annette) and daughters (KC and Ally), for their patience and understanding as I toiled away both here and 'across the pond' over the past eight years to complete my doctoral program at UBath. Their encouragement and unwavering support enabled me to persevere. Finally, I would be remiss not to thank some of folks from UConn who contributed to this accomplishment. This includes Dr. Daniel Weiner, UConn's Vice-President of Global Affairs, who provided me his support to investigate this research topic. And I am eternally grateful to Dr. Marita McComiskey, who oversees the UConn Study Abroad Program in Cape Town, for allowing me to experience the program 'up close and personal', including meeting some of her remarkable students and visiting with local children living in the townships outside of Cape Town proper. The chance to hear their firsthand accounts about the numerous intercultural lessons learned, both in the classroom and in the field, was truly inspirational.

## **Abstract**

Many universities in the U.S. point to participation in study abroad programs as evidence of their institutional efficacy in fostering global citizens. While a cursory review of student development outcomes after participating in traditional study abroad programs did not seem to support this contention, some evidence of global citizenship development after students participated in international service-learning programs was noted in the literature. This research study examined learning outcomes from 29 students from the University of Connecticut who had previously participated in a high dissonance service-learning program in Cape Town, South Africa. It was hoped that a better understanding of the nature and persistence of any perspective transformation that occurred, as indicated by changes in global perspectives and enhanced global citizenship development.

The data analysis found evidence that the vast majority of participants had experienced a perspective transformation. The data also indicates that these perspective transformations appear to have fostered one or more sub-dimensions of transformative global citizenship (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy and a social justice orientation), which persisted over time. Two-thirds of the study participants indicated that they had experienced a perspective transformation leading to transformative global citizenship development. These same participants went on to take transformative action related to making the world a better place. The multi-phased data analysis process re-examined the participant data using the literature on transformative learning and critical service-learning theory as a pedagogical lens for interpretation.

The findings indicate that critical reflection and discourse pertaining to personal experiences with high socio-economic dissonance during the program, coping with personal connections with individuals of considerably less privilege from the under-resourced host communities, had played a substantial role in fostering perspective transformations that persisted over time and led to transformative global citizenship actions. Implications for theory and practice were discussed, and avenues for future research identified.



***Examining the impact of participating in a high dissonance service-learning program on the global perspectives and global citizenship of college students studying abroad***

**Chapter 1 Introduction**

**1.1 Chapter Introduction**

Numerous colleges and universities throughout the United States, including institutions such as Wesleyan University, Colgate University, Drake University, Ithaca College, Haverford College and Lehigh University (Zemach-Bersin, 2007), continue to recognize the importance of fostering global citizenship within their respective student bodies. However, while global citizenship development may be cited as a priority in their mission statements or academic plans, these institutions of higher learning rarely if ever provide any related clue as to the specific pedagogical process that would lead to global citizenship development. For example, the University of Connecticut's (UConn) recent academic plan clearly articulates the goal of "producing global citizens with multicultural awareness and respect" (University of Connecticut, 2014, p. 18) without any specific guidance on how this is to be accomplished. Ideally, UConn and other universities would have a well-established pedagogical process in order to develop and evaluate global citizenship as an integral part of their undergraduate program.

These institutions of higher learning often point to the rising popularity in study abroad programs as evidence of their efficacy in fostering global citizens (Smith, 2004). A few colleges have even gone so far as to make study abroad a mandatory experience for undergraduates (Lewin, 2009, p.XIII). While study abroad does appear to offer a convenient venue for students to develop global citizenship, little evidence was found in the literature to substantiate the claim that actual global citizenship is developed routinely through participation in a traditional study abroad program.

## 1.2 Defining Global Citizenship

One problem with the goal of global citizenship development is that the term global citizenship is often contested in the literature (Parekh, 2003; Arneil, 2007; Muetzelfeldt & Smith, 2002; Nussbaum, 1997; Schattle, 2009; Noddings, 2005). UConn's academic plan (2014) touts its institutional goal that "UConn's students will become well-educated leaders and global citizens", encouraging students to "further their intercultural understanding and recognition of the transnational nature of the challenges and opportunities we face" (UConn, p.11). Further in the document, students are encouraged to "embrace diversity—as a commitment to fostering a welcoming environment in which all individuals can achieve their fullest potential" (pg. 11). UConn students should "celebrate human difference while addressing harmful inequality and disparities, achieving rights and justice, addressing these challenges at home and abroad is central to our land grant mission" (pg. 25). The type of transformative global citizen envisioned by UConn appears to be well aligned with the definition advanced by Oxfam:

someone who is aware of the wider world and their role as a world citizen; respects and values diversity; has an understanding of how the world works economically, politically, socially, culturally, technologically and environmentally; is outraged by social injustice; participates in and contributes to the community at a range of levels from the local to the global; is willing to take action to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place; and takes responsibility for their actions (Davies, 2006, p.206).

This definition is similar in nature to the definition of global citizenship advanced by Schultz (2007). If we assume that the global citizenship traits that universities are seeking to develop in their students are aligned with the definitions advanced by Oxfam and Schultz, the question of how exactly to educate college students to become global citizens remains largely unanswered. Transformative global citizenship development, which leads to subsequent action as described above, appears to require a pedagogical approach that can foster a global mindset,

with learning outcomes that include enhanced levels of self-awareness of one's place in the wider interdependent world (global conscientiousness); acceptance of diversity and diverse cultures (ethnocultural empathy); and the willingness to take personal action to address local or global injustice (social justice activism). Global citizenship education, as considered in this vein, may be similar in nature to moral development and character education, which require learning within both the cognitive and affective domain. Goleman's (1996, 2006) seminal work on emotional and social intelligence proposed an emotional competence model with affective learning outcomes such as self-awareness, social responsibility, commitment, empathy and cooperation with others, which are similar in nature to many of the sub-dimensions of global citizenship. The exhaustive literature on service-learning programs indicates that this pedagogical approach may be useful to promote social and emotional learning outcomes, and numerous studies (Keen & Keen, 1998; Astin, Sax, & Avalos, 1999; Eyler & Giles, 1997) have presented findings of enhanced levels of empathy, self-awareness, personal and social responsibility and acceptance of diversity when students perform community service as part of an academic course.

Traditional study abroad programs are often criticized for being little more than "commercial travel masquerading as an academic experience" in which "students never breakout of their isolation and mix with the locals" (Lewin, 2009, p. XV). It is most likely true that that study abroad will not automatically foster the global citizenship outcomes as defined above. However, participation in service-learning programs as part of study abroad may provide an experiential immersion experience to enhance global understanding and foster social and emotional intelligence. There are several recent case studies (Kiely, 2002; Gaines-Hanks & Grayman, 2009; Monard-Weismann, 2003) in the literature with findings that indicate that some students, after participating in international service-learning (ISL) programs while studying abroad, report having experienced perspective transformations in their previously held attitudes and worldviews, demonstrating ethnocultural empathy, a greater acceptance of diversity and a commitment to act to

promote local and global social justice. These student development outcomes may well indicate the development of global citizenship. ISL is an emerging programming area, and additional research on what actually happens when students undergo the phenomenon of a perspective transformation while studying abroad, as indicated by enhanced levels of global citizenship, may be helpful at uncovering a pedagogical process to foster global citizenship development.

Lewin (2009) warned that ISL programs may also be counter-productive to the notion of global citizenship if they are perceived as just “colonist projects of visiting the natives” which serves to “reinforce stereotypes of themselves and others” (p. XV). ISL programs are often held in the developing world, and student visitors to such destinations often feel disoriented or ‘out of their comfort zone’, a phenomenon sometimes referred to as cultural shock (Smith, 2004; Adler, 1975). Typically, the unsettling effects of traditional cultural shock are resolved over time, which leads to the question of whether the findings of perspective transformations in student participants are transformative in nature, or just short-term, temporary reactions to their immersive experience. Transformative global citizenship development would seem to require that the students have had a long-lasting change in their worldviews and mindsets. It remains questionable that even these types of experiences will cause students to transform into global citizens for the long haul. Some ISL programs, however, focus on engaging the student participants to deep-rooted issues of social injustice, including day-to-day firsthand exposure to real-world cases of extreme poverty or gender inequity during their service-learning experience. This type of experience may be more challenging for the program participants to process and internalize as they examine and reconsider their own relative privilege. “One’s privilege is starkly illuminated when one witnesses young children scavenging in garbage” (Barbour, 2006, in Lewin, p. 112). I recall experiencing similar cognitive dissonance during a recent trip to Kenya when I had the chance to spend time with some children and their mothers in Kibera, which is one of the most studied ‘slums’ in Africa. Upon some deep reflection, I started to realize how unfair it was that my relative privilege in life was more determined by where I was born than what I had

ever accomplished. Transformative global citizenship development, as defined in the present study, would require not only that the students reconsider their existing beliefs, values and perspectives, and question their own power and privilege in global society, but that they also acquire a more permanent critical consciousness and actually go on to take action against social inequities (Lapayese, 2003). The emerging body of literature on critical service-learning makes a theoretical case for how study abroad service-learning that engages students in real world dilemmas and deep cognitive dissonance around socio-economic justice, through an intentionally designed transformative learning process, may provide the consciousness-raising experience that can transform students into authentic global citizens. Transformative learning theory, as advanced by Mezirow (1978, 1981, 2000, 2006) and other scholars of adult learning (Taylor; 1994, 1998; Cranton, 2006; Brookfield, 2000, Tenant, 1993), appears to help explain how such study abroad experiences, after being processed and internalized through critical reflection and dialogue, might lead to long-lasting perspective transformations in participants.

The concept of social justice underpins the conceptual framework of transformative global citizenship. The New Oxford American Dictionary defines social justice in terms of the equitable distribution of wealth, opportunities, and privileges within a society. A commitment to social justice involves "promoting a just society by challenging injustice and valuing diversity" and understanding that "all people share a common humanity and therefore have a right to equitable treatment, support for their human rights, and a fair allocation of community resources" (Toowoomba Catholic Education, 2006). This would indicate that the study abroad students who self-report a perspective transformation would not only cite an intention to act to address issues of social justice when they return back to campus, but would actually go on to take steps to demonstrate their commitment to social justice after they graduated from college. A longitudinal study that examined whether or not students who reported being transformed into a global citizen after they participated in an ISL program actually took action to promote local or global social justice would be helpful in substantiating or refuting claims as to whether ISL program participation

can foster transformative global citizenship development (Bringle, Hatcher, & Jones, 2011). The available literature on the efficacy of ISL programs provides scant evidence to substantiate whether the student reports of perspective transformations actually persist over time. Longitudinal data that can examine the long-term outcomes, including persistence of the perspective transformations over time, would contribute to the scholarship in this area.

### **1.3 Introduction to the Study**

The focus of this study is the nature and persistence over time of the phenomenon of a perspective transformation in which some students experience after participating in ISL programs. The present study focuses on an ISL program that has taken place annually each spring semester since 2008, in Cape Town, South Africa. This ISL program was developed to expose students to the critical legacy and current issues of human rights and social justice in South Africa. Approximately 150 students from the University of Connecticut (UConn) have participated in the Cape Town program over the past seven years. In addition to his or her academic classes, each UConn student participates in a three-day per week unpaid internship at a local nonprofit organization located in an impoverished township on the outskirts of Cape Town for 13 weeks. They also have the opportunity to work alongside members of the host community to plan and implement a related social activist project. Examples of past projects include developing and facilitating HIV/Aids awareness workshops for middle school students and youth mentoring programs for at-risk high school students. Program participants maintain a web-based journal with critical reflections on their experience and thoughtful answers to faculty prompts focused on how their personal experiences relate to the theme of human rights and social justice in South Africa.

A cursory review of the publically available student journals during and after the program indicated that the ISL experience appears to have been transformative in nature for many students. The UConn Cape Town program was selected for this case study because of the fact that the multi-year offerings of the same cohort-based

ISL program provides a substantial amount of historical data to be collected and analyzed. UConn's Cape Town program also appeared to provide the type of high intensity dissonance that often typifies critical service-learning programs. Since this ISL program was designed and promoted as a program that supports UConn's academic mission of global citizenship, and was intentionally designed to immerse student into service-learning experiences with high levels of socio-economic dissonance, it is considered a critical case. In addition to analyzing the historical written data, the current study proposes to collect and analyze updated qualitative data from a purposive sample of 20-30 of the program alumni to better understand the participant's perception of the long-term impact of the ISL program.

I premise that global citizenship development is an affective and cognitive learning process that involves an individual becoming more globally conscious and ethnoculturally empathetic, with an increasing willingness to take act towards social justice. Therefore, I assert if participants had actually experienced global citizenship development as a direct result of participating in the program, their perceptions of the impact would be reflected by key statements and phases in their narrative data in regards to changes in these dimensions or sub-dimensions of global citizenship.

#### **1.4 Purpose of the Study**

The overarching focus of this study is to better understand the nature and persistence of a perspective transformation indicated by notable changes in worldviews leading to global citizenship development (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, and commitment to act towards social justice) in college students who participated in a high intensity dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad. A perspective transformation is a process of challenging previously held beliefs and assumptions, representing a development shift to a new worldview (Tennant, 1993). In that this study is focused on understanding the nature and persistence over time of global citizenship development, participants who have self-reported a perspective transformation indicated by global citizenship

development are considered critical cases for further examination. Critical case sampling involves selecting a small number of important cases that are likely to “yield the most information and have the greatest impact on the development of knowledge” (Patton, 2001, p.236).

## **1.5 Research questions**

### **Research Question 1**

*What was the study participant's perception of the impact that participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad had on their global perspective and global citizenship development?*

### **Research Question 2**

*To what extent does a perspective transformation from high dissonance service-learning participation, as indicated by a participant's perception of enhanced dimensions of the global citizenship construct, persist over time and influence subsequent behaviors and actions?*

### **Research Question 3**

*To what extent does personal experience with high socio-economic cognitive dissonance serve as a ‘critical life event’ leading to a turning point or personal breakthrough in regards to the phenomenon of a perspective transformation and transformative global citizenship development?*

### **Research Question 4**

*To what extent does connecting to and building relationships with, local people with considerably less privilege from the host marginalized socio-economic community, play a role in the persistence of a perspective transformation?*



## **1.6 Organizational Overview of the Study**

Six chapters comprise the organizational structure of this thesis. Chapter 1 provides some context to the problem, identifies four research questions, explains the purpose and significance of the proposed study, and identifies the primary theoretical framework. Global citizenship development involves both formal and informal cognitive and affective learning processes. In order to gain a better understanding of how global citizenship might be learned, I premise that the literature on learning theory is central to this investigation. Chapter 2 is a literature review that looks at literature on a multitude of learning theories deemed relevant to the phenomenon, in order to provide a theoretical framework and pedagogical interpretive lens for the study. The literature review also examines some of the findings from several recent case studies on student outcomes of participating in ISL programs. Chapter 3 identifies and discusses the research methodology, research design, and the data collection and analysis methods.

Chapter 4 presents the findings from the initial data analysis of a purposive sample of students who participated in UConn's Cape Town ISL program while studying abroad and subsequently graduated from college. The findings will address whether these collective case studies help better understand the findings from earlier ISL studies in regards to the self-reported transformations in worldviews and global perspectives, and whether these transformations align with the conceptualization of transformative global citizenship development. This section also addresses findings as to whether earlier perspective transformations have or have not persisted over time. Chapter 5 further analyzes and interprets the findings presented in Chapter 4, using the literature on transformative learning and critical service-learning theory to interpret the findings and examine to what extent they inform the research problem and answer the research questions. Chapter 6 discusses the conclusions, implications and recommendations derived from the interpretive analysis process undertaken in Chapter 5, including some critical thoughts on legitimate challenges to the study. Directions for future research are also identified in this final chapter.

## **1.7 Assumptions**

I start with the general assumption that all study participants will fully understand the questions during the data collection process, and answer all questions truthfully. I also assume that the study may be biased somewhat by the self-selective nature of the program. This assumption is based on the premise that the type of altruistic individuals who are naturally drawn to service-learning programs may not be as prone to experiencing a perspective transformation towards global citizenship as others who not so inclined. Two additional assumptions about the possible nexus and persistence of perspective transformations, based on my initial understanding of learning theories such as transformative learning and critical-service learning, have been framed as propositions or working hypotheses in Chapter 3.

## **Chapter 2 Literature Review**

### **2.1 Chapter Introduction**

The purpose of the present study is to seek a better understanding of the phenomenon of a perspective transformation, as indicated by the change in their pre-program attitudes and worldviews that some student's self-reported after studying abroad. Such perspective transformations included changes in their levels of global consciousness, their levels of ethnocultural empathy and acceptance of diverse cultures, and their commitment to global social justice. The literature review starts by providing some context on the field of study abroad. The often-contested literature on global citizenship is then looked at to establish an operational definition and key indicators of global citizenship for the purpose of the study. The literature review moves on to spend considerable time examining learning theory, including service-learning, transformative learning, critical pedagogy and critical service-learning, in order to gain a better understanding of how global citizenship might actually be learned. The literature review examines and synthesizes the findings from several case studies of international service-learning (ISL) which discuss cases of self-reported perspective transformation that were noted after some of the student participants returned to campus in the United States.

### **2.2 Study Abroad**

Study abroad is a program in which college students participate in academic courses in a location outside the geographical boundaries of their own country. Once considered a niche program area, these types of programs have experienced increasing levels of interest since the mid 1980's, as "educators throughout the world have tried to help students develop their global awareness by building international bridges of understanding through the promotion of study abroad" (Luttermann-Aguilar & Gingerich, 2002, p.2 ). This is especially true in the U.S., where universities are increasingly "under pressure to prepare global-ready graduates or global citizens" (Root & Ngampornchai, 2012, p.2 ). Data statistics from UNESCO estimated that approximately 2 million students worldwide studied abroad by 2000

(Altbach & Teichler, 2001 in Lutterman-Aguilar, pg. 41 ). Participation in study abroad by American college undergraduates has also continued to increase steadily since the turn of the century. The Open Doors Report, an annual publication from the Institute of International Education (IIE), is considered to be the “most comprehensive report on U.S. students who study abroad” (Golay, 2006, p.17). The most recent Open Doors Report indicated that the number of Americans studying abroad for credit has shown consistent impressive growth over the last 20 years, from 85,000 in 1994/95 to 130,000 in 1998/1999 and to 289,408 in 2013/14 (Institute for International Education, 2014). The Open Doors Report also noted that there is still room for substantial growth, with less than 10% of U.S. college students who study abroad during the course of their undergraduate studies.

Study abroad programs typically involve having students take college courses while overseas for a semester, year, or short course, with course credits transferred back to their home institution. In some cases, these programs are taught overseas by faculty from the home college, while in other instances, students may attend another college based in the host study abroad country. American students who study abroad are mostly white (86%) and female (66%) undergraduates in their junior year (36%). Numerous efforts have been made to diversify and attract minority students to study abroad programs in the recent past with mixed results. Colleges in the U.S. recognize the value of their students becoming inter-culturally competent and globally aware in our increasingly flattened world (Friedman, 2005), and most regard the growing study abroad participation as concrete evidence of their success in developing global citizens. Motivations for students to participate vary, as some students undertake study abroad to enhance their career readiness and their value in the global marketplace (language acquisition and global competence), while others look to better understand cultures that are different than their own (cultural awareness). A small percentage of American students studying abroad choose non-traditional locations in the Southern Hemisphere, exploring issues such as sustainable development, human rights, or socio-economic injustice, while participating in local community service-learning projects.

. The IIE's Open Doors Report maintains an extensive database on geographic preferences for American students studying abroad. Western Europe has always been the favorite destination for American students, and the UK tops the list as the most popular host country. However, the Open Doors data indicates that the recent UK and European market share for hosting U.S. students is trending down (Europe from 63% in 1998 to 53% in 2013, and the UK from 21% to 13%). Much of this shift is due to the new interest in China, which went from 1% to 5% over the same time period, now ranking fifth among host countries. The data also indicates that U.S. students studying abroad in Latin America and the Caribbean more than doubled over this time period, and that five times as many students now choose to study in Southeast Asia. The numbers to sub-Saharan Africa have seen significant increases, mostly driven by large increases in study abroad to South Africa (Education, 2010).

### **2.2.1 Student Development Benefits from Study Abroad**

Some evidence exists in the literature to support the contention that U.S. students benefit from their study abroad experience. In 2000, researchers at the University of Georgia undertook an extensive research study of the 35-institution system, in order to compare student academic and affective outcomes for a study group of about 19,000 students who studied abroad to 17,000 students who did not participate in study abroad (the control group). The findings indicated that the study abroad participants scored higher in their knowledge of cultural practices and context (intercultural awareness) when compared to the group of students who did not study abroad over the 10 year time period of the study (Redden, 2010). In another study of 232 American college students studying abroad in various countries in Western Europe, the findings demonstrated that study abroad programs significantly contribute to the preparation of students to function in a multicultural world and promote international understanding (Kitsantas, 2004). Several other studies have reported similar findings of enhanced global perspectives and intercultural competence from the study abroad experience (Luttermann-Aguilar & Gingerich, 2002; McCabe, 1994).

### **2.2.2 Critique of Study Abroad**

One of the frequent criticisms of study abroad is that not everyone can take advantage of this experience as the high cost of overseas travel precludes many college students from participating, which may give students from wealthier families an unfair advantage for jobs in a globalized society after graduation. However, while study abroad opportunities were indeed once seen as a privilege reserved for the upper economic and social class (Levy, 2000), these programs have become increasingly populated by students from a middle income upbringing (IIE, 2009). Still, even today most study abroad students come from mostly white, middle to upper class families. The rising cost of college was cited as the most frequent reason (89%) by those students choosing not to study abroad and almost 90% of American undergraduate students do not participate in study abroad (IIE, 2009). This reality may not change unless the federal government can put more resources into supporting study abroad. This does not appear likely in the near future, as recent federal legislation to increase access and support for non-traditional students has been stalled in Congress for several years (Durbin, 2007).

Many inside academia also question the purported efficacy of study abroad programs to develop global citizens when many U.S. college students spend a semester in places like Paris, Florence, or London, hanging out with fellow Americans in local bars and retail shops, rather than immersing themselves with locals to get a deeper understanding of the host population (Golay, 2006; Kauffmann, 1992, Rizvi, 2003). Study abroad is supposed to provide some of the “richest and most powerful forms of experiential learning” (Golay, 2006, p.21) and that is not always the case. Kauffmann and her colleagues (1992) question whether they are just taking their classes in a different location that may not be very different from life at their home institution. “There are countless students who study abroad without immersing themselves in the local culture or developing an appreciation for lifestyles different than their own” (Kaufmann, Martin, & Weaver, 1992, p. 3). Rizvi (2003) also noted that some study abroad experiences may be as little more than educational voyeurism or cultural tourism, and faults current study abroad practices

for failing to foster moral imagination and civic responsibility. Research on 'education for cosmopolitanism' by Gunesch (2004), also labelled as cosmopolitan learning (Rizvi, 2009), made a similar distinction between levels of cosmopolitanism - "advanced tourists, transnational cosmopolitans and interactive cosmopolitans" (p.253), with the later stage representative of the critical dimensions of global-minded (Hett,1993) citizens.

The ill-fated Simon Act mentioned earlier was intended to address these concerns by providing financial assistance to support study abroad immersion programs in lesser known destinations in the Southern Hemisphere, such as such as Peru, Chile, South Korea, and South Africa (Durbin, 2007). Research by Root & Ngampornchai (2012) demonstrated that while most students seem to be positively impacted by study abroad, these self-reports may "reflect only superficial levels of intercultural understanding", with most students in their study "unable to articulate a deep understanding of the meaning of culture or demonstrate an awareness of cross-cultural differences" (p.12), leading the authors to be skeptical of whether these participants really became more interculturally competent from the experience. This seems to indicate that not all study abroad is equal, as programs differ in their pedagogical approach to experiential activities, cultural immersion and amount of time devoted to critical reflection and introspection. This distinction between a 'low road' study abroad program, in which contact and thoughtful dialogue with locals is minimal (Hovey & Weinburg, 2009), and a study abroad program that fosters an immersive and reflective cultural engagement, referred to as a 'high road' program, makes assessing student outcomes an increasingly nuanced process. The later type program (high road) seems more apt to have an impact on intercultural competence, and program elements such as student motivation, program location, program duration, participant preparation, and the nature of pedagogical support for experiential or informal learning may play a role in the efficacy of these programs to support enhanced intercultural competence and a widening of each participant's global perspective. Recent trends in study abroad include the integration of service-learning elements into the study abroad experience in order to provide real world

experiential learning and local community engagement for participants to foster critical thinking about issues such as sustainable development, human rights and social justice within our interdependent global society.

### **2.3 Global Citizenship in U.S. Higher Education**

Over the past decade, many universities across the U.S. have called for their students to become global citizens, often-funding programs, centers, and institutes around this topic area. Zemach-Bersin recalls how “encouraged by the federal government, institutions of higher education are endorsing study abroad under the falsely depoliticized rhetoric of producing global citizens” (2007, p.17), noting how the “U.S. State Department Education Week 2007 was dedicated to fostering global citizenship (U.S. State Department & Department of Education, 2007, in Zemach-Bersin, p.19). In support of their member schools, The Association of American Colleges and Universities sponsors programs for preparing global citizens, which address the need to develop personally and socially responsible students, while fostering global education and acceptance of diversity. Yet none of these programs appear to offer any discernable method of measuring the attainment of this lofty and often elusive goal, which may be because the meaning of global citizenship is ambiguous and often contested in the literature. It is difficult to determine the impact of these programs on student global citizenship development without an operational definition of this concept (Zemach-Bersin).

The literature that surrounds global citizenship remains highly contested. Martha Nussbaum (1997) is an advocate for the concept global citizenship, especially as it related to a commitment to empathy, diversity and a socially just global society. Muetzelfeldt and Smith (2002) interpret global citizenship to represent the ability of “civil society to extend beyond a country’s boundaries” with “shared values and mutual respect” ( p.61). Researchers such as Bowden (2003) and Featherstone (2002), however, regard global citizenship as a sense of statelessness, with global citizens as nomads or privileged elite who do not seem to have any



personal responsibility to their home country. Bowden asserts that the concept of global citizenship is “not only problematic but also undesirable” (pg. 349) due to its incongruity with the “the general theory and ideals of citizenship” (p. 350).

Cosmopolitanism, a term originating from ancient Greece (Schattle, 2009), is often construed to be synonymous with global citizenship, and as such may be adding more confusion than clarity in defining global citizenship. Nussbaum (1997) is a strong advocate for cosmopolitanism, regarding cosmopolitans as ‘citizens of the world’ who consider issues of global humanity to have precedence over those within their own country. While Nussbaum and other scholars (Furia, 2005; Germann Molz, 2005) interpret cosmopolitanism as rooted in altruism, empathy, social justice and social responsibility, others (Bowen, 2003; Matthews & Sidhu, 2005) allude to a possible negative aspects of this term, with cosmopolitanism representing an elite Western, cultural imperialist perspective of the world.

Arneil (2007), as well as Muetzelfeldt and Smith (2002), theorize that global citizenship involved the ‘social rights and shared fate’ of all people in global society. Parekh (2003) asserts that instead of global citizens, what the world needs is ‘globally-oriented national citizenship’. Similar in nature to the concept of a globally-oriented national citizen, Bowden and others (Appiah-Padi, 2001; Hett, 1993) advocate for the term globally-minded citizens, or global mindedness, as this concept suggests global citizens have an acute understanding of the interconnectedness of common humanity, and how their own actions and those of their country can impact other parts of the world. The contested definitions of global citizenship and the related term of cosmopolitanism create confusion over how to identify a pedagogical strategy to ‘teach’ college students to become global citizens. In order to evaluate whether study abroad programs are effective at producing global citizens, the term global citizenship needs to be operationally defined to reflect the desired outcomes. It is fair to assume that the global citizenship definition in the mission statements of U.S. colleges, as is Nussbaum’s conceptual framework of cosmopolitanism, appears to align with the conceptual framework of global-

mindedness (Hett; Bowden; Appiah-Padi) or globally oriented national citizenship (Parekh).

For example, UConn's academic plan (University of Connecticut, 2012) touts its institutional goal of "producing global citizens with multicultural awareness and respect" and based on an inclusive society, encourages students to "further their intercultural understanding and recognition of the transnational nature of the challenges and opportunities we face"(UConn, p.11). Further in the document, students are encouraged to "embrace diversity—as a commitment to fostering a welcoming environment in which all individuals can achieve their fullest potential (pg. 11). UConn students should "celebrate human difference while addressing harmful inequality and disparities, achieving rights and justice, addressing these challenges at home and abroad is central to our land grant mission" (pg. 25). UConn's definition of a global citizen appears to be aligned with Shultz's (2007) perspective that

"The global citizen understands his or her role in building relationships through embracing diversity and finding a shared purpose across national boundaries. Seeks to include and engage others in a sense of shared common humanity. Building understanding of common humanity and shared concerns – the global citizen is a companion, accompanying the other on a journey to find just and compassionate responses to injustice" (p.256).

This mirrors the study operational definition of a global citizen that is transformative in nature, as advanced by Oxfam (1997, Davies, 2006, p.206). I assert that such a transformative global citizen

1. Is cognizant and self-aware of his or her place within an economically, socially, politically, and environmentally interdependent global society. This includes accepting their rights, privileges, obligations and responsibilities as a 'citizen of the world' as part of a common humanity (global consciousness)

3. Accepts, respects and values diversity and has empathy for cultures, ethnicities and religions that are different from their own (ethnocultural empathy)
4. Is committed to social justice both at the local and global level, and takes action to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place (commitment to local and global social justice activism)

The question of how the study abroad experience actually develops transformative global citizenship remains somewhat elusive in the literature. Many scholars of service-learning have asserted that this pedagogy fosters personal empathy, social responsibility and a commitment to social activism, and cases of study abroad integrating service-learning have emerged in the literature over the past decade. Global citizenship development appears to be transformative in nature, and service-learning and other pedagogies, such as transformative learning and critical pedagogy, may help better explain a relationship between study abroad and global citizenship development.

## **2.4 Philosophical Roots of Service-Learning in the U.S.**

College service-learning programs and academic courses have enjoyed a steady increase in enrollment in the U.S. over the past two decades. By integrating classroom-based academic studies with community service, students have the opportunity to reflect on what the service meant to them in journals and capstone papers, linking classroom theory to real world practicality. It is noteworthy that interest in service-learning began to take hold during the same time period as study abroad (mid 1980's). "Service-learning and study abroad courses have developed primarily along parallel tracks" (Parker & Dautoff, 2007, p.41) over the past 25 years. Service-learning is "aligned with many of the foundational tenants of experiential learning" (Hatcher, 1997, p. 22), which have intellectual roots from the works of educational philosopher John Dewey. Dewey's seminal work on experiential education (Dewey, 1916; 1922; 1933; 1938) with a focus on integrating learning with real life experience and critical reflection, was a substantial influence on other progressive educators such as David Kolb (1976) and experiential education is often

seen as the theoretical underpinning for service-learning (Bringle & Hatcher, 1996; Giles & Eyler, 1994). Dewey's educational philosophy included learning for a social purpose, such as an engaged citizenry or social responsibility (Hatcher, 1997), and focused on improving the social condition of the learner and their community. Dewey often advocated for the moral responsibilities of education (Hatcher, pg.22), faulting schools for not improving the social injustices in society (Giles & Eyler, 1994).

Dewey felt that experience helps students better understand the practical application for solving community problems and "considered knowledge as a tool for creating a just society" (Hatcher, 1997, pg. 24), sensing an "organic connection between education and personal experience" (Dewey, 1938, p. 59). Proponents of service-learning believe strongly in its efficacy. "Service transforms learning, changing inert knowledge to knowledge that students can use in their community" (Giles & Eyler, 1994, pg. 5). It is an active area for scholarship, and research indicates positive affective learning and moral development outcomes from service-learning, including acceptance of diversity and intercultural understanding (Keen & Keen, 1998, Eyler & Giles, 1999). With regards to global citizenship development, international service-learning (ISL) theory moves beyond traditional service-learning theory as it incorporates several important elements of the study abroad experience. First, it allows participants to engage with different cultures across the globe, which provides rich opportunities for intercultural understanding and ethnocultural empathy. It also provides a venue to foster global consciousness, as participants are able to place themselves and their country in a broader interdependent global context. Finally, the cross-border cultural shock experienced while service-learning in a developing country can create a high dissonance environment.

#### **2.4.1 Assessing the Efficacy of Service-Learning**

Validating affective development can be difficult, and some question the persistence of such character building lessons learned over time. While student development outcomes may be empirically significant, the outcomes may not be that

impactful as they first appear. For example, a service-learning research study (Eyler & Giles, 1997) analyzed secondary data (pre and post surveys) on 1,500 students representing 20 different colleges. The study group of 1,100 students, and a control of 400 students, indicated that participation in service-learning has a small but significant positive effect on overall student values, sense of social responsibility, acceptance of diversity, and commitment to social justice and greater community involvement. “For these students, service-learning made a difference but this impact does not appear transformative in nature” (p. 2).

#### **2.4.2 Service-Learning while Study abroad (International Service-Learning)**

Over the past decade, numerous American college study abroad programs have begun to integrate service-learning programs within their study abroad program portfolio, with many of these programs taking place in developing countries. Participants in these programs opt for a more consciousness-raising experience, travelling to lesser-known parts of the developing world. While historically, study abroad programs sponsored by U.S. colleges have overwhelmingly occurred in Western Europe, study abroad programs with a significant service-learning component have a keen focus on the North-South divide and usually takes place somewhere in the developing world. These programs are often referred to as international service-learning (ISL) programs. There is growing evidence in the literature that the number of international study abroad courses with an service-learning component (Annette, 2002) have reported findings of students returning to campus with self-reported changes in their previously held beliefs, value systems and worldviews (Doerr, 2011; Gaines-Hanks & Grayman, 2009; Kiely, 2002, 2004, 2005; Monard-Weissman, 2003; Parker & Dautoff, 2007; Pisano, 2007). Service-learning while studying abroad provides the students with multi-faceted opportunities to turn abstract class content on social justice and human rights into real life lessons learned, as they live with local families, intern at local organizations, visit factories and meet with civil society organizations.

## 2.5 Theory of Transformational Learning

Jack Mezirow's seminal work on transformative learning (1978, 1991, 2000, 2006), which was influenced by the work of several educational philosophers, including Paolo Freire's (1970) work on critical pedagogy and Jürgen Habermas's (1971) theory on emancipatory learning, has been cited by over 150 dissertations (Mezirow, 2006). Transformative learning is a multi-phase process through which preconceived notions, beliefs, worldviews and perspectives on life are reconsidered and reconstituted.

The transformative learning process can enhance a participant's understanding of and sensitivity to the way others anticipate, perceive, think, feel while involved with the learner in common endeavors -- to develop empathy, and to develop confidence and competence in such aspects of human relations as resolving conflict. (1981, p.18)

While Mezirow's initial framework had as many as ten stages, the foundation of the model involves the internalization of deep reflection and critical discourse over cognitive dissonance (Festinger, 1957) from a critical event or a defining moment, which Mezirow labelled a 'disoriented dilemma'. According to Mezirow, a disorienting dilemma represents an experience that does not fit, causing a deep disconnect between someone's meaning perspective (previously held beliefs and structure of assumptions about the meaning of life) and their environment. The transformational learning process includes self-examination and internalization around the resulting incongruence, which can result in an epiphany or what some refer to as an 'ah ha' moment. Disorienting dilemmas are considered trigger events for transformational learning to occur, as Mezirow believed that without this challenge to our existing meaning structures, transformational learning would not take place. Noting the importance of reflection in learning espoused by experiential educators such as Dewey and Kolb, Mezirow's theoretical framework considered critical reflection of an individual's meaning perspectives essential to the transformational learning process (1990). In order to make sense of an experience,

individuals need to interpret it. "Reflection enables learners to correct distortions in our beliefs and errors in problem solving ....and involves a critique of our presuppositions on which our beliefs have been built" (pg.1). Mezirow and other proponents of transformational learning such as Brookfield (2000), Cranton (2006), and Taylor (1998) stressed the importance of engaging others in dialogue and critical discourse to fully discuss, debate, and resolve the cognitive dissonance triggered by the disorienting dilemma, using others to help us break from our frameworks of interpretation. Mezirow's transformative learning process involves a perspective transformation, or development shift, to a new worldview (Tenant, 1993). Mezirow defined the process of a perspective transformation as

"becoming critically aware of how and why our presuppositions have come to constrain the way we perceive, understand and feel about our world; of reformulating these assumptions to permit a more inclusive, discriminating, permeable and integrative perspective; and of making decisions or otherwise acting on these new understandings" (1991, p.14).

Mezirow also believed those who are truly transformed by an experience need to demonstrate their intention to act on their new perspective (Taylor, 1997). This aligned with Dewey's own educational philosophy that community engagement and solving social problems was foundational to experiential education. While transformational learning is experiential, experiential learning is not in itself transformative without the deep cognitive dissonance presented by Mezirow's disorienting dilemma. Mezirow believed that action was integral to perspective transformations, as there is no point in transformation if nothing occurs out of it. While Mezirow and other advocates of transformational learning note the key elements that are involved in transformational learning, it has rarely been operationalized in the literature. For example, while affective learning outcomes such as personal/social responsibility and empathy have been noted from student participation in service-learning programs in the U.S., and outcomes such as an enhanced global understanding have been reported from participation in traditional study abroad, scant evidence exists that deep perspective transformations are

commonplace as student development outcomes in either of these programs for most participants. However, several recent small-scale studies of ISL programs indicate that some participants have experienced a notable perspective transformation indicated by enhanced levels of ethnocultural empathy, global consciousness and an intention to act to address social injustice (Doerr, 2011; Gaines-Hanks & Grayman, 2009; Kiely, 2002, 2004, 2005; Monard-Weissman, 2003; Parker & Dautoff, 2007; Pisano, 2007). In essence, they may have become global citizens as an outcome of their service-learning while studying abroad, at least for the short-term. The question of whether this impact persists over time is somewhat elusive and remains mostly unanswered. A study that examines the long-term impact outcome from participation in critical service-learning while studying abroad would advance this existing research by ascertaining whether the global citizenship developed persisted over time.

## **2.6 Connecting the Dots: Linking study abroad to global citizenship development through theories of intercultural competence, cross cultural adaption and critical service-learning**

Global citizenship involves several dimensions of intercultural competence, including having an enhanced worldview or global perspective. The literature on intercultural competence may be useful to provide a bridge to link global citizenship development to a transformative learning process. A growing number of scholars have attempted to bridge theories of transformational learning to cross-cultural adaption and the development of intercultural competence, positing that the “theory of perspective transformation provides a model of the learning process of intercultural competency” (Taylor, 1994, p.. 394). The work of Taylor (1994) is helpful as he has conducted extensive literature reviews of both theories. The common element of both transformative learning and intercultural competence is a ‘jolt’ or ‘critical event’ that triggers cognitive dissonance and deep introspection. Intercultural competence is related to cross-cultural adaption, and some researchers have found that cultural shock (Adler, 1975) is a trigger to cross-cultural adaption.



The processing of cultural shock is similar to the processing of a disorienting dilemma, resulting in a perspective transformation “similar in nature to the models of intercultural competency” (Taylor, p.399), as it refers to how the learners develop “more inclusive, discriminating and integrative perspective” (Mezirow, 1991, p.167). Adler (1975) discusses similar outcomes as “successful cross-cultural experience should result in the movement of personality and identity to a new consciousness of values, attitudes, and understandings” (p.15). Taylor asserts that the theory of perspective transformation partially explained the learning process of becoming interculturally competent. Intercultural competency is also referred to as intercultural transformation (Kim & Ruben, 1988). Intercultural transformation reflects the gradual transformation of an individual’s experience as they cognitively, affectively and behaviorally process deep cultural shock and transcend from their own cultural identity to “achieve a higher state of cultural awareness” (Kim & Ruben, in Taylor, 1994, p. 291). A disorienting dilemma is a precondition to transformational learning, just as cultural shock, is a pre-condition to intercultural transformation. Cultural shock is the catalyst for change or transformation, as substantiated in numerous studies on intercultural transformation studies (Adler, 1975; Bennett, 1986; Kim & Ruben, 1988; Yoshikawa, 1987).

Taylor, however, questions the lack of mention about the need for critical reflection in the literature on intercultural transformation. Research on this concept does not explain how students move from cultural shock to attaining a wider global perspective without examining the validity of their existing meaning perspective. Taylor agrees with Mezirow and other scholars of transformative learning that critical reflection is integral to a perspective transformation leading to a broadened worldview, as learners “must question their validity through critical reflection” (Taylor, 1994, p. 402). He faults the researchers of intercultural transformation for not providing insight into the process of how learners become interculturally transformed and interculturally competent. Taylor also has an issue with the fact that research on intercultural transformation does not address issues such as the impact of an individual’s unique background, or their motivations or readiness for change.

### **2.6.1 Critical Service-Learning as a possible Pedagogy for the Privileged**

The work of Mezirow and Freire, when used as the conceptual framework for the emerging scholarship on critical service-learning, may help provide a better understanding of why some students participating in ISL study abroad programs self-report a transformation as indicated by an expanded worldview and globalized identity upon their return back to campus in America. Global citizenship development, as defined for the purpose of this study, includes a social justice orientation and critical consciousness or ‘conscientization’ (Freire, 1970), evidenced by an enhanced sense of ethnocultural empathy along with an intention to take action to address social injustice. Critical service-learning theory (Crabtree, 2008; Doerr, 2011; Ginwright & Cammarota, 2002; Mitchell, 2008; Rosenberger, 2000) blends a service-learning approach with elements from both Freire’s (1970) critical pedagogy and Mezirow’s conceptual framework for transformative learning that can transform students into engaged and active citizens. “Critical service-learning is rooted in a basis of education for social justice” (Doerr, 2011, p. 770) and involves a transformational experience in which students involved in service-learning experience deep personal conflict “through confronting the complexity of the issue at hand” (p. 770). The issue at hand would be directly related to a real world issue involving social injustice or social inequality, often involving the consideration of the “have and have not’s – and power and privilege” in order to “link service-learning to social justice education” (Mitchell, 2007, p. 101).

Doerr’s study involved a service-learning program in Guatemala in 2010 for nine college students, which focused on sustainable development. The program was intentionally designed in advance to include program elements intended to raise the critical consciousness (Freire, 1970) of the participants in regards to the structural socio-economic inequality of global society. The program location in Guatemala was selected for its example of an important value system. Doerr and others, such as Mitchell (2007) and Morton and Campbell (2007), assert that cognitive dissonance is integral to critical service-learning, just as it is for transformative learning and intercultural competency. While recognizing that dissonance can be incidental or intentional, Doer asserts that that critical service-learning programs should

intentionally design cognitive dissonance as part of the program in order to “push students out of their comfort zones to confront challenging issues” ( p.76). Morton and Campbell regard cognitive dissonance as an opportunity for the program facilitators “to engage the service-learner in the process of transformation” (p.12), which aligns with Mezirow’s concept of the role of a disorienting dilemma in fostering a perspective transformation.

As with transformative learning, critical reflection and discourse are integral to designing programs with a critical service-learning pedagogy, in order to provide “a mechanism for controlled dissonance through the presentation of challenging questions” and mediate the dissonance “ through dialogue and reflection” (Mitchell, p.76). Critical reflection plays an essential role in critical service -learning, serving to “balance cognitive dissonance so that it becomes a motivating perplexity, rather than an emotional or psychological threat that results in withdrawal” (Morton and Campbell, p.13). Intensive engagement to foster authentic relationships with locals and discuss the root causes of the issues of social injustice addressed by the service-learning is also an important aspect of making sense of the cognitive dissonance (Pompa, 2002). This context is important for participants to “understand intellectually the broad social dynamics” (Levinson, 1990, p.69). Schulz (2007) believes that “social justice cannot activate itself ....it takes a concerted effort of independent stakeholders, community members, students, and instructors to transform social justice theory into service-learning practice” (pg. 34). The literature of critical service-learning supports the contention that mutually beneficial and reciprocal relationships with the local community help foster ethnocultural empathy and a sense of shared fate and responsibility for common humanity (Mitchell, 2008; Schulz, 2007; Doerr, 2011; Crabtree, 2008).

The literature on critical service-learning indicates that many scholars believe that the integration of social justice education within the formal and informal aspects of the service-learning experience underpins the intention to become social change

agents (Marullo, 1999; Mitchell, 2007; Pompa, 2002; Ginwright & Cammarota, 2002; Wang and Rodgers, 2006) as well as Rhoads (1998). Marullo (1999) cited the “revolutionary potential” of this approach, as “service-learning provides an opportunity for institutionalizing on college campuses activism committed to social justice” (p. 22). This reinforces the earlier themes from Dewey (experiential education) to Mezirow (transformative learning) and Nussbaum (cosmopolitan learning) of education for a social purpose. Other scholars of critical service-learning (Boyle-Baise & Langford, 2004; Crabtree, 2008) note the importance of moving students from a typical service or charity perspective towards a more globally aware, social justice orientation. Wade (2000) understood that while the practice of service-learning in which service is provided to individuals, is easier to implement, “service for an ideal is more compelling because of its potential power to effect more people” (p. 98). Mitchell questioned the value of traditional service-learning, and stated that unless power is redistributed among the host organizations and the students, in order to allow authentic reciprocal and mutually beneficial relationships to occur, service-learning may not be very effective. Mitchell also believed that the community service projects and related course content needed to be processed and internalized through a social change perspective.

Pompa (2002) felt that critical service-learning can help students to become “conscientious of and able to critique social systems....motivating participants to analyze what they experience, while inspiring them to take action and make change” (p. 62). Processing critical service-learning experiences have both cognitive and affective learning benefits, requiring that students think critically to process and resolve incongruences. Wang and Rodgers (2006) assert that using a “social justice approach to service-learning will lead to more complex thinking and reasoning skills than traditional service-learning”. Action or intention to act for a social purpose after critical reflection and discourse over cognitive dissonance may be what really makes critical service-learning both an extremely challenging and rewarding experience for the students. It is the deep-seated dissonance that “inspires that desire for action” (Doerr, p. 87). Freire labels the movement from reflective contemplation to action as

‘praxis’, and the process of praxis helps the social justice mindset persist and serve as “an entry point to social justice and advocacy” (Doerr, p.87). Marullo (1999) agrees, pointing out that the use of critical service learning approaches can facilitate the development of future social activists.

Critical service-learning approaches are not for the faint hearted, as ensuring the participants are ready and able to intellectually experience and process real world social injustice for positive cognitive and affective development can present significant challenges. Rhoads (1998) believes that the academic content of the service-learning course needs to allow students to question pertinent issues, such as why gender, cultural or racial economic inequities in society persist. Inquiry-based approaches using problem-posing support the process of ‘conscientization’ (Freire), as learners need the opportunity to problem-pose if they are to become critically conscious and reconsider their prior assumptions and beliefs (Rosenberger). Mitchell (2007) sees critical service-learning as fostering social change mindsets by “questioning of the distribution of power in society” (pg. 101). The moment of transformation takes place when students “gain a greater understanding of their privilege” (p.105) in order to “be motivated to change”. Consciousness-raising to a more critical consciousness is made possible primarily through each student’s self-examination of their relative power and privileged status in global society (Rosenberger) as they explore “the interplay of power, privilege, and oppression” (Mitchell, 2008, p.62). This focus on privilege aligns critical service-learning with another theory around transformational education labelled as ‘pedagogy for the privileged’ (Curry-Stevens, 2007; Goodman, 2001). This emerging learning theory involves critical reflection around power and privilege based on consciousness-raising as it relates to diversity, human rights and social justice, which is also analogous to the work on education for the oppressed as authored by Freire (1970). The efficacy of this approach may depend on the ability for the students and locals to engage in a mutual and reciprocal two-way critical learning process, as “change has to occur on both ends” (Curry-Stevens, p. 38).

### 2.6.2 Potential Challenges in Critical Service-Learning

It is evident that program facilitators need to exercise caution to make sure the critical service-learning experiences are not counterproductive to the desired student and host community outcomes. This is especially true when the service-learning project takes place in locations with deep-rooted socio-economic issues such as extreme poverty and inadequate healthcare. For example, if student participants flout their personal items (iPhone, iPad, etc.) and designer clothes, local students may be enamored by, or resentful of the material possessions that the American students take for granted (Crabtree, 2008). Butin (2010) expresses his concern that a well-intended service-learning program that is not designed with intentional critical approach has the potential to actually perpetuate inequalities. Care must be taken to assure that programs are not designed with the perspective of an imperialized Western society solution (Pompa, 2002) and do not serve to “perpetuate a paternalistic attitude among students and faculty” (Rosenberger, p. 24). Crabtree warns that local communities can be disempowered “if community gets the idea that only outside help can solve the problems” (p.19). Offering pre-departure orientations for students, and including leaders from the host communities in the program design, are examples of how program facilitators can take steps to ensure programs do not perpetuate social inequalities (Crabtree, 2008).

Gruenewald and Smith (2008) discuss the need to combine critical and place-based pedagogies, stating that the “structure of critical service-learning must take place in an environment through the establishment of reciprocal and mutual relationships with the community partner” (80). Another potential problem is that critical service-learning may have too much of a focus on the surface-level service rather than a keen focus on the root causes of the social inequalities. Ivan Illich’s (1968 ) presentation at the Conference on Inter-American Student Projects entitled *To Hell with Good Intentions* illustrated the concern that some well-intended volunteer work does more harm than good, as he makes a case for ending volunteer programs that bring people from the U.S. to ‘help’ people in poverty stricken countries. It is evident that implementing critical service-learning programs abroad

presents opportunities for both risks and rewards. As Mitchell (2008) cautioned, “without the exercise of care and consciousness, drawing attention to root causes of social problems and involving students in actions and initiatives involving root causes, service-learning may have no impact beyond student good feelings” (p.52).

### **2.6.3 Related Theories: Critical Global Citizenship and Transformative Citizenship Education**

The conceptual framework of critical service-learning appears to represent a possible practical model of a new pedagogy for transformation, what Lapayese (2003) called critical global citizenship education, which involves “critical thinking, meaningful experiences, and radical activism”, in order to provide a better “understanding of power relations and power structures” (p. 501). Banks (2008) introduced a similar concept he called transformative citizenship education to promote an understanding of how multi-layered identities are interrelated and constructed, premising that the “purpose of transformative knowledge is to improve the human condition” (p.135). Banks saw the concept of transformative citizenship education as well aligned with both critical global citizenship education, as well as what Delanty (2006) labels ‘critical cosmopolitanism’. Banks’ conceptual framework of transformative citizenship education is underpinned by the concept of social justice, which aligned with critical service-learning. “Transformative citizens take action to promote social justice, even when their actions violate, challenge, or dismantle existing laws, conventions, or structures” (Banks, 2008, p.136).

### **2.6.4 Evidence of Perspective Transformations from High Dissonance ISL Program Participation**

Findings from several case studies of ISL programs appear to substantiate the claim that these types of programs may be transformative in nature. For example, Monard-Weissman’s (2003) case study involved five female American college students participating in a summer ISL program in Guayaquil, Ecuador. Each

student was placed at a different agency for 20 hours per week for one or two months, while taking a course called *Institutions and Society* that had a focus on poverty and social/economic inequity. The program features several key elements of transformational learning. The students experienced firsthand poverty in the local communities where their service-learning projects were located. They also were able to critically reflect in daily journals, and the program facilitators held regular group meetings to discuss new meanings from the experience, including the opportunity to question the root causes of many of the social inequities they had experienced. The findings indicated enhanced empathy, commitment to social responsibility and intent to take action to contribute to greater global social justice. The study outcomes indicate that most if not all of the participants, after being immersed with community members of an impoverished community, experienced socio-economic dissonance. After spending considerable time critically reflecting on and discussing their unsettling experience, students reported that their worldviews had been transformed and they committed to act in order to address social injustice in the future.

In a similar case study (Gaines-Hanks & Grayman, 2009) of 12 undergraduate students (11 female, 1 male) who had participated in an international program in 2006 in South Africa, the authors were exploring how students explained their personal transformations from service-learning in an international context. Students were assigned to one of three project sites at organizations in townships located in the Pretoria region for three weeks, working 20-40 hours in total. Participants took one of two service-learning courses: either *Experiential Education/Learning* or *International Etiquette and Protocol*, based on their personal and academic interest as well as a course entitled *The History of South Africa*. Students in the first class worked 40 hours at their service-learning placement, and kept a weekly reflection journal, which included critical examinations of their service experience, which was debriefed in a weekly seminar. The study authors reported findings of “examples of conscientization/ perspective transformation in over half of the student’s reflections on their international service-learning placement experiences” (p.80). Study findings indicated that all participants reported that the



experience abroad had changed them, and most students felt they had been “considerably changed” (p. 9).

Pisano’s case study (2007) involved eight undergraduate students (6 female, 2 male) participating in a semester long program in Quito, Ecuador, hosted in the Fall of 2006. The purpose of this study was to “determine how students are affected by their participation in an international service-learning study abroad program and identify if certain variables impacted this transformative experience” (p.6). Students took a course entitled *Development, Organization and Volunteerism* that explored the meaning of volunteerism and its impact on international development. They self-reported outcomes in journals, and post-program questionnaires indicated significant positive outcomes in cultural adaption and moral development. All students were found to have their prior levels of intercultural awareness enhanced, with six stating it was greatly enhanced, as was their appreciation of Ecuadorian people. The majority of the students did report that their value system had changed through the experience, as they recalled dealing with socio-economic dissonance related to their relative wealth as opposed to the locals. Fifty percent of the students reported being transformed, as indicated by a broadened worldview and enhanced empathy. Pisano concluded that the experience might have been transformative in nature for some students. Since the findings did not provide evidence of a commitment or intention to act to address social inequalities, it remains questionable as to whether or not this represents a true perspective transformation.

In another case study by Kiely (2005), 22 undergraduate students (19 female, 3 male) enrolled in a semester long ISL project in Nicaragua and were immersed in an unfamiliar cultural milieu with daily contact with human suffering. Their service-learning program included performing research and health assessments in remote, impoverished areas where there was little if any access to healthcare. The program was designed to allow participants the space to question structural socio-economic inequities in society that affect the health and welfare of Nicaraguans. The study

found that all participants seemed to experience a radical change in their worldviews. This included developing the “ability to set up meaningful relationships and have made a strong personal connection by having interactions with people who are suffering” (p.306). The personalization of this deep socio-economic dissonance led participants to “reevaluate their identities –from perspective of Nicaraguan’s” and see “themselves for what they were really were” (p.306). As the participants struggled to reconcile and make sense of the unfair nature of extreme poverty, they “began to think of ways to translate their emerging global consciousness into a plan of action” (p. 312). While all cases appear to meet the standard of a ‘high road’ (Hovey & Weinburg, 2009) study abroad program, distinctions can be made on the degree of social justice orientation each program offered. Kiely’s and Monard-Weissman’s cases integrated courses with academic content and objectives that had a clear focus on structural social justice issues that are the root causes of poverty and social inequities that impact the health and welfare of the local population. This deep social justice orientation of the academic course may have provided a better forum to process the service-learning than courses on *International Etiquette and Protocols* (Gaines-Hanks) or *Development, Organization and Volunteerism* (Pisano). Both Kiely’s semester long case study and Monard-Weissman’s summer case study also appeared to have a stronger emphasis on exposing the participants an up close and personal view of issues such as extreme poverty and/or inadequate healthcare, as socio-economic injustice was continually integrated into the service-learning experience to focus and reinforce the student development outcomes.

The literature indicates that participants in study abroad programs designed with a critical service-learning component often report various levels of enhanced ethnocultural empathy, personal/ social responsibility and an emerging global consciousness. This seems to lend support to the connection that critical service-learning programs may be useful at developing transformative global citizenship. Kiely found that the participants appeared to have developed the “ability to set up meaningful relationships and have interactions with people who are suffering” (p.305). Kiely saw this emerging global consciousness as representing a “profound

movement in one's frame of reference –what students describe as a life altering experience or as a profound way I look at the world” (p. 311). The cases discussed in the literature review presented findings that indicated that some of the participants intended to act or committed to take action, and that taking action is a student development outcome that makes the critical service-learning experience worthwhile (Mitchell, 2007).

## **2.7 Summary of the Literature Review**

Noting the tendency for many universities across the U.S. to point to the growing numbers of students studying abroad as evidence of their successful efforts to graduate global citizens, the literature review began with a look at the historic roots and current trends of study abroad to provide context to the current study. After moving on to review the literature on global citizenship, an operational definition of this often-contested term is advanced for the purpose of this study. The literature then turned its attention to a variety of learning theories that appear to be helpful in providing a better understanding of how global citizenship may be learned while studying abroad. These learning theories include experiential education, service-learning, international service-learning, critical pedagogy, transformative learning, cross-cultural adaption/ intercultural competence, and critical service-learning. The emerging literature on critical service- learning, which incorporates core elements from Mezirow's transformative learning model such as critical reflection, critical discourse over a disorienting dilemma, and the social justice orientation of Freire's critical pedagogy, was helpful at providing a better understanding of how students might be transformed into global citizens after participating in study abroad. The literature review indicates that the phenomenon of a perspective transformation from participating in study abroad could benefit from additional research. An investigation into what happens when students report a perspective transformation involving global citizenship development after participating in service-learning while studying abroad could shed more light on what made the service-learning transformative in nature. The literature review indicates that participating in critical service-learning while studying abroad may foster perspective transformations, such as broadened

worldviews, reconstituted beliefs and values and a commitment to act to address social injustice. This appears to support the contention that a longitudinal study might help to provide a better understanding of what happens in critical-service-learning to foster global citizenship development, and determine how this perspective transformation persists over time. Additional research on what actually happens when students undergo the phenomenon of a perspective transformation while studying abroad, as indicated by enhanced levels of global citizenship, may help validate the theory of critical service-learning and provide a better understanding of which program elements have the most impact. The literature review indicates that the personalization of, and critical reflection and dialogue on, issues of socio-economic injustice may be what links the study abroad experience to global citizenship development. Findings of specific actions taken by ISL program alumni in support of local and global socio-economic justice as a direct result of their study abroad experience would help validate the real impact of such programs. If intentions to act are never realized and perspective transformations are just temporary, the value of service-learning while studying abroad in regards to outcomes such as global citizenship development may be overstated. There is not much point in transformation if nothing occurs out of it (Mezirow, 1938).

This critical appraisal of the literature has led me to consider and propose several working hypotheses, or theoretical propositions, regarding how learning theory might help better explain the research questions of interest for this study. Both Yin (2003) and Stake (1995) state that theoretical propositions are useful in guiding the design of a qualitative research study. "Propositions may come from the literature, personal/professional experience, theories, asserted and/or generalizations based on empirical data" (Baxter & Jack, 2008, p.551). Miles & Huberman (1994) recommend returning to the research question and asking questions of the data that relate directly to them, putting certain issues in the foreground without engaging in premature interpretation of the text. As these propositions relate directly to the research questions, they are useful in guiding the study as they state upfront, based on my current knowledge, presuppositions, and a

review of the related literature, what I “guess to the possible outcomes of the experiment/research study” (p. 552). Propositions can help in the development of data collection and data analysis strategies and procedures and “form the foundation for a conceptual structure/framework” (Miles & Huberman, 1994; Stake, 1995).

### **Proposition 1**

Deep-rooted connections to, and critical reflection about, personal experiences with high socio-economic dissonance can lead to questioning the fairness of one’s own relative privilege (Doerr, Mitchell) and serve as a disorienting dilemma (Mezirow) which initiates the beginning of a perspective transformation.

### **Proposition 2**

The persistence over time of a global perspective transformation that represents transformative global citizenship should be evidenced by behaviors, choices and action taken (either locally or globally) to support social justice (Mezirow, Pompa, Doerr, Rosenberger, Mitchell) and improve the world.

### **Proposition 3**

Global citizenship development is a learning process that involves learning in both the affective and cognitive domains. Learning theories such as transformative learning (Mezirow; Tenant; Taylor, Cranton; Brookfield) and critical service-learning (Doerr; Mitchell; Pompa; Rosenberg) can help explain and better understand the process of transformative global citizenship development.

These theoretical propositions represent “a presumed set of casual links” (Yin, 2009, p. 141) about the nature and persistence of personal change that can occur after college students participate in critical service-learning while studying abroad. Identifying such a priori propositions keeps the research project focused on the research questions, while linking theoretical concepts in the literature to the data. Realizing that a drawback of using such a conceptual framework to guide the investigative process may limit the inductive nature of the investigation, several iterative and interpretive stages will be used to analyze and reanalyze the data to challenge these theoretical propositions throughout the research process.

## **Chapter 3                      Research Methodology**

### **3.1      Chapter Introduction**

The overarching focus of this study is to better understand the nature and persistence of a perspective transformation indicated by notable changes in worldviews leading to global citizenship development (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, and commitment to social justice activism) in college students who participated in a high intensity dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad. The literature review in Chapter 2 indicates that both transformative learning theory and critical service-learning theory may provide useful theoretical frameworks to examine and explain levels of personal change as reported by college students after they participate in semester long service-learning programs abroad. Findings from several prior case studies indicate that outcomes from participation in high dissonance service-learning programs may indeed include broadened worldviews, reconstituted beliefs and values, and a deepened social justice orientation. This chapter explores methodological ways in which archived and present day narrative data from alumni of a critical service-learning program can be collected, analyzed and interpreted to further investigate the short and long-term impact of participation in this type of study abroad program. The current study examines whether personal change resulting from participation in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad can serve as a critical life event that might foster a perspective transformation, or development shift to a new worldview (Tenant, 1993). This study is also interested in examining the nature of any perspective transformation from critical service-learning while studying abroad, to better understand whether this type of personal change represents enhanced dimensions of the global citizenship construct (enhanced global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, and commitment to global/ local social justice activism). The current study is designed to examine how such personal change persists over time, and the role that personalized high socio-economic dissonance plays in regards to the nature and persistence of a perspective transformation.

### 3.1.1 Research Questions

Using transformative learning and critical service-learning theories as the theoretical framework, the following four research questions are the focus for the current study in regards to the phenomenon of experiencing a perspective transformation after participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad that may have an impact on future behavior, actions and aspirations.

*Q.1. What was the study participant's perception of the impact that participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad had on their global perspective and global citizenship development?*

*Q.2. To what extent does a perspective transformation from high dissonance service-learning participation, as indicated by a participant's perception of enhanced dimensions of the global citizenship construct, persist over time and influence subsequent behaviors and actions?*

*Q.3. To what extent does personal experience with high socio-economic cognitive dissonance serve as a 'critical life event' leading to a turning point or personal breakthrough in regards to the phenomenon of a perspective transformation and transformative global citizenship development?*

*Q.4. To what extent does connecting to, and building relationships, with local people with considerably less privilege from the host marginalized socio-economic community, play a role in the persistence of a perspective transformation?*

### 3.2 Research Paradigm

A research paradigm is the conceptual framework that serves to guide the research design process. The paradigm encompasses "a loose collection of logically related assumptions, concepts or propositions that orient thinking and research" (Bogdan & Biklin, 1998, in MacKenzie & Knipe, 2006, p.2 ). The four primary research paradigms are positivist/post positivist; interpretivist/ constructivist;

transformative/ critical; and pragmatic. Positivism involves testing theories through deduction and mostly quantitative methods. Interpretivist/constructivist involves inductively examining how individuals construct and interpret meaning from lived experiences through mostly qualitative inductive methods, while transformative/critical mostly deals with contextual and historical factors related to issues of oppression. Pragmatic is considered the most adaptable, and often used for informing practice or policymaking through a mixed methods approach.

The current study is a good fit for the interpretivist /constructivist paradigm as it seeks to explore how research participants socially construct and interpret the impact of a profound personal experience. "Constructivism is built upon the premise of a social construction of reality" (Searle, 1995, in Baxter, p.545). Constructivism "assumes that the meaning of experiences and events are constructed by individuals, and therefore people construct the realities in which they participate"(Charmaz, 2006, p.187). The current study focuses on understanding and interpreting how participants socially constructed meaning from this personal experience and the long-term impact on their worldview, levels of cultural sensitivity, and moral development. This involves a multi-layered interpretive process, as "the participants are trying to make sense of their world; the researcher is trying to make sense of the participants trying to make sense of their world" (Smith, Flowers, & Larkin, 2009 , p.1). However, in that the current study also seeks to look for a better understanding around links and causality in regards to the phenomenon is question and personal change, it was determined that using an interpretive/constructivist paradigm by itself to frame the study may be too limiting in nature. A pragmatic paradigm actually may be better suited for the research purpose and design of this study as it allows for the incorporation of critical realism within the interpretive/constructivist framework. A pragmatic paradigm allows for including "tools from both positivist and interpretivist paradigms" (MacKenzie & Knipe, 2006, p.6) and is not committed to any one system of philosophy or reality. "Pragmatism is concerned with action and change and the interplay between knowledge and action. This makes it appropriate as a basis for research approaches intervening into the world and not



merely observing the world” (Goldkuhl, 2012, p.2), which aligns it with the study purpose of examining social activism attributed to global citizenship development programs. Pragmatist researchers focus on the ‘what’ and the ‘how’ of the research problem (Creswell, 2003 , p.11).

The overarching purpose of the current study is to provide a better understanding of what happens in the process of participating in high dissonance service-learning that may actually cause changes in worldview and result in global citizenship development. While utilizing methods such as interpretive biography to help collect and analyze participant sense-making data, the current study goes beyond the interpretivist/constructivist paradigm as its focus is ‘change-oriented’, including studying personal change and perspective transformations as it relates to the reconsideration of relative power and privilege. The current study incorporates key elements of critical realism and ontology into the research design, and includes the use of a structural framework (template analysis) with *a priori* themes that allows the concepts of critical-service-learning and transformative global citizenship to be analyzed in a way that makes sense and show how they might be aligned. Critical realists, much to the dismay of positivists and constructivists, endorse the concept of cause in natural and social science, and most realists see causality as a real phenomenon, an explanatory concept that is intrinsic to either the nature of the world (Strawson, 1989) or to our understanding of it (Putnam, 1990). Therefore, the current study is designed to see how learning theories such as critical-service-learning and transformative learning might explain how a phenomenon of a perspective transformation may be a link to better understanding, or demonstrate causality between, participation in high dissonance service-learning while studying abroad and global citizenship development. For critical realists, the process is central to explanation, and such “processes are seen as the real phenomena, rather than simply as abstract models” (Maxwell, 2009, p.9). Considered as such, the process of a perspective transformation is central to an explanation that would link high dissonance service-learning abroad and global citizenship development. Learning theories such as transformative learning and critical-service learning, therefore,

become important pedagogical lens to help explain the process and phenomenon of a perspective transformation.

### **3.3 Research Approach**

Case studies are “widely employed as a methodology for researching higher education....they are a classic approach to relatively small-scale research” (Tight, 2003, p. 185). The research approach for the current study is underpinned by a qualitative case study methodology. “A qualitative case study is an approach to research that facilitates exploration of a phenomenon within its context using a variety of data sources” (Baxter & Jack, 2008, p. 544). I am interested in how and why participating in a high dissonance service learning program while studying abroad in South Africa might lead to the phenomenon of a perspective transformation, represented by the development of transformative global citizenship. Qualitative case study research “enables the researcher to answer “how” and “why” type questions, while taking into consideration how a phenomenon is influenced by the context within which it is situated” (Baxter & Jack, p. 556).

Several alternative approaches to qualitative research were considered. One alternative approach is phenomenology (Moustakas, 1994; van Manen, 1990), with its focus on sense making and distilling individual experiences in a ‘universal essence’ through methodologies such as Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis or IPA (Smith, Flowers & Larkin, 2009). The problem with using a strictly phenomenological process is that this approach discourages the use of *a priori* hypotheses, calls for researchers to suspend or bracket any of their previous understandings around the phenomenon to eliminate any researcher bias, and typically uses rich, in-depth data through semi-structured interviews with less than 10 study participants. The study attempts to explore whether causality can be asserted from the findings, and therefore the target number of study participants is greater (20-30) than usually included within IPA. In addition, the ability to start the research process with initial working hypotheses based on prior knowledge and established

related theoretical concepts in the literature in order to keep the research process focused on the phenomenon of interest is foundational to the current study. This initial level of deductive reasoning is considered problematic in most phenomenological approaches.

Other alternative research approaches were also considered. Grounded theory (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) was deemed to be not well-suited due to its strict inductive nature and stated purpose of discovering theory through the data. Ethnography (Agar, 1996; Harris, 1968) was not chosen as it typically involves studying larger culture or culture-sharing groups and usually requires that the researcher is immersed in day-to-day field observations of, and interviews with, the study participants. I also considered using narrative inquiry as the research approach since I was studying personal narrative data from study participants with the hope of making sense of their experience and understand how they constructed meaning within a broader social context (Barkhuizen, Benson, & Chik, 2014). However, narrative inquiry typically involves storytelling, crafting in-depth interpretive stories and story lines for each individual case. Since I was more interested in obtaining a better understanding of the phenomenon in question than developing an in-depth story for each individual, it was determined that a qualitative case study methodology was the best research approach for studying the threads that connected the collective cases of the study. The data analysis, however, does follow a thematic analysis process which incorporates several elements of a paradigmatic 'analysis of narratives' approach to the collective narratives (Bruner, 1985) as it "seeks to locate common themes or conceptual manifestations among the stories collected as data" (Polkinghorne, 1995, p.13).

### **3.4 Research Design**

Research design is the blueprint for any research study, as it connects the purpose of the study to the process and methods involved in collecting data for analysis (Philliber, Schwab, & Samsloss, 1980). In order to answer the research

questions, the current study is designed as a collective case study (using a personal experience-centered narrative inquiry approach and qualitative methods) to further examine sense and meaning-making by college students who participated in a critical service-learning programs while studying abroad. An alternative approach would be to collect data from a variety of study abroad students, which would make use of a control groups of students who participated in traditional study abroad experiences or one comprised of those who participated in service-learning programs studying abroad which did not provide a high dissonance personal experience. Since the overarching purpose of the current study is to help explain the levels of personal change that occur and persist through the phenomenon of a perspective transformation, it was decided that a longitudinal collective case study would provide the best data for analysis. A case study design is appropriate for studies that are interpretivist/constructivist in nature (Yin, 2003; Stake, 1995). "All case study research starts from the same compelling feature: the desire to derive in-depth understanding of a single or small number of cases, set in their real-world contexts" (Bromley, 1986 , p.1). Explanatory case studies are focused on a better understanding of the presumed causal links of a real-life intervention (Yin, 2003). Since the intent is to gain insight of a specific phenomenon, it is also considered an instrumental case (Stake, 1995), as the individual cases actually play a supportive role to a primary goal of getting a better understanding of the phenomenon in question. For the current study, a perspective transformation is the phenomenon of interest and the critical service-learning experience serves as the intervention. These types of explanations would also be helpful to link program implementation to program effects (Yin, 2003) such as a student development outcome indicating that one or more dimensions of global citizenship has been developed.

### **3.4.1 Collective Case Study**

The case study approach is not without its critics, primarily focused on the view that one cannot generalize on the basis of a single case study (Dogan & Pelassy, 1990), faulting case study research for its inability to "provide reliable information generalized to a broader class" (Abercrombie, Hill, & Turner, 1984, p.

34). The question of ‘generalizability’ is central to critical arguments about the value of case study research, and the current study has incorporated several elements to address the problem with generalizing the findings of such research. First, the current study is designed as a collective case study in which longitudinal data is collected from 20-30 cases. While critical of single case studies, Abercrombie and his colleagues noted the value of using multiple cases to investigate hypotheses, and the current study uses several initial working hypotheses to guide the data collection and analysis. Secondly, the current study utilizes a criterion case sampling process that “involves selecting cases that meet some predetermined criterion of importance” (Patton, 2001, p.238). These predetermined criteria include their participation in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad. These cases are also considered to be critical cases, having strategic importance in relation to the general problem (Flyvbjerg, 2006). As mentioned, all of the cases in the study involve college students who took part in a high dissonance service-learning program overseas, and all were afforded the opportunity to critically reflect on and discuss this socio-economic dissonance with their peers. This design puts them in the unique situation of being able to provide longitudinal data that is responsive to the research questions that can be viewed through the pedagogical lens of transformative learning and critical service-learning theories. Through this critical case sampling process, it is hoped that the generalizability of this case study will “be increased by the strategic selection of cases” (Flyvbjerg, pg.14).

A collective case study is designed to help explain the nature and long-term impact of college student participation in a high dissonance critical service-learning while studying abroad. A collective case study “seeks to build abstractions across cases –leading to categories, themes or typologies that conceptualize the data from all cases” (Merriam, 1998, p.195). The cases for the current study are college students who have previously participated in a high dissonance service-learning experience while studying abroad. Each student represents a case; 29 such cases will comprise the collective case study. The unit of analysis for each case is the level, nature and persistence personal change reported in each case. Collective case

studies usually have “two stages of data analysis – the within-case analysis and the cross-case analysis” (Merriam, pg.194), with each case treated as a comprehensive case before beginning the cross-case analysis.

### **3.4.2 Research Sample**

The current study uses a purposive sampling approach to investigate what happens in high dissonance service-learning programs while studying abroad that may lead to a perspective transformation and global citizenship development for some of the participating college students. A purposive sample is a non-random sample in which participants are bounded within a case study. Patton (1990 , p.169) asserts “that the logic and power of purposeful sampling lies in selecting information rich cases”. For the current study, a convenience sample consisting of (87) program alumni (former UConn students who participated in a semester-long high dissonance service-learning program during the timeframe of 2008-2014), whose email addresses were readily accessible, were invited to participate. This cohort-based study abroad program is located in Cape Town, South Africa, and is intentionally designed to engage the participants in high levels of socio-economic dissonance. This type of high dissonance service-learning program abroad program provided a unique opportunity to examine student development outcomes in regards to transformative learning and critical service-learning theory. Considered as such, the study participants comprised a theory-based sampling (Patton, 2002) in which cases are chosen because they meet a specific criterion of interest. “The sample becomes, by definition and selection, representative of the phenomenon of interest” (p.238). Participants were contacted by email (see Appendix B) and informed about the purpose and nature of the current voluntary study, as well as the institutional policies for informed consent (see Appendix C). In order to minimize any possible subject bias, potential participants in the sample pool were contacted and offered the opportunity to participate in the current study without regard to the data in their historic archived journals.

A total of 29 past participants (see Appendix G) in the UConn study abroad program, or 33% of the sample population of 87, agreed to participate in the current research study and subsequently submitted three-four pages of narrative responses to the guided autobiographical questionnaires. The students who participated in the current study were all from middle or upper-middle class backgrounds in the U.S. They were predominately female (25/29) or 86%, and this percentage was representative of the male/female breakdown of the entire sample (75/89), or 84%, that was invited to participate in the current study. All of these participants were required to keep extensive critical reflective journals throughout the 13-week program, and are considered 'information rich' for the purpose of providing relevant data that is responsive to the research questions. New students who were currently participating in the Spring of 2015 program also contributed valuable contextual information about the program during a program field observation in Cape Town in March of 2015. The high socio-economic dissonance nature of the UConn study abroad service-learning program in South Africa, along with its stated program goals of developing global citizenship, demonstrated its congruence with the theoretical framework of the current study.

### **3.4.3 Program Context- UConn Study Abroad in Cape Town, South Africa**

South Africa, with a history that includes racist political practices in the twentieth century referred to as apartheid, has experienced profound societal, political and cultural change over the past 20 years. This country is now recognized as an increasingly tolerant nation whose progressive constitution uses specific language to address a variety of social justice issues, including racial equality, gender equity, access to education and health care, as well as environmental and conservation rights. Yet some of the social justice issues caused by decades of apartheid still linger in modern day cosmopolitan Cape Town. Since 2008, UConn's Education Abroad Office has facilitated a semester long service-learning program each spring semester in Cape Town, South Africa for a cohort of 15- 30 UConn students.

“UConn in Cape Town draws on the institution’s core value of Human Rights. It will immerse you into the living history of South Africa by directly involving you in institutions that are wrestling with South Africa’s troubled past and creating a modern, democratic civil society. At the heart of the program is a three-day per week internship. Internships are specifically selected to meet the individual interests and goals of each student” (UConn, 2015, pg.1)

The students live together in a rented house near the University of Cape Town, an institution that serves as an academic partner for the program. This program is intentionally designed to include many elements of critical service-learning, including exposure to high socio-economic dissonance around relative power and privilege; a three-day per week community service internship; the development of a community-based activist project; credit bearing academic courses focused on human rights and social justice; numerous opportunities for cross-cultural engagement, including a weekend homestay with a local family; and cross-cultural field trips to some of the reminders of South Africa’s apartheid era, including Robben Island and the District Six Museum, both located in Cape Town. The semester-long student internships were hosted by a variety of schools, health agencies, hospitals, and homeless shelters in under resourced townships located on the outskirts of Cape Town proper. Students worked directly with the local community members, and were exposed to racial segregation, extreme poverty, the lack of sanitary facilities, vast wealth disparity and the prevalence of HIV/Aids -issues that many South Africans continue to struggle with on a daily basis, despite the stated lofty principles of their new constitution.

The program offers a strong curriculum that helps students learn about the history and politics of South Africa. This includes an engaged research methods course specifically related to the role of nonprofit organizations and a human rights course that discusses privilege and oppression in South Africa, especially as it relates to apartheid. Most students who participate in the UConn study abroad



program in Cape Town are honors-level students in their junior year of undergraduate studies. The UConn Study Abroad promotional materials (see Appendix A) state that “the Cape Town Education Abroad Program provides one of the best ways to learn about yourself, expand your worldview, and work for social justice while gaining skills essential to becoming a well-informed global citizen” (2015, p.1). All participants are required to participate in pre-departure orientation workshops, and keep web-based narrative reflective journals throughout their 13-week long sojourn. These diaries of their personal experience in Cape Town also include their responses to questions posed by faculty each week. In addition to this critical reflection, students meet each week with the program faculty to participate in critical discourse about their internship and related field-based activities of their program. Each participant also provides a capstone summary of their experience, and participates in a group presentation to the UConn community on the values and intercultural lessons learned from their time in South Africa.

#### **3.4.4 Use of Qualitative Methods**

A research method is a procedure for gathering evidence. The current study is focused on how participants in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad make sense and meaning of their experience in terms of personal change and development. The use of qualitative methods was deemed the best way to extract meaning from the narrative data of individuals that explains their feelings on a personal experience (Biggerstaff, 2012, p.176). “Narrative inquiry that is more interested in how meaning is conferred onto experience, especially in narratives of personal experience about concrete life situations .... has traditionally leaned more towards the employment of qualitative research procedures” (Bamberg, 2006, p. 3).

### **3.5 Data Collection**

#### **3.5.1 Collection of Contextual Data**

While the literature review was helpful in providing a theoretical framework for how high dissonance critical-service-learning while studying abroad may impact student development, effective personal experience-centered research also requires an in-depth understanding of the context of the phenomenon in question (Riessman, 2008; Tamboukou, 2010). To gain a better contextual understanding of the nature of the UConn service-learning program, I visited Cape Town and the Western Cape region to make field observations and interview some participants, program facilitators, and community stakeholders during the Spring 15' program offering. I was able to experience firsthand the levels of extreme poverty and social stratification that the participants were exposed to on a daily basis, which helped me verify the high level of socio-economic dissonance that underpinned the program. I was also able to hold a focus group with the program participants to solicit their thoughts on their experiences in Cape Town, and this meeting provided some antidotal evidence of the potential transformative nature of the program as several participants became very emotional during the focus group. These field observations provided valuable insight into the contextual framework of the phenomenon, which was helpful in the final conceptualization of the research questions and research design.

#### **3.5.2 Multi-Phase Data Collection**

The data collection process involved both present-day life stories (guided autobiographies) and archived life histories (reflective journal postings during the program). The guided autobiographical questionnaire (see Appendix D) was specifically designed to evoke data relative to the research questions and phenomenon of interest. The data collection of these life stories was collected in numerous stages: initially, ten questions were asked and answered via email. The submitted data was acknowledged and confirmed with each participant to clarify any ambiguities around the questions or answers. Based on feedback from my thesis

advisor, the last question (Question 11), which was specifically designed to elicit data about outcomes such as personal change and global citizenship development, was provided as a follow-up question via email (see Appendix E), so as not to unduly influence the data submitted in responses to the earlier questions.

The longitudinal data is collected in two distinct stages. This two-phase data collection strategy helps provide a better understanding in regards to how each participant made and continues to make sense of a personal experience as it relates to his or her life story. “One has to reconstruct a person’s history as well as the present biographical perspective in order to give his or her biography meaning and construct continuity” (Rosenthal, 2002, p. 178). The current study collects both archived and present day narrative autobiographical data which allows for a thematic reconstruction of their personal lived experience while studying abroad, or ‘life history’ (Rosenthal), as well as a present day perspective on the long-term impact, if any, of this experience or ‘life story’. Life history can be constructed around critical events or turning points to reveal personal meanings and transformations (De Chesnay, 2014). The present day life story allows these same individuals the opportunity to give their biography meaning, and to construct continuity and provide an interpretation of how this past experience contributed to their current mindset (Polkinghorne, 1988). Combining retrospective and real time cases also helps to triangulate the archived data while mitigating issues such as retrospective sense making and impression management that sometimes typify retrospective accounts (Leonard-Barton, 1990). Since the accuracy of follow-up autobiographic life story accounts can be threatened by memory and recollection lapses over time, the current study uses the historical narrative data as a fact-checking tool for the new narrative data.

### **3.5.3 Guided Autobiographies –Retrospective Re-Storied Accounts**

The initial phase of data collection involves present day retrospective accounts or discrete life stories from 29 program alumni of past offerings of this

program. The data of these life stories was collected in numerous stages: initially, ten questions were asked and answered via email. The submitted data was acknowledged and confirmed with each participant to clarify any ambiguities around the questions or answers. This present day data allowed the participants to have a 'second take' opportunity to reflect back on their life story as it relates to, or was influenced by, their study abroad experience in Cape Town.

"We continually re-story our pasts, shifting the relative significance of different events for whom we have become ....meaning of life events are not fixed or constant, but evolve, influenced by subsequent life events .... as we access and make sense of events and experiences in our pasts and how they are related to our current selves, we change their meaning" (Mishler, 1999, p.5).

All study participants completed a two to three page guided autobiographical account that, while primarily open-ended in nature, was intentionally designed to guide their narratives toward a retrospective re-storied interpretation of their study abroad experience. Within the questionnaire, prompts were used to encourage them to share how this personal experience may have influenced a change in who they were then and whom they are now, in regards to their worldviews and beliefs, and as evidenced by present day and future personal and/or professional decisions, behaviors or actions. These themes were selected based on their relationship to personal change that indicates enhancement in one or more dimensions of transformative global citizenship. The rationale for collecting present day written narrative data versus semi-structured interviews went beyond the practical considerations of convenience (time and expense). A conscious decision was made that "instead of interviewing and hoping to elicit a narrative, or alternately re-creating a narrative, why not ask people to provide a written narrative about a situation" (Bold, 2012, p.17) in order to get 're-storied' or second take data. Ongoing email contact allowed for follow-up questions to clarify and expand on participants' responses.

This 'second take' data included questions on participant demographics, original motivation to participate, as well as their reflections on the personal impact of their study abroad experience and their worldviews. The study participants were prompted to reflect on the context of the experience, including how various intentionally designed program elements (class content and/or faculty, community service projects, internships at NGO's, meetings or homestays with local South Africans) might have had a positive (or negative) impact on their experience. They were also prompted to identify any action taken since they graduated that could be attributed to their participation in the program. This process allowed the study participants to explain how their study abroad experience impacted "who they are, how they came to be, and where they believed their lives may be going by formulating, telling, and revising stories about the personal past and the imagined future" (Bruner, 1990, in McAdams et al., 2006, p.1372).

#### **3.5.4 Archived Documents –Personal Experience Reflective Journals**

The second phase involved the collection of archived written documents, in the form of web-based reflective journals and class essays, authored by the study participants during and immediately after they participated in a critical service-learning program while studying abroad. This form of data is similar to personal diaries. This data includes each study participant's sense making as expressed in weekly service-learning journals online. While these online journals were not graded or assessed, all program participants were required to maintain them throughout the program in order to share their critical reflections on this experience with their professors and their peers during the four-month program. What they wrote or how much they wrote was not prescribed in advance, and the individualistic nature of this data combined with the fact that the participants were not aware at the time they narrated it that it would be used for data the current study serves to bolster its validity. The data included both open-ended discussion as well as prompted responses to scheduled topics chosen by the program faculty. In the end, each participant submitted an average of eight pages of reflective journaling.

### **3.5.5 Data Analysis**

The data analysis followed a paradigmatic analysis of narratives process, which is in reality a thematic analysis. “ A thematic analysis is probably best suited to multiple case studies, because it opens up the possibility of comparing the narratives in a data set, of establishing shared themes, as well as highlighting individual differences” (Barkhuizen, Benson, Chik, 2014, p.77). Using this type of thematic analysis allowed me to connect the data extracts (key statements and phrases from each case) to external “abstract categories and concepts” (p. 81) connected to the theoretical framework of the study. Polkinghorne also asserts that while paradigmatic analysis can ascertain such themes inductively from the data, themes can also be derived deductively “from previous theory ....and applied to the data to determine whether instances of these concepts are to be found” (1995, p.13).

The collective case study used a biographical interpretative process (Denzin, 1989) alongside a systematic thematic analysis to analyze and interpret the data. Collected historical autobiographical data (archives of participant journals during their study abroad program) from 29 participants as well as follow-up longitudinal data in the form of guided autobiographical re-storied accounts (years after they completed the program) was analyzed within a multi-layered interpretive process. The present day data from each participant was analyzed for themes related to the research questions, and then reconsidered alongside the archived narrative data (within-case analysis); and subsequently, the collective case as a whole was examined using a cross-case analysis approach.

### **3.5.6 Interpretive Biography**

Interpretive biography (Denzin, 1989; Rosenthal, 1998; Creswell, 2007) involves the “studied use and collection of personal-life documents, stories, accounts, and narratives which describe turning points in individual lives” (Denzin, 1989, p. 13). Denzin considers these type of turning points as “interactional

moments and experiences which leave marks on people's lives (1989, p.13). The concepts of 'turning points' and 'critical life events' or 'critical life experiences' are closely related in nature and they are considered synonymous for the purpose of the current study. In biographical interpretation, all transformations, whether individual or collective, and their new and future horizons are accompanied by reinterpretations of the past, new perspectives concerning the present, and changed future projects (Rosenthal, 2000). The current study was focused on seeking explanations for the phenomenon of a perspective transformation that might result from a critical life experience, through the use of a multi-layered interpretive process to interrogate the data as it relates to the research questions.

### **3.5.7 Systematic Thematic Analysis**

Qualitative research needs to approach the data systematically. This study uses both a structural and thematic analytical approach, as it focuses on not only what is said (thematically) but also the context and chronologic order of critical life events and turning points within the story. The focus is on the interpretations of such transformative events that are shared in the narratives by the individual telling the story (Bruner, 1991). "Data is interpreted in light of the thematics developed by the investigator, influenced by prior and emergent theory, the concrete purpose of the investigation, and the data ....thematic analysis is the usual approach to letters, diaries, and autobiographies" (Riessman, p. 63). In conducting a biographical interpretation for a collective case study, a systematic thematic analysis allows the participant to speak for himself or herself but also have their accounts organized around themes and linked to theory (De Chesnay, 2014, pg. 173).

Thematic analysis can take either an inductive or a deductive, theoretically-driven approach (Boyatzis, 1988). An inductive approach means that the themes identified are strongly linked to the data (Patton, 1990), such as those used in grounded theory. With these two approach options, researchers can either code the data for a specific research question(s) (theoretical approach), or the specific

research question(s) can evolve through the coding process (inductive approach). The inductive thematic approach can be problematic if the data collected from the participants leads to themes that are not driven by the purpose of the study. A theoretically driven thematic analysis can avoid this problem and enhance the interpretative power by mapping the initial themes to the research questions and propositions, and using the thematic analysis within an existing theoretical framework to underpin any analytic assertions. The current study uses a template analysis for its thematic approach, allowing the study to start with initial themes that are driven by an overarching theoretical framework, including the literature on critical-service-learning and transformative learning theory, the research questions, and propositions that serve as initial working hypotheses. This type of theory-driven, or deductive, thematic analysis, while providing more concise information specific to the study purpose and theoretical framework, may limit or constrict the scope and breadth of the study by over relying on the themes to capture the essence of the narrative. The current study is designed to mediate this issue by modifying the initial themes after analyzing a sub-set of cases, before analyzing the entire dataset to establish patterns of responses. Using learning theories as an interpretive lens allows the current study to make sure that interpretations are linked to the theoretical framework.

### **3.5.8 Template Analysis**

Template analysis (King, 2004) is a thematic analysis that allows for the use of a coding frame (template), using themes as a starting point to analyze the data. It is an iterative interpretive process that seeks to provide a better understanding of the context of the narrative that is embedded within the initial themes, in order to extract significant statements from the narrative (personal experience journals, retrospective life stories, etc.). These statements can then be biographically interpreted to explain the data as it relates to the initial propositions and research questions of interest. A template analysis, from a constructivist perspective, sets out “to examine the underlying causes for a human phenomenon and is appropriate for use within a contextual constructivist investigation” (Madill, Jordan, & Shirley, 2000). While many



of the iterative interpretive procedures of thematic analysis are employed throughout the analysis, the template approach allows the current study to use the initial themes to examine “theoretically important aspects of experience while allowing the meaning in these particular areas to emerge in the analytical process” (Langridge, 2007, p.55). The initial template is only a starting point for analysis and will be modified after a review of a sub-set of cases is completed.

### **3.5.7 Data Analysis Process**

The data analysis process was undertaken systematically using a multi-phase approach. During the initial phase, the focus was on using a template analysis approach to thematically tease out student development outcomes that represent the phenomenon in interest (perspective transformation and global citizenship development). Using an outcome-based approach, the thematic analysis process used *a priori* themes related to the research questions in order to examine each participant’s submitted data in his or her guided autobiographies, looking for patterns in each case and between cases. The initial theme for Research Question 1 included statements that contained key words or phrases that indicate that a perspective transformation may have occurred. Words and phrases that described how a participant might have changed or transformed his or her worldview, identity or ‘perspective on life’ were extracted and coded accordingly under the theme of perspective transformation.

The second theme for Research Question 1 pertained to transformative global citizenship development, and the three dimensions (sub-themes) of the construct of transformative global citizenship, as operationalized for this study. These sub-themes included global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, and commitment to social justice activism. Key words or phrases of the sub-theme of global consciousness included statements that described how participants became more aware or conscious about the interdependent nature of the world and/or their place in it. For the sub-theme of ethnocultural empathy, the same process was used for

key words or phrases pertaining to a change in how a participant accepts diversity, is open to the traditions and ideas of people from a different culture, and is able to understand and perceive issues from another person's perspective (walk in someone else's shoes). This process was followed for the third sub-theme, which involved statements that indicate a change in a participant commitment to social justice activism. Key words or phrases in which participants described changes in how they viewed and took action to advance social justice for others who lacked equal opportunity, especially as they reconsidered their own relative privilege, were identified for further analysis. In order to shed light on the second research question, the initial analysis phase re-interrogated each participant's narrative in his or her guided autobiography to look for evidence of cases in which a perspective transformation and global citizenship development attributed directly to his or her study abroad experience had persisted over time and influenced subsequent behaviors, actions or commitments to act. The major theme for Research Question 2 was coded as transformative global citizenship- statements about behaviors and actions taken over time as global citizens that were attributed to the study abroad experience were key from the 29 cases. This template thematic approach was both an iterative and exhaustive process, as the initial template analyzes the initial three cases, and this template was subsequently modified and replicated to include any emerging themes. The final template (see Appendix F) was used then used to examine the remaining cases, and the appropriate key statements from each individual case were transferred to the aggregated thematic templates (see Appendix H) for further examination.

The next phase of the data analysis sought to re-examine the participant data from 19 participants whose present day guided autobiographical data indicated that their study abroad experience led them to take transformative global citizenship action. In order to accomplish this interpretive second level of analysis, analytical categories were created to map key participant statements related to the Research questions to possible explanations found within the relevant literature on theories of transformative learning and critical service-learning (see Appendix I). Additional

critical life event data, in the form of archived reflective journal postings by participants during the study abroad program, was collected and thematically analyzed based on *a priori* themes that related to Research Question 3 and Research Question 4. This phase of the analysis process looked at how these participants processed high socio-economic dissonance during and immediately after studying abroad to help explain what may have happened. In order to address Research Question 3, the template thematic analysis examined the archived personal reflective journals of these 19 participants under the theme of personal experience with high socio-economic dissonance. Key words and phrases indicating the internalization of high socio-economic dissonance (internal conflict around issues of socio-economic injustice, wealth disparity, and relative power and privilege) were coded as such. Finally, in order to answer Research Question 4 that sought to provide a better understanding of the role of personal connections to high socio-economic dissonance, the archived personal reflective journals were re-examined looking for evidence (key words or phrases) of personal connections that may have played a role in any perspective transformation and noted these statements accordingly. This second level of analysis allowed me to use learning theory on transformative learning and critical service-learning to help interpret how the critical life events in the Cape Town program might explain student outcomes such as a perspective transformation that led to transformative global citizenship.

The within case analysis procedures involve an examination of the archived documents from each individual alongside of their present data narrative, in which participants can provide additional context, including theorizing upon their life and expanding on their life story as it relates to their study abroad experience. This within case analysis considers each of the participants' accounts individually, working back and forwards between the archived documents and the re-storied account, comparing the archived data from the study abroad experience to the present day retrospective account, looking for developmental "patterns and meanings" (Denzin, pg. 56) that may have influenced personal change. The longitudinal data allowed for a horizontal time bound search for patterns in the individual sense making about

personal change related to the phenomenon in question over time. Each case is “treated as a comprehensive case in and of itself” (Merriam, pg. 194) and interpretive analytical abstraction is completed for each case before “comparisons between cases are completed and theoretical generalizations are developed” (Denzin, pg. 56). Once the within-case analysis is completed, a between-case analysis is conducted to identify patterns and congruence as well as differences in meaning and developmental outcomes, as they relate to the research questions, moving vertically across cases. The steps for using interpretive biography alongside of a template analysis approach include:

1. A template analysis process is followed, using descriptive dimensions of the phenomenon related to research questions and theoretical propositions from literature, as a template for the initial themes. Templates were developed to capture and organize participant statements that reflected these themes and sub-themes.
2. Each case is examined as a whole, using biographical interpretive process to sequentially examine the narrative data in regard to the sense making about the nature and persistence of any personal change.
3. Significant statements are identified and coded based on their relationship to the initial themes.
4. Initial themes are modified as necessary after a review of a sub-set of (3-4) cases
5. Common patterns as well as differences for the entire dataset are identified by moving back and forth between each case, in order to develop a final conceptual framework.
6. A written summary of the findings, as they relate to the study research questions, is to be completed and presented in Chapter 4.
7. The findings presented in Chapter 4 are further critically analyzed, with key statements as they relate to the research questions and learning theory, for a second order, more interpretive process in Chapter 5. Tables were created to map the findings (participant statements) for each research question to related learning theory and/or research from the literature (see Appendix I). The discussion in

Chapter 6 offers some conclusions based on the interpretations from Chapter 5, and further synthesizes the study limitations, challenges, implications for, and contributions, to theory and practice.

### **3.6 Methodological Limitations of the Study**

The use of self-reported narrative data was a limitation in that this type of data relies on the trustworthiness of the study participants, as well as their ability to be critically reflective. For the present day autobiographical accounts, participants might have had a tendency to respond in a certain way (response bias) in order to create a false impression. The purpose of the study was explained to all participants prior to their informed consent and it was hoped that this orientation, along with the fact that participation in the study is voluntary and that they are assured unanimity and confidentiality, might mitigate any potential responder bias. The ability to compare and contrast their archived narrative data with this present day autobiographical data was a strategy that will be deployed to address this limitation.

The current study collected data from participants from six different cohort semesters. As such, some of the students might have been exposed to slight program variations from participants in other years. This is a limitation of the study, but the narrative data from the various cohorts might have provided different perspectives that may have actually enriched the interpretive process. As mentioned previously, the template analysis thematic approach might have been a limitation on the level of induction. This limitation was mitigated somewhat by the use of the initial themes on a sub-set of cases, and then modifying them as indicated by the data analysis process, before moving on to the entire dataset. Furthermore, this investigation is limited in scope to the UConn students who self-select to participate in the Cape Town, South Africa study abroad program. Students selected to participate in this program have demonstrated a record of academic success and engagement, and as such, the findings from this study may have limited generalizability to the general student population. Since the current study is only interested in the nature and impact of participation in high dissonance service-

learning programs, the study does not intend for the findings this study to be generalizable to other more traditional types of study abroad practice (Engle & Engle, 2003). The phenomenon of interest was the nature and persistence of a perspective transformation leading to personal change after participating in critical service-learning programs while studying abroad. With this in mind, a decision was made to not have a control group of students who had participated in traditional study abroad experiences since these programs do not typically provide high dissonance personal experience. Instead, it was decided that a longitudinal collective case study on a sample of students (cases) would provide the best data for analysis to answer the research questions.

### **3.7 Ethics and Protection of Human Subjects**

Ethical research requires investigators to be responsible for safeguarding the wellbeing of participants of their studies, and to make sure that no harm is caused to them as a result of their participation. I have successfully completed the required CITI Social and Behavioral Science course on Ethics and Human Subject Protection. All participants are informed about the nature and purpose of the current study, including any anticipated risks or benefits, as part of the informed consent process (see Appendix C). They are also informed that participation in the study is voluntary, and they may withdraw from participating in the study at any time. Participants are also assured that their identities will be kept confidential through the use of pseudonyms in any written documentation. All data collected for the current study information will be stored in a locked cabinet in my office at UConn, which only I have access to, for a period of three years after the study is completed after which it will be destroyed.

### **3.8 Validity and Trustworthiness**

Validity is concerned with the interpretation of data (Peräkylä, 1997), and it is important to note that qualitative research is not intended to produce certainty, but

rather likelihood if it is “grounded in logic, defensible, well-grounded and supportable conclusions” (Polkinghorne, 1983, pg. 175). Several strategies were incorporated to help establish and maintain validity. This includes the use of triangulation (Maxwell, 2005) to mitigate the risk that the findings “will reflect only the subject biases or limitations of a specific source” (pg.93). Data taken at different times can increase the reliability or validity as demonstrated by the similarity in the findings (Kirk & Miller, 1986). Longitudinal data collected in the current study includes both historical archived accounts and current day autobiographical life story accounts, and each source of data serves to validate the other, addressing weaknesses such as recollection and memory lapses. The real-life environment in which the archived reflection blogs were narrated was seen as enhancing the ecological validity (Willig, 2001) of the present day life stories. Additional field data collected from program faculty and current participants also was useful to provide context for the program and validate the narrative assertions within the study participants’ data. The use of a critical collective case study approach, with multiple cases that were linked to the theoretical framework of the current study, provided some additional ability to generalize the data in regards to the phenomenon of interest. The literature review and a thorough justification of the methodologies provide a strong theoretical foundation, which serves to increase the validity of the current study. All participants with readily assessable email contact information who participated from 2008- 2014 were invited to participate in the study to mitigate subject bias. In addition, as divergent views and ‘outliers’ can provide for better understandings and enhanced analytical interpretation (Miles & Huberman, 1994), both positive and negative narrative perspectives were included in the results to increase the validity of the data. I recognized that my own bias could have a negative impact on the level of validity and trustworthiness of the study, as it might affect decisions such as the methodological approach selected, how the findings are presented, and the “framing and communication of the conclusions” (Malterud, 2001, p. 483). Therefore, I incorporated several key steps to address my own reflexivity including:

1. Disclosing my initial assumptions and pre-suppositions as propositions (working hypotheses) early in the study. "Preconceptions are not the same as bias, unless the researcher fails to mention them" (Malterud, p. 484).
2. Being introspectively reflexive as I made decisions, from the research methods I selected and my interpretations of the data to the conclusions and recommendations in regards to the practice of study abroad.

As the purpose of this study is to provide a better understanding of how transformative global citizenship might be developed after studying abroad within a high socio-economic environment, this reflexivity process also required me to think about how I was framing and conducting the study knowing that I have been socialized with a Western, hegemonic perspective of the world. I needed to make sure to continually reflect critically about this in order to ensure the study was not 'othering' the people of South Africa.



## **Chapter 4 Presenting the Findings**

### **4.1 Introduction to Chapter**

The overarching purpose of the current study is to help explain how participating in high dissonance service-learning while studying abroad might have a long-term impact on the global perspectives or worldviews, and global citizenship development, of college students. Based on the literature review, several propositions were advanced in regards to how high socio-economic dissonance might lead to a perspective transformation for participants in such programs. The current study uses a structural framework (template thematic analysis), with *a priori* themes that relate directly to the research questions and phenomenon of interest as the methodological foundation of a systematical data analysis process. The current study goes beyond the interpretivist/constructivist paradigm as its focus is ‘change oriented’, including studying personal change derived from a perspective transformation that persists over time as it relates to processing high levels of cognitive dissonance in regards to deep personal experience to socio-economic injustice and consideration of one’s own relative privilege.

### **4.2 Presentation of the Findings**

“There are two main approaches to writing up the findings of qualitative research” (Burnard, Gill, Stewart, Treasure, & Chadwick, 2008, p. 432). Some researchers use the more traditional method involving the “reporting key findings under each main theme or category, using verbatim quotes to illustrate the findings” (p. 432), reserving efforts to interpret the findings for a subsequent discussion chapter. Another way to do this would be to integrate the discussion into the findings presentation. For the current study, the findings will be presented in the former, more traditional way. This approach was chosen in order to provide the participants voice and let their actual words speak for themselves, allowing “readers to understand complex processes by which people made sense of their lives” and “had particular views or perspectives” (Corden & Sainsbury, 2006, p. 13). Therefore, the key findings from the template thematic analysis of each participant’s narrative, as they

relate to each research question, are organized and presented by the use of verbatim quotations without any initial interpretation of what the findings might mean. This allows for the study to present “the findings as objectively as possible without speculation –that is, free from researcher bias” (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2012, p. 148). This section will also include a summary of the findings, which will be linked “to the subsequent chapter where the findings will be critically discussed and interpreted” (Burnard, Gill, et al, p. 432), using learning theories such as transformative and critical service-learning as a pedagogical interpretive lens. The key findings obtained from a thematic analysis of narrative data from 29 cases will be presented.

While this was a qualitative study and the findings are qualitative in nature, the presentation of the findings section in Chapter 4 uses several quantitative terms (overwhelming majority, vast majority, and small segment) to describe the actual number/ percentage of cases that provided a congruent or incongruent data. These quantitative descriptors are intended to provide the reader a snapshot of the degree of similarity (patterns) or difference uncovered from the in depth across-case analysis. These quantitative descriptions are not intended to indicate that any quantitative significance was either sought or determined in the study.

The emphasis is on letting the participants narrate the story using illustrative verbatim quotes from their responses to open ended questions. Every attempt is made to present a representative sample of the multiple perspectives found within the dataset. Statements containing key words or phrases will be identified in the participant narrative data to retell their personal experiences studying abroad in order to shed light on the research questions of the study. The presentation of findings section also provides a summary statement for each finding related to the themes, along with a sample of some of the verbatim quotes. This use of original data has two main benefits. First, it provides an audit trail for the findings to strengthen the credibility of the study. Secondly, it is helpful in providing the reader some context into each participant’s unique sense-making process in regards to the

phenomenon of interest. Each subsequent finding will be linked to the earlier findings to provide a conceptual roadmap to exploring how one finding may be connected to the others. For each finding, a verbatim quote from a participant that best represents the essence of the finding is included for illustrative purposes. A summary of all findings will be included at the end of the chapter, and these findings and the verbatim quotes will serve as a basis for the interpretive discussion in Chapter 5.

#### **4.2.1 Findings**

In relation to the four research questions, seven major findings emerged from the study:

1. An overwhelming majority of all study participants (24 of 29, or 83%) described having a perspective transformation, as operationally defined in the study, as a direct result of their participation in the UConn in Cape Town study abroad program
2. The same overwhelming majority (24 of 29, or 83%) indicated that they had experienced notable personal development in their levels of one or more sub-dimensions or key indicators of global citizenship (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, social justice commitment) as a direct result of their participation in the UConn in Cape Town study abroad program
3. The vast majority of the participants who experienced a perspective transformation (19 of 24, or 79%) took transformative global citizenship action as a direct result of participating in the UConn in Cape Town study abroad program
4. 19 of the 19 participants (100%) who took transformative global citizenship action reported experiencing high levels of cognitive dissonance around issues of socio-economic injustice during the UConn study abroad program
5. The same 19 participants also described how they forged close relationships and personal connections to locals in under resourced and marginalized communities through their community internship and/or homestay experiences

6. The overwhelming majority of these 19 participants (14 of 19, or 74%) had trouble readjusting to life back in the U.S. as they dealt with the lingering effects of cognitive dissonance

7. A small segment of these 19 participants (2 of 19, or 11%) cited negative effects from the cognitive dissonance that might be symptomatic of post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD)

*What was the study participant's perception of the impact that participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad had on their global perspective and global citizenship development?*

#### **4.2.2 Finding 1**

##### **Major Theme: Perspective Transformation**

(sub-themes of broadened worldviews, reconsidered beliefs, reconstituted values)

The data indicates that participating in a high dissonance service-learning while studying abroad does lead to perspective transformations for a vast majority of participants (n=24).

A perspective transformation is a process of challenging previously held beliefs and assumptions, representing a development shift to a new worldview (Tennant, 1993). The evidence of a perspective transformation that persisted over time was identified in the overwhelming majority of personal narratives (24 out of 29 of the participants, or 83%). Based on their archived personal journal entries and substantiated by their responses in their current day guided autobiographies, the current study found an abundance of evidence of the broadened worldviews, reconsidered beliefs, and reconstituted values that persisted over time (see Appendix H, Template 1). For example, Mollie reported that "Cape Town changed me as a person.... most influential thing that has happened in my life to date.... Cape Town was a life altering experience" and Daniella asserted

My experience has irrevocably changed my life, my views, and my future. I cannot imagine who I would be today without those four months.... I have had a life altering experience here in Cape Town.

All 29 participants attributed some level of personal change to participating the UConn study abroad program in Cape Town, although for five participants, this change was not found to be what would be considered to be a perspective transformation. While Elly asserts that she learned that “it’s important to respect your values” and that she feels “more obligated to work somewhere I respect” she also confesses that “professionally, my aspirations haven’t changed much”. Susan says that while the Cape Town program “helped me examine biases and communication problems I was not previously aware of ..... Nothing really felt life-changing.” Pattie views her time “abroad as a major formative experience in my life. Studying abroad gave me appreciation for the opportunities I’ve had in my life and helped me better understand socio-economic issues”, but never really indicates that any real perspective transformation had occurred from the experience.

#### **4.2.3 Finding 2**

##### **Major Theme: Global Citizenship Development**

The same 24 participants who provided narrative evidence that indicates they had experienced a perspective transformation also were found to have enhanced their levels of one or more dimensions of global citizenship as a direct result of participating in the Cape Town study abroad program.

The key sub-dimensions of transformative global citizenship, as defined in Chapter 1, are global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, and commitment to social justice. Template 2 (see Appendix H) provides a representative sample of verbatim quotes from some of the 24 participants who reported experiencing a

perspective transformation as it relates to an enhanced level of global consciousness. This includes Ashley who writes how she “left with such a different sense of the world ....my view of the world and perspective on life has changed” and Abby who “looked at everything back at home through changed eyes” and sees herself as “more aware, compassionate, understanding, sensitive to others”.

The participant data reveals an abundance of narrative evidence in each of the 24 narratives that indicated the participants the Cape Town study abroad program had experiences that not only broadened their worldviews, but also was a consciousness-raising experience, in regards to their awareness of their own place in an increasingly interdependent world. Template 2 also includes a sample of the personal changes that the 24 transformed participants described in regards to their pre and post level of ethnocultural empathy. Many of these participants relate how their personal experience in Cape Town helped them discover their own racism and intolerance towards others that they didn't realize they had before participating in the program. Shellie for example, “became more thoughtful, empathetic, brave, friendly ....my view of the world has changed....I have a better understanding of how to be empathetic”. In addition to global consciousness and ethnocultural empathy, global citizenship includes an enhanced social justice orientation or a commitment to take action, either locally or globally, to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place. Caitlin shared how she had “a renewed urgency in working for justice when I returned. I was definitely more focused on activist efforts and causes in my community and in the world community” while Kasey asserted that her study abroad experience “allowed me to address my privilege, to notice injustices in my world and to start combatting unfair aspects of my community”. Carla shared how she

Learned to appreciate the opportunities, lifestyle and environment that I was privileged to have and grow up in. I felt like I could make a difference in the world, even it was just by making one person's life easier, even if just for a day. Everybody can make the world a better place just by realizing that we all live here and we all affect each other. We can all help each other, living as a community and not alone.

Narrative data in regards to how participation in the program served to foster social justice activism is also located in Template 2. Overall, Finding 2 indicates the perspective transformations that were indicated in Finding 1 (24 of the 29 participants) were connected to enhanced levels of global citizenship. However, it is important to note that Mezirow (1981) believes that there is not much point in transformation if nothing occurs out of it. Those who are truly transformed by an experience need to demonstrate the willingness to act on their new perspective (Taylor, 1997). With this in mind, the current study also sought to further discern whether or not participants who experienced perspective transformations with enhanced levels of global citizenship went on to take action as a direct result of the new cognitive and affective learning (global citizenship development) from their study abroad experience in Cape Town.

*To what extent does a perspective transformation from high dissonance service-learning participation, as indicated by a participant's perception of enhanced dimensions of the global citizenship construct, persist over time and influence subsequent behaviors and actions?*

#### **4.2.4 Finding 3**

##### **Major theme: Transformative Global Citizenship**

The data indicates that vast majority of the study participants who experienced a perspective transformation (19 of 24, or 79%) went on to take action (career change, community engagement, and/or social activism) towards improving their local communities and/ or making the world a more equitable place as a result of their participation in the UConn in Cape Town program (see Appendix H, Template 3). Robie spoke of how she “pursued a teaching career in what many people would deem a tough area because in Cape Town I worked at a school where students from the townships .... Cape Town changed my life” while Megan “co - founded a non-profit social art project with the purpose to increase awareness, induce empathy, and inspire change” as she wrote how her experience in South

Arica continued to inspire her to increase her activism (see Template 3). Rachel shared that she

Currently works as a Licensed Clinical Social Worker for a nonprofit hospice care agency in rural Colorado. I am very passionate about volunteering, giving back and having a career that helps others..... I particularly enjoy helping our poorest elders get linked up with resources. I decided to become a social worker directly related to the experiences I had in Cape Town, particularly working with awesome social workers and advocates.

Five participants (5 of 24) who indicated they had a perspective transformation and taken transformative action after returning were not counted with the 19 participants. For these five individuals, it was not evident from their guided autobiographical accounts that their action was as a result of their participation in the study abroad program, or just action they would have taken anyway because it was already so inclined prior to participation the program. This includes Robert who changed his career goal to be a high school counselor in order to help underprivileged students find their way. Robert stated that the “road to deciding I wanted to be a counselor was a long one with many influences, but I attribute a portion of the decision to my time in Cape Town.” However, the finding that 66% of the 29 study participants actually took action to make the world a better place long after their study abroad experience ended, and attributed their actions directly to their study abroad experience, is compelling and perhaps the most noteworthy finding in the study. The systematic thematic analysis of outcomes related to the initial research question found that the overwhelming majority of participants (24 of 29) had experienced perspective transformations indicating global citizenship development had occurred. In regards to the second research question, the vast majority of these 24 participants (19 of 24) went on to take transformative global citizenship action as a result of their study abroad experience. In order to better understand what may have happened in the program to foster a perspective transformation and global citizenship development, the current study sought to further examine whether the unique nature of personal connections with high socio-



economic dissonance may have been a contributing factor related to the phenomenon of a perspective transformation as represented by enhanced levels of global citizenship.

*To what extent does personal experience with high socio-economic cognitive dissonance serve as a 'critical life event' leading to a turning point or personal breakthrough in regards to the phenomenon of a perspective transformation and transformative global citizenship development?*

#### **4.2.5 Finding 4**

##### **Major Theme: High Socio-economic Dissonance**

The data indicates that all of the of the participants (19 of 19, or 100%) who took transformative global citizenship behavior reported experiencing cognitive dissonance during their study abroad experience in regards to firsthand exposure to socio-economic injustices in Cape Town, South Africa.

In order to better understand what may have happened in the program to foster perspective transformations leading to global citizenship development, a second thematic analysis was undertaken using the archived reflective journals that were kept by participants during and immediately after the semester long program. This research phase looked for participant statements with key words as such as shock, unsettled, confused, upset, and anger from seeing numerous instances of extreme poverty, wealth disparity, racial segregation, and the everyday hardships faced by individuals who lived and worked in the impoverished townships located on the outskirts of Cape Town, especially when they considered the daily struggles in light of their own relative privilege (see Template 4). This process involved moving back and forth between archived reflective journaling and current day guided autobiographical data to examine the relationship between these personal experiences with high levels socio-economic dissonance and subsequent enhanced levels of global citizenship. Finding 4 indicates that high socio-economic dissonance

seems to have played a role in the phenomenon of a perspective transformation for all of the 19 participants who demonstrated transformative global citizenship years later that they attributed to their Cape Town program.

Robie recalled

Grappling with the extreme poverty I was witnessing in the townships. I come from a blue-collar city in Massachusetts so I understood on a surface level the poverty some experience, but I had never seen anything like the poverty in the townships.

The current study also was interested in examining the impact that personal connections to individuals who are subjects to the socio-economic injustice that underpins the cognitive dissonance has on the process of a perspective transformation.

*To what extent does connecting to and building relationships with local people with considerable less privilege from the host marginalized socio-economic community, play a role in the persistence of a perspective transformation?*

#### **4.2.6 Finding 5**

##### **Major Theme: Strong Personal Connections with Locals from Host Communities**

The thematic analysis found that community internships and homestays located in the townships appeared to strengthen the participant's emotional connection to the individuals and communities related to the high socio-economic dissonance for all of the same participants (19 of 19, or 100%). Alisha shared how

These dang kids have broken me down in so many ways I can't describe it even to myself but I will try to for the benefit of this paper- and maybe in years

to come I will have a better idea of what exactly they've done to this heart of mine. I think they have stolen it. Taken it in their little hands and kept it as a pet. My mind wanders to them in my free time, my hands fiddle toward my computer to look up more activities to give to them, and always- every time I think of them I feel riddled with guilt that I haven't lived up to an expectation.... They run to hug your legs, and they smile just when they see your face bobbing up the street. Somehow all the anxiety that you felt the whole week dissolves and you feel like you are their person, that thing that they have been waiting to see all day. I can't describe how special that makes me feel. I am honored to be someone's person.

These 19 participants submitted narrative data in their archived reflective journaling as well as confirming data in their current day guided autobiographies that indicated that they had established close relationships with locals in their marginalized, under resourced communities that they spent considerable time during their study abroad (see Template 5).

#### **4.2.7 Finding 6**

##### **Major Theme: Readjustment Issues upon Re-entry to U.S.**

The data indicated that the vast majority of the 19 participants (14 of 19, or 74%) had issues readjusting to life back in the U.S. after they returned from the UConn in Cape Town study abroad program and dealt with the lingering effects of personal connections to high socio-economic dissonance (see Template 6). The five others made no mention of any problems readjusting to life back home in either their archived journaling or present day guided autobiographical accounts. For the other 14 participants, however, returning back home was not easy at first. For example, Ashley recalled how

It quickly became clear how much I had actually changed while away ....I noticed inequality in my everyday life like I never had before. My family began

to think I was over sensitive or brainwashed by my liberal classes. I felt like I had been blind to things that now seemed so obvious and it was difficult having the people I loved not share my passions or at the very least, try to understand them.

#### **4.2.8 Finding 7**

##### **Major Theme 1: Instances of Persistent Readjustment Struggles**

The current study also found that for two program participants, readjustment back at home was extremely difficult and appeared to have had long-lasting negative emotional effects.

In the overwhelming majority of cases, the high socio-economic dissonance experiences led to positive cognitive and affective development. However, in rare cases (2 of 29, or 7%), readjustment back at home after their participation in the program was more than just temporary reverse culture shock (see Template 6). The findings included two cases where the introspective processing of such high levels of socio-economic dissonance had a dark side, leading to anxiety, sadness and depression that lasted well after the participants returned home. These two cases that, while considered outliers, were deemed noteworthy because they demonstrated that serious negative outcomes could occur when participants are unable to effectively process a deep personal connection to high cognitive dissonance around socio-economic injustices such as the type that is predominant throughout the Cape Town study abroad program. Megan wrote how

ZA was a trigger for me in both positive ways (first hand education about some of humanity's most complicated issues and histories) and negative ways (3.5 months of stress and periodic mood issues since then) ....that those who are already predisposed to empathy and have a high level of functioning empathy already should avoid the program because the overload of saddening stimuli and lack of familial and familiar support systems and

safety may affect such students in frightening ways. For me, the experience had wonderful days full of enrichment and horrific days full of terror and isolation.

### **4.3 Summary of Findings**

The data analysis found compelling evidence that the overwhelming majority of participants had experienced a perspective transformation after participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad in Cape Town, South Africa (24 of 29, or 83%). This perspective transformation included broadened worldviews, reconsidered beliefs and reconstituted values. The data also indicated (Finding 2) that these perspective transformations appear to have fostered one or more sub-dimensions of global citizenship (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy and an enhanced social justice orientation), which for most persisted and even strengthened over time. Finding 3 indicated that vast majority (19 of 24) of the participants who submitted narrative data that indicated that they had experienced a perspective transformation leading to global citizenship development, also indicating they have taken subsequent action related to making the world a better place. Labelled transformative global citizens, actions taken by these participants after they returned home up to the time of the current study include education and career choice changes, community involvement, and social activism at both the local and global levels. "Transformative citizens take action to promote social justice" (Banks, 2008, p.136).

In an effort to discern whether high socio-economic dissonance had a role in a perspective transformation, the data analysis includes an examination of the archived reflection journals that were kept during the study abroad program. The study found (Finding 4) that all of these same 19 participants described one or more instances of struggling with elements of high socio-economic dissonance. Work by Kiely (1998) suggests that personal connections to individuals and communities impacted by socio-economic injustice may affect reactions to cognitive dissonance

while studying abroad. Indeed, the study found (Finding 5) that all 19 participants also provided data that the close connections and relationships forged with locals during their internships and homestays strengthened the impact of the cognitive dissonance. In order to further examine how personal connections to high levels of social economic injustice impacts participants, the participants were prompted to discuss how they felt when they got back to the U.S.

The study findings (Finding 6) indicate that the vast majority of these participants (14 of 19, or 74%) initially struggled to readjust to life back home and on campus, especially with their interpersonal relationships with family and friends, as they questioned their own relative privilege, life priorities, and the creature comforts on life in the U.S. The data also indicates (Finding 7) that in rare cases (2 of 29, or 7%), participants suffered lingering negative emotional effects such as recurrent sadness, depression, confusion and anxiety, after participating in the UConn in Cape Town study abroad program. All of these findings are a representation of what occurred during the study abroad program and subsequent student development outcomes over time, as it relates to the research questions, and as narrated by participants. Chapter 5 will discuss and interpret these findings through the pedagogical lens of learning theories such as transformative learning and critical service-learning, in an attempt to tease out a better understanding of how and why high dissonance service-learning while studying abroad may result in perspective transformations and global citizenship development.

## **Chapter 5 Analysis, Interpretation and Synthesis of Findings**

### **5.1 Purpose of the Chapter**

The purpose of this chapter is to look for deeper explanations of the study findings by re-examining the participant narratives using learning theory as a pedagogical lens for interpretation. By using this second level of analysis, I seek to better understand whether or not the study could provide evidence that these type of service-learning experiences abroad represent an authentic 'pedagogy for the privileged' (Curry-Stevens, 2007) which might lead to the development of transformative global citizens. This phase of the study followed an iterative dual interpretive process involving making sense of how the participants made sense of their experiences (Smith, 2004). This process required a systematic and analytical interpretation of each study participant's autobiographical narrative data that was composed during, immediately upon return, as well as retrospectively years after their personal experience abroad.

### **5.2 Systematic Approach to Research**

This study relied on a narrative inquiry process to collect qualitative data in the form of life histories (archived personal reflection journals) and life stories (guided autobiographical accounts) around critical events leading to turning points for participants during the study abroad experience. Participants in the study included 29 former students from the University of Connecticut (UConn) who were alumni of a semester-long UConn in Cape Town (South Africa) study abroad program held each spring semester since 2008. The narrative data was coded, analyzed, and organized initially by research question and subsequently grouped into analytic categories guided by the conceptual framework as it related to the research questions. The study was primarily focused on answering the four research questions:

1. What was the study participant's perception of the impact that participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad had on their global perspective and global citizenship development?
2. To what extent does a perspective transformation from high dissonance service-learning participation, as indicated by a participant's perception of enhanced dimensions of the global citizenship construct, persist over time and influence subsequent behaviors and actions?
3. To what extent does personal experience with high socio-economic cognitive dissonance serve as a 'critical life event' leading to a turning point or personal breakthrough in regards to the phenomenon of a perspective transformation and transformative global citizenship development?
4. To what extent does connecting to and building relationships with, local people of considerably less privilege from the host marginalized socio-economic community, play a role in the persistence of a perspective transformation?

The first two research questions involve a careful systematic examination of student development outcomes. I sought to determine whether or not evidence indicated that a perspective transformation had actually occurred, and if so, did it persist over time. To address these questions, present day guided autobiographical narrative data was collected and analyzed from each study participant to investigate what happened. Research Questions 3 and 4, however, were concerned with the search for a better understanding of why and how the phenomenon of a perspective transformation might occur after participating in the UConn Cape Town study abroad program. In order to investigate these last two research questions, archived autobiographical narrative data authored during and immediately after the study abroad program was analyzed to explore how the self-reported transformed participants had critically reflected on events as they unfolded during and right after the study abroad experience.



This second level of analysis involved creating analytic categories, or conceptual buckets, for reanalyzing the data. While Chapter 4 was focused on identifying, coding and reorganizing the narrative data in order to retell and report the big picture story of what happened in Cape Town in regards to the themes of interest, the purpose of Chapter 5 is to provide a second order, more interpretive analysis of the findings. Relevant learning theory and research from the literature was used as a pedagogical lens to provide a deeper, more holistic understanding of the relationship between the student development outcomes and participation in high dissonance service-learning while studying abroad. By moving back and forth between the literature and the study participants' archived journal entries, narrated during and immediately after their study abroad experience, and the literature on learning theory, I hoped to better understand what may have happened in Cape Town. This might help explain how these perspective transformations and new global citizenship attitudes led to transformative action. The final chapter concludes with a discussion section that summarizes the implications of, and concerns with, the interpretation of the findings in regards to contributing to scholarship and informing the practice of study abroad, as well as providing some recommendations on directions for future research.

### **5.3 Analytical Category Development**

The findings presented in the previous chapter provide compelling evidence that the Cape Town study abroad program was transformative in nature for the overwhelming majority of participants. The resulting perspective transformations in turn appears to have served to foster the development of one or more dimensions of transformative global citizenship (global conscientiousness, ethnocultural empathy, and/ or commitment to social justice) in the vast majority of these students. In order to interpret what may have happened, and why and how such personal transformations occur, additional tables were created to map the findings (participant statements) for each research question to the related learning theory and/or research from the literature. The table for Analytic Category 1, was labelled *Transforming global perspectives and enhancing global citizenship*.

The study was also concerned with determining whether a perspective transformation leading to global citizenship development persisted over time. This part of the study was important as while several previous studies on high dissonance international service-learning participation had reported findings of perspective transformations during and immediately after the study abroad program took place, only two small studies (Herrmann, 2011; Kiely, 2005) were located in the literature that collected and analyzed longitudinal data. The current study not only found evidence to support the findings from these international service-learning (ISL) scholars in regards to the persistence of a perspective transformation after participating in a high dissonance ISL program, but also was able to scaffold off their work as a conceptual bridge to transformative global citizenship development.

Longitudinal data in the form of guided autobiographies was collected from the study participants, and this data indicated that the majority of the study participants (19 of 29) went on to exhibit attitudes, behaviors and actions consistent with the study's working definition of global citizenship years after the program ended. These participants directly attributed these outcomes to their participation in the Cape Town program. I labelled Analytic Category 2 as *Persisting perspective transformations and transformative global citizenship action*. The study also sought to examine whether or not high socio-economic dissonance can serve as a turning point or personal breakthrough that leads to the phenomenon of a perspective transformation resulting in global citizenship development. The majority of the participants recalled experiencing cognitive dissonance as they considered their relative socio-economic privilege alongside of the extreme poverty and lack of basic necessities that they observed firsthand during their time in the townships. I labeled Analytic Category 3 *Reconsidering ideologies, hegemonic assumptions and relative privilege after processing high socio-economic dissonance*. To help explain how cognitive dissonance might have played a role in perspective transformations, the study analyzed archived personal reflection journaling written during and immediately after the study abroad experience to see how each participant made sense of their experience as it unfolded.

Finally, the study also sought to examine the role that opportunities to personalize with, and connect to, local people might have played in the persistence and strength of a perspective transformation derived from personal experiences with high socio-economic dissonance. The students had the opportunity to participate in several relationship-building activities such as weekly community internships and weekend homestays, and this allowed them to make some deep personal connections with individuals in the host communities. I labelled Analytic Category 4 as *Personalizing and connecting to cognitive dissonance about issues of socio-economic fairness*.

#### **5.4 Analytic Category 1: Transforming global perspectives and enhancing global citizenship**

Finding 1 indicates that participating in high dissonance service-learning while studying abroad did lead to perspective transformations for a vast majority (24/29) of participants. Ashley, who participated in 2012, described in her present day autobiographical account how she remembered leaving the Cape Town program “with such a different sense of the world ....My view of the world and perspective on life has changed”. In order to make sense of how Ashley and others reported that their perspective and worldview had been transformed, I re-examined Mezirow’s theory of transformative learning. Transformative learning theory focuses on explaining how perspective transformations might occur, and Mezirow’s seminal work has been cited by hundreds of research studies over the past three decades. Therefore, the literature by Mezirow and others adult learning scholars (Brookfield, 2000; Taylor, 1997; Cranton, 2006) on transformative learning theory was examined throughout Chapter 5 to provide insight into better understanding what might have happened to Ashley and others in regards to their changing worldviews, or global perspectives.

### **5.4.1 Global Perspectives**

Chickering and Braskamp, known for their scholarship in the area of student development theory (2009) asserted that “the traditional-aged college student needs to develop and internalize a global perspective into her thinking, sense of identity, and relationships with others” (p.27). The participant data captured on Template 1 provides compelling evidence that the study abroad experience in Cape Town had a transformative impact on the global perspectives for the overwhelming majority of the participating college students. Literature from studies on study abroad outcomes (Walker & Braskamp, 2008) does indicate that college students do tend to become more globally aware and self-confident after participating in traditional studying abroad programs. However, these personal experiences have not been found to increase the participant’s level of concern for others from the host countries. Traditional programs do not appear to have much, if any, efficacy at changing an individual’s perspective.

An individual’s perspective can be thought of as a particular attitude towards, or way of regarding something, which represents a point of view. A global perspective, therefore, can be thought of as a point of view as it relates to how individuals regard different cultures and societies throughout the world. Transforming to a global perspective that aligns with global citizenship would require that individuals return home with “a broader, more critical view of experience, knowledge and learning that includes seeking to understand the links between our own lives and those of people throughout the world” (Bournemouth University, 2016, p. 1). A global perspective that includes a deeper understanding of one’s place (and their own society’s place) in a connected, interdependent world, as well as an openness to ideas from other cultures, aligns with global consciousness and ethnocultural empathy, two sub-dimensions of global citizenship as operationally defined in this study. Having a global perspective that also demonstrates an understanding of the importance of taking action to ensure social justice and equality opportunity for all citizens regardless of their global geographic location, would align with a commitment towards social justice, the third key dimension of transformative global

citizenship. The overwhelming majority of the study participants described experiencing a perspective transformation in their present day autobiographical account. Alisha described how she “changed entirely as a person”, while Shellie reported returning with “a different way in which I look at the world”, and Lucia stated that “the program shaped my worldview”. Caitlin reported that “my lens through which I see the world has been opened. The curtain which shielded me from seeing certain issues before has been removed....I have changed. Irreversibly”.

There is little doubt that how these individuals viewed the world and their place in it, their ‘global meaning perspectives’, had radically changed after they participated in the Cape Town study abroad program. For these individuals, their eyes had opened in regards to the interconnectedness of global humanity.

#### **5.4.2 Meaning perspectives --Based on Ideology (Beliefs system from socialization process)**

When we say that a perspective has changed, this refers to what is commonly described as a ‘meaning perspective’ in the adult learning literature, especially as it relates to transformative learning (Mezirow, 2000). “Meaning perspectives are, for the most part, uncritically acquired in childhood through the process of socialization” (p.3). Mezirow (1991) believed that transformative learning was actually a process of “learning through transformation of meaning schemes” where learners discovered that their original “points of view or beliefs have become dysfunctional ...experience a growing sense of the inadequacy of our old ways of seeing and understanding meaning” (p. 94). His seminal work on transformative learning (1978; 1991;1990; 2000; 2006) is useful for examining how and why the participants may have experienced perspective transformations during their study abroad experience in Cape Town. A meaning perspective refers to the prevailing set of assumptions, or ‘habits of mind’, which Mezirow asserted were developed during an individual’s formative years, often derived from their parents, schools and communities, which subsequently serves as their frame of reference as they enter adulthood.

Such frame of reference serves as the initial meaning perspective or “the structure of assumptions and expectations through which we filter sense impressions – it provides context for meaning making” (2000, p. 16). Considered as such, this frame of reference is the foundation of an individual’s ideology or “set of values, beliefs, myths, explanations, and justifications that appear self-evidently true and morally desirable” (Brookfield, 2000, p. 129). An individual’s frame of reference affects how they interpret and make sense of personal experiences. In the U.S. and throughout the western world, these meaning perspectives, or frames of reference, often lead to viewing the world from a relatively privileged standpoint, as compared to others from under-resourced communities in the developing world. Dewey’s seminal work in experiential education also stressed the importance of “assessing the grounds of one’s beliefs (1933, p. 9) and “examining our assumptions by which we have justified our convictions”. Mezirow believed that “making meaning is central to what learning is all about” (1991, p. 11). He asserts that premise reflection is central to the meaning making process in transformative learning. Premise reflection is deep, critical reflection that involves considering the larger view (Kitchenham, 2008), a process that “involves the examination of long-held presuppositions – examining the very nature, consequence, and origin of our meaning perspectives” (Taylor, 1997, p. 47). So, as interpreted through the literature related to transformative learning theory, I premise that the participants came into the program with ideas, beliefs and values (their pre-program ideology) about how the world worked (worldview or global perspective) which was derived from how they were socialized in a somewhat privileged Western world during their formative years.

“Each person breathes in an ideology as we live and grow in our society – each person takes on or takes in the prevailing set of assumptions about reality – the meaning perspective – of the particular social group that provides the immediate context for his or her socialization. Each such particular social group in turn takes on and passes on the overall hegemonic ideology of their broader society” (Kennedy, 1990, p. 100).

The institutional and common beliefs that prevail in Western society and the U.S. are powerful, making alternate ways of understanding life's reality difficult to imagine, which allows hegemonic ideologies to perpetuate (Gramsci, 1995). I premise that the participants all entered the program with such established ideologies and assumptions about social justice that underpinned their global meaning perspectives and worldviews. Andreotti (2006, p. 5) noted how this hegemonic perspective or knowledge is "partial and incomplete, constructed in our own contexts, cultures, and experiences, asserting that "we need to engage with our own and other perspectives to learn and transform our views, identities and relationships – to think otherwise".

Based on their present day narrative accounts, this pre-sojourn worldview, or global perspective, of the vast majority of participants was challenged by their personal experience participating in the UConn Cape Town study abroad program, leading to a perspective transformation.

#### **5.4.3 Global Citizenship Development**

The term global citizenship is contested in the literature, and this construct was operationally defined as transformative global citizenship with dimensions (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, commitment to social justice activism) for the purpose of this study, drawing from the literature on global citizenship advanced by social scientists and international education scholars including Nussbaum, Schulz, Davies, Banks, and Appriah-Padi. This working definition of transformative global citizenship serves as a key indicator for the development of the themes and analytical categories that were developed to group together key statements from the participant narratives for analysis and interpretation. For the global consciousness dimension, I looked for statements that indicated the participant had a greater sense of the wider world (Oxfam, 1997) and their place and role in it (Davies, 2006); an awareness of the global interconnectedness and shared fate, rights and responsibilities of citizens of the world (Nussbaum, 1997; Arneil,

2007; Appiah-Padi, 2001); and a sense of shared purpose and common humanity (Banks, 2008; Schultz, 2007).

The statements extracted from the 24 study participants who self-reported a perspective transformation provides an abundance of evidence that indicated the study abroad experience enhanced their global consciousness. Mollie from the 2011 cohort wrote about how the program “opened my eyes to so many issues that exist in world” while Joyce reported her ‘view of the world was less narrow’, and Mary “adjusted the way she looked at humanity”. This data indicates that these individuals, and most others in the study, had a significant change in the way they considered the world and their place in it. The literature on global citizenship asserts that global citizens are also more accepting of diversity and inclined towards social justice. For example, Nussbaum’s seminal work on cosmopolitans and global citizenship (1997) asserted that global citizens are “socially responsible, compassionate individuals, accepting of others and committed to global social justice” (Pietro, 2010, p. 6), concerned with making sure the world is an equitable place for all. Seeking to identify evidence of enhanced ethnocultural empathy and social justice orientation, I looked for participant narrative that indicated an enhanced level of compassion and an acceptance of, and concern for, others from diverse cultures and an enhanced commitment to social justice for all (Nussbaum, Davies, and Schultz). Key statements for the participants indicated that they became “more empathetic” (Shellie), valued other “ways of life.... and diversity so much more” (Joyce), and were concerned about “equity and fairness for all” including those “left out of the collective image” (Kasey). Mollie “took away a new perspective ....realized how messed up our world is ....what it means to live a meaningful live”.

These findings indicated that all of these 24 participants, to one extent or another, had returned home from the program with enhanced dimensions of global citizenship (Muetzelfeldt & Smith, 2002). The three dimensions of transformative global



citizenship frequently seemed to have a symbiotic relationship with each other. In her present day autobiographical account, Ally stated

I had a completely different view of the United States when I came back, and struggled for several months to deal with my new perspectives and realizations of how much progress still needed to happen for race, gender, and so much more - suddenly become aware of new problems that exist -- richer sense of the world around us and what can be done to make it better for all people (June, 2015).

This indicates that Ally now had a 'richer' sense of the interdependent nature of the world and her place in it (global consciousness); a concern for people (ethnocultural empathy); and a commitment to making progress on problems involving race and gender, making it better for all people (commitment to social justice). The narrative data from the study participants indicated that there were numerous instances where participants discussed student development outcomes that incorporated 2 or 3 of the key dimensions of transformative global citizenship in the same key statement. In Alisha's case, the ethnocultural empathy dimension was intertwined with the social justice dimension.

I think what has most changed about me is that I now have honest visceral reactions to injustice and have come to understand what true empathy can feel like. I try to be an ally in activism for the causes that I feel I should stand up for. I have spoken out in situations that make me uncomfortable even when the joke or the attack has nothing to do with my own identity. I am sensitive to what I feel is offensive and I have better outlined my own values and look everyday to see how my actions and intentions either define or deconstruct my value system (June, 2015)

Of the three dimensions, a commitment to social justice (Curry-Stevens, 2007) stood out as the one that most signified a perspective transformation of a

permanent nature had occurred because it involves taking ongoing action for social justice. Robie described how she was transformed in Cape Town to become an ally of social justice in her present day autobiographical account.

I see the world as a place full of inequality and full of those who push back against systems of inequality every day.... I see the same things everyday in Massachusetts that I did before Cape Town but now I understand and process them through the lens of a person who is pissed at our inequalities and wants to change the systems that perpetuate inequality (June, 2015).

## **5.5 Analytic Category 2: Persisting perspective transformations and development of transformative global citizens**

The work of Mezirow and other theorists of transformative learning (Taylor; Brookfield; Cranton) helps to provide a better understanding about how this perspective transformation might have occurred. This supports earlier studies (Doerr, 2011; Gaines-Hanks & Grayman, 2009; Kiely, 2002, 2004, 2005; Monard-Weissman, 2003; Parker & Dautoff, 2007; Pisano, 2007) with findings indicating that returning students had experienced notable personal change based on their qualitative data submitted during and immediately after participating in an ISL program which appeared to be more substantive in nature than student outcomes after participating in traditional study abroad experiences. However, Taylor (1997) asserts that individuals who are really transformed by a critical event should also take action to demonstrate their new perspective. The unanswered question in these studies was whether this self-reported personal change was temporary in nature, akin to cultural shock from cross-border sojourns that often wanes over time, as the sojourner falls back into the daily habits and relatively more privilege life back home.

Most of the studies on cultural shock (Adler, 1975; Kim and Ruben, 1988, Yoshikawa, 1987) asserted that cultural shock is a catalyst for change or intercultural transformation, yet these studies do not discuss the persistence of such personal

change, and whether it would lead to new attitudes, behaviors and actions without processing critical reflection in or to internalize such change. Taking action that demonstrates that a perspective transformation has persisted over time was important to many scholars of experiential (Dewey) and adult learning (Mezirow; Taylor; Lapayese). The findings related to Research Question 2 indicate that 19 of the 29 study participants took action to demonstrate their enhanced commitment to social justice years after they returned from studying abroad, which they directly attributed to their lessons learned from their time in Cape Town. In essence, they had become transformative global citizens or “someone who is aware of the wider world and their role as a world citizen; respects and values diversity; has an understanding of how the world works economically, politically, socially, culturally, technologically and environmentally; is outraged by social injustice” (Davies, 2006, p.206).

Banks (2008) also asserts “transformative global citizens take action to promote social justice” (p. 136). Robie’s commitment to social justice mentioned above was further evidenced by her accepting a teaching job in an urban school district in a tough area. She became passionate about educating underprivileged students to make a difference in the world. In Mollie’s present day autobiographical narrative account, she explained how her internship with the nurses at Beautiful Gate was the impetus for her to now spend “an average of 10-15 hours per month volunteering in health related organizations and deciding to apply to nursing school so she could have a professional career helping the sick”. For Alisha, her time in Cape Town “inspired me to change my priorities” and she moved towards addressing “injustices and inequities” by “volunteering extensively at the Women’s Center”. Davies (2006) premises that a global citizen “is willing to take action to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place” (pg. 206). For these participants, the permanent transformative mark left by their study abroad experience was evidenced by real action. Ally described how she is still actively engaged with Teach for America, decisions and action she says was “directly impacted by my time in South Africa”, while Megan felt her study abroad experience

led her to “co-found a non-profit social art project” and “increase her activism” towards social justice. It is clear that these type of outcomes indicate that the participants have gone on to take transformative global citizenship action as a direct result of their study abroad experience.

Kasey recalled how

My life is in such a different place because of Cape Town and it's all due to the lessons I learned there and the people.... the most memorable and long lasting of these issues was definitely the HIV/AIDS crisis in Cape Town. This issue alone has proved to influence my life since returning more than any other.... Cape Town was really the start of my journey with Human Rights. It inspired a lot of the choices I made career and education-wise after leaving....since graduating I work with people living with HIV/AIDS. First, at a residential home for HIV positive individuals who are at risk for homelessness and this summer I will be starting a new position through AIDS United in New Orleans doing HIV testing and prevention outreach.... I also am involved in a suicide prevention organization....I went to Cape Town expecting to be a history teacher when I graduated but the lessons I learned while abroad drastically changed that. (June, 2015)

What happened as a result of the Cape Town study abroad experience, which was the focus of Analytical Categories 1 and 2, became increasingly evident as the student outcomes were aligned with literature regarding perspective transformation and transformative global citizenship. Why and how such phenomenon occurred during the Cape Town program is the main focus of Analytical Categories 3 and 4.

## **5.6 Analytic Category 3: Reconsidering ideologies, hegemonic assumptions and relative privilege after from high levels of socio-economic cognitive dissonance**

The outcome-based descriptive findings related to Research Questions 1 and 2 demonstrate that an overwhelming majority of the study participants experienced a perspective transformation indicated by enhanced levels of global citizenship, and that this perspective transformation persisted over time for the vast majority of the participants. To better understand the role of cognitive dissonance, I moved back and forth between the literature on transformative learning and the archived documents of the 19 study participants who were found to have experienced perspective transformations leading to transformative global citizenship action. Mezirow and others (Cranton; Brookfield; Tenant) assert that the perspective transformations are usually initiated by a critical event, often described by Mezirow and other scholars of transformative learning as a 'disorienting dilemma' (Taylor, 2000).

"Perspective transformations occur in response to an externally imposed disorienting dilemma – may be caused by --- one's efforts to understand a different culture that challenges one's presuppositions. Anomalies and dilemmas of which old ways of knowing cannot make sense of become catalysts or 'trigger events' that precipitate crucial reflection and transformations". (Mezirow, 1991, pg.14)

As mentioned previously in the study, the demographic data collected (see Appendix G) indicated that all of the study participants came from middle to upper-middle income backgrounds in the U.S., which provided them substantial relative privilege as compared to the children and families living in the impoverished townships surrounding Cape Town, South Africa. It was easy to imagine that how firsthand experiences with extreme poverty or "social norms other than those to which we ascribe can also be a disorienting event" (Cranton, 2006, p. 62) had affected the participants, and why such exposure could serve as a disorienting

dilemma leading to cognitive dissonance (Festinger, 1957), evidenced by extreme psychological and emotional discomfort. Dissonance theory involves sense-making and the questioning of one's "beliefs, their environment, and their behavior- and thus try to lead lives that are (at least in their own minds) reasonable, sensible, and meaningful" (Aronson, 1997, p. 129) that can result in "attitude change process" (Elliot & Devine, 1994, p. 383). Morton and Campbell (2007) assert that cognitive dissonance represents "a temporary gap that exists between what we think we already know and a contradictory experience ....it is this moment of dissonance that drives the service-learner to question the way in which she or he previously viewed the world" (p.12). Mollie's case exemplified this, as she described how she arrived in Cape Town believing that racial issues in the city were a thing of the past and recalled being "shocked by the racial divide that still exists to this day" noting

Regarding social constructs, inequalities, and social disparities really enlightened me and inspired me to be a more conscious member of society. Things that we learned fascinated me, made me angry, made me cry - and really tested my ways of thinking and forced me to reflect from the inside out (June, 2015).

Returning to Ally, we can see that her archived reflection journal describes becoming extremely "unsettled" by the wide differences in wealth in between Cape Town proper and the disadvantaged populations who still lived in extreme poverty in the townships.

The houses got dirtier and sadder. They are all brightly colored, but trash is everywhere and the houses are extremely close together. There is graffiti everywhere and many shops in the area are little shacks. Many people are around during the day because so many are unemployed. There are stray dogs and the roofs are made of asbestos (Journal entry, February, 2012).

Her description of what she was experiencing appears to be a critical life event that triggered cognitive dissonance. Critical life events are usually unsettling incidents of significance that catch individuals by surprise which lead to them to question why it happens and seek out the root causes for the incident (Weiner, 1985). Joyce, a participant from the 2013 cohort described a similar experience in her archived reflection journal:

The disparity of wealth was so shocking.... a highway could divide a wealthy area from a township of shacks ....unsettling to be living so comfortably while knowing so many people were still suffering in poverty....One of the hardest parts of the trip was staring poverty in the face (Journal entry, 2013).

All of the participants submitting narrative data who indicated a perspective transformation had occurred as a result of their study abroad experience recalled unsettling instances of witnessing extreme poverty, and the lack of availability of basic resources such as food, sanitation or healthcare. Throughout the examination of the archived reflection journals, there was evidence of personal struggles with high levels of socio-economic dissonance in Cape Town. Other social development issues, such as the lack of resources to confront and control the spread of HIV/AIDS, were also extremely unsettling to the participants who interned in healthcare organizations in the townships.

Mollie stated

I will never forget one patient's story, a darling little girl who I checked in that morning and then sat in on her appointment with the doctor later that day. She had beautiful black braids pulled back into a ponytail, and was wearing unquestionably the cutest outfit I've seen since arriving. Her contagious smile covered up the fact that her limbs were smaller than those of some toddlers .... Claire asked her to point out which meds she was taking and how much of each she took both morning and night. I watched in awe as this 9 year old correctly pointed to her drugs and told her each of their dosages. All without hesitation. Claire then asked the girl if she knew why she was taking the

medications. The little girl looked down at her lap, was silent for about 30 seconds, and then replied, "Because I'm HIV positive." When she looked up there were tears streaming down her face. I wanted so entirely bad to jump up and go hug her and tell her everything would be okay, but instead I had to just sit there next to the doctor pretending I wasn't about to burst into tears myself (Journal entry, February, 2011).

All of the program participants went on weekend homestays in addition to being placed in volunteer internships at organizations located in the townships, and both of these experiences provided them the opportunity to engage and develop personal relationships with the locals (Andreotti, 2006). This type of firsthand experience "puts a human face on suffering, fostering care and compassion" (Cipolle, 2010, p. 41). To these students, their personal experience in Cape Town served as "a critical event or significant event in their lives" (Brookfield, 1990, p. 179) which after critical reflection ultimately led to a personal breakthrough experience, which can be described as how a person "critically reflects and analyzes the ways they are influenced by and resist the dominant or hegemonic ideology of their society" (Kennedy, p.100, in Mezirow,1990). Denizen labeled these types of personal breakthroughs as turning points or epiphanies, or "interactional moments of and experiences which leave marks on people's lives that can alter "the fundamental meaning structure in a person (1989, pg. 70). An epiphany represents significant personal change or transformation in the way an individual views their world (McDonald, 2008; Denizen, 1989). It may be that while these events or incidents were the nexus of transformation, the actual epiphany or personal breakthrough did not occur until after the significant event was processed and internalized through critical reflection. Mezirow and others asserted that critical reflection and reflective discourse about a disorienting dilemma was integral to the transformative learning process and the phenomenon of a perspective transformation (Brookfield, 2000; Daloz, 2000; Eyler & Giles, 1997; Mezirow, 2000, Rhoads, 1998; Taylor, 1998).



### **5.6.1 Critical Reflection**

In a service-learning context, critical reflection helps participants to frame their personal experience within the larger societal dynamics and power relations of the world (Boyle-Baise & Sleeter, 2000). “For a mature transformation to occur, at some point there must be conscious, critical reflections on our early assumptions about life” (Daloz, 2000, p. 113). In Shelly’s case, she critically reflected on “having a very difficult time trying to balance the appreciation for the fortune I have been given in my life with the guilt I feel at my internship”. She mentioned that she had never really thought about how privileged she was to be a citizen with certain inalienable rights, of which she was accustomed that it was clear to see were not universal. The service-learning literature indicates that the vast majority of service-learning practitioners and theorists believe that “reflection is the glue that holds service and learning together to provide educative experiences” (Eyler, Giles, & Schmiede, 1996, p. 16). It was evident throughout the participant data that critical reflection and discourse is a substantive element of the Cape Town program design. The participants were required to submit periodic essays and kept weekly online reflection journals in response to prompts from the program faculty that aligned with the human rights and social justice theme of the program. This type of reflective writing space allowed the students “to consider themselves, their actions and their service” (Mitchell, 2007, p. 109). Andreotti (2006) asserted that “the development of skills of critical engagement and reflectivity” (p. 5) were essential to critical literacy and critical global citizenship. Dewey believed that reflection referred to “assessing the grounds of one’s beliefs ....examining our assumptions by which we have justified our convictions” (1933, p. 9), which aligned with what Mezirow called premise reflection. Premise reflection involves the “origin of our meaning perspectives” and can lead to perspective transformation (Taylor, 1997, p. 47).

### **5.6.2 Critical Reflective Discourse**

Daloz (2000) asserts that reflective discourse is essential to transformative learning. The Cape Town program included frequent opportunities for written critical

reflection, such as academic classes and weekly discussion groups facilitated by the Cape Town program faculty. This provided space for ongoing reflective discourse, which Daloz defines as the “process in which we actively dialogue with others to better understand the meaning of an experience” (pg. 114). Joyce spoke about the educational value of classroom dialogue in her archived journal.

It is a constant struggle to have amazing experiences in Cape Town while being mindful of the suffering of so many people around me. It has been rewarding to discuss this issue with peers as many of us are contemplating the same ideas” (March, 2013)

This type of continuous critical reflection seems to have been an effective way of connecting the socio-economic dissonance to the hegemonic assumptions that frame ideology (Mezirow, 2000). The class discussions about social justice and human rights challenged the program participants’ prior assumptions about power and privilege. Mollie wrote how

The classes that we took regarding social constructs, inequalities, and social disparities really enlightened me and inspired me to be a more conscious member of society. Things that we learned fascinated me, made me angry, made me cry (June, 2015)

### **5.6.3 Systemic Critical Self-Reflection –Questioning Hegemonic Ideological Assumptions and Relative Power and Privilege**

Critical reflection often involves the consideration of something that happens as a single critical event, as an individual reflects back and contemplates about a disorienting dilemma to make sense of it. In these cases, however, the reflection appears to be more systemic (Mezirow, 1998) in nature, as the participants start to question the nexus of their current ideology, and better understand how it is underpinned by the dominant Western perspective. This process leads them to question their beliefs and value systems that are the basis of their presuppositions

about how the world works, and serves to contest their perspectives or worldviews. Brookfield labeled this introspective questioning as an ideology critique, or the

“Process by which people learn to recognize how uncritically accepted and unjust dominant ideologies are embedded in everyday situations and practices – critical reflection as ideology critique focuses on helping people come to an awareness of how capitalism shapes belief systems and assumptions (ideologies) that justify and maintain economic and political inequity” (Brookfield, 2000, p. 128).

People in America often come in contact with, observe and perhaps even reflect on others with less privilege, both at home and abroad. Yet, while they may be unsettled by the plight of others, most still go about their day-to-day existence without changing their overall perspective on life. Witnessing extreme poverty for an extended period of time may be an entirely different situation. This might help explain what caused the participants to reconsider their relative privilege in life compared those who are far more disadvantaged. For example, one of the participants described how she felt when the group first took a tour of one of the townships, explaining “how awful I felt, this privileged person getting out of this huge white bus in the townships with a group of other privileged white college students from America to ‘look around’ at poverty” (Alisha, June, 2015). It appears that Alisha’s prior worldview included some hegemonic assumptions or sociocultural distortions in regards to the power and privilege in a global society with an uneven distribution of resources. “Sociocultural distortions involve taking for granted belief systems that pertain to power and social relationships, especially those currently prevailing and legitimized and enforced by institutions” (Mezirow, 1990, p. 14). Alisha’s narrative data indicates systemic critical reflection (Mezirow), as she re-considers common humanity as an interdependent system in which the actions by individuals in one geographic region might affect the lives of people from other areas of the world.

The literature indicates that a perspective transformation requires a reconsideration of an individual's belief and value system, or ideology. One's ideology is derived from a socialization process, and it in turn underpins an individuals' presuppositions about life and how the world works. All of the study participants appeared to have substantial relative power and privilege compared to the individuals they spent time with in the under-resourced townships on the outskirts of Cape Town. For individuals of such backgrounds, their pre-suppositions might be described as hegemonic assumptions if they are based on the belief that all individuals have an equal opportunity to succeed in life. During their lifetime, while they most likely fully understand that the people from higher socio-economic backgrounds have systemic socio-economic advantages, they also live in a society which redistributes wealth in such a way that extreme poverty is often somewhat mitigated through interventions such as magnet schools, food stamps, college financial aid/need-based scholarships, guaranteed free public education through high school, and subsidized public healthcare. Relatively speaking, impoverished and under-resourced communities in the U.S. are a familiar part of the study participants existing frame of reference, may be much easier to deal with, and less unsettling to consider, than the unfamiliar sights of extreme poverty that typify life in townships on the outskirts of Cape Town.

If their worldviews or global perspectives were reconstituted or transformed in South Africa, one would expect their archived reflective journals to illustrate an internal struggle to deal with socio-economic cognitive dissonance that caused incongruity within their established frame of reference. Indeed, an examination of the archived journals turned up numerous instances in which participants critiqued (Brookfield, 2000) their ideology. For example, Alisha reflected on how

For the first time in my life I can feel my white flesh and I am ashamed that so little means that I have so much more... I just want to get across how very sorry I am for not understanding how privileged I have been my whole life and how that has been at the expense of others unintentionally .... I want to be

overjoyed by this experience and I am, but at the same time I keep crying  
(Journal entry, January 2013)

Alisha seems to be experiencing strong cognitive dissonance in regards to how her 'lot in life' or socio-economic well-being, may have come at the expense of others is indicative that she now is taking a systemic critical reflective approach. This process seems to have called in to question her prior assumptions about inequities in society. For example, a common hegemonic assumption in the U.S. would be that all people can be successful if they 'work hard and pull themselves up by their bootstraps'. "The subtlety of hegemony is that over time it becomes deeply embedded, part of the cultural air we breathe" (Brookfield, 2000, p. 138). In reality, many children who live in inner city America are faced with substantial obstacles in life that inhibit them from achieving this success, including racism, income inequality, inadequate healthcare, daily exposure to crime and violence, and ineffective schools. At the same time, children living in the affluent suburbs benefit from an abundance of resources and support systems. Once the transformative process was ignited by their personal experience in South Africa, the participants appeared to re-consider the socio-economic injustices back in the U.S. that they took for granted before they arrived at Cape Town.

Transformative learning experiences provide learners the space to critically reflect about cognitive dissonance and "identify the assumptions they hold dear that are actually destroying their sense of wellbeing and serving the interests of others: that is hegemonic assumptions" (Mezirow, 2000, p. 116). This triggers the process of transformative learning that can lead to a perspective transformation. Joyce, a participant in the 2013 cohort, reflected at the end of the program how she

Learned about privilege in society ....being white is a privilege whether we realize it or not. Our society is based upon capitalist ideals and a hierarchy

that keeps certain people at the bottom. Even those who don't consider themselves to be part of this privilege still reap the benefits of this type of society. Although improvements have been made, denying that it still exists does not help to eliminate the problem or make situations for others better.... I now have a deep understanding of the role of privilege and how that looks in society (May, 2013).

Again, Joyce identifies the uncritical aspects of her own hegemonic assumptions concerning an unawareness of this all while still reaping 'the benefits of this type of society'. For Brookfield (1995) this involves "questioning practices and assumptions that appear to make our lives easier" (p. 7), while Brunner (1994) describes the need to "rupture the codes" of conventional thinking (p. 34). Kasey's present day autobiographical data indicates that firsthand, immersive engagement with people of less privilege has pushed her to re-consider the unfairness of her relative privilege and commit to addressing social injustice in the future.

For my personal development, this has been an extremely important realization. It's allowed me to address my privilege, to notice injustices in my world and to start combatting unfair aspects of my community that I had previously accepted.

The combination of context around the history of social injustice in South Africa, classroom reflective dialogue, introspective journaling and meaningful service, reinforced by personal connections to those with less privilege, seems to have worked in tandem to raise consciousness about prior hegemonic assumptions about the social justice of power and privilege. The participants had come to realize that their fate may have been determined by luck and "significantly affected by their social location one's life" (Curry- Stevens, 2007, p. 49), based who their parents are rather than by their own merit. Race, framed within the apartheid legacy in South Africa, was frequently mentioned as a driver for how participants came to realize the unfairness of their own relative privilege gained from just being white.

Robie asserted that

Another thing I have learned about is white privilege. To me this was the missing piece of the puzzle when talking about the system of meritocracy. In a social anthropology class I took I learned that meritocracy was a myth, yet it didn't make sense because my Dad and his siblings had all risen from the lower class to the middle class. Learning that race is the piece of the puzzle that makes the meritocracy a myth for so many people, really made sense to me (June, 2015).

For Alisha, recognizing the systemic nature of her privilege was extremely unsettling.

I was angry with myself for not having been aware of how privileged my life is because of my white skin. I was also very guilty and ashamed that I did not know very much history about my own country's civil rights movements and have never looked into learning more for empathy's sake....I took a walk around the commons and sat in a church parking lot for a moment and started to cry pretty hard" (June, 2015)

Attaining such a critical consciousness is "difficult and often unpleasant to acknowledge that all of the good things that have happened to you are not simply the result of your hard work and talent and motivation but the result over which you have no power" (Kimmel, 2002, p. 5), and this necessitates cognitive restructuring as learners begin to realize that their relative position in society is actually not derived from "merit and deservedness" but rather "luck and happenstance". It became apparent that many of the participants had undergone a critical systemic reflection process about the fairness of their own relative privilege and power as compared to their hosts in the townships.

#### **5.6.4 Consciousness-raising: Service-learning with Social Justice Focus**

Bell asserts that service-learning, when combined with social justice education, can “develop a critical perspective and action directed towards social change” (1997, p. 14). Justice oriented service-learning programs (Doerr, 2011) are often referred to as critical service-learning. Critical service-learning theory, first conceptualized in the literature in Robert Rhoads (1997), posits that in order for service-learning experiences to be impactful for the participants, they must focus on the development of a critical consciousness through a primary focus on social justice (Rice & Pollack, 2000; Rosenberger, 2000; Rhoads, 1997; Wade, 2000). Based on the findings, I further premise that systemic critical reflection about the fairness of their own relative power and privilege was a form of conscious raising, or conscientization among participants (Freire, 1970). According to Freire, the process of conscientization involves learners questioning their sense of agency in regards to fairness of relative power and privilege in order to attain a “deepening awareness of both sociocultural reality which shapes our lives and of their capacity to transform that reality through action upon it” (1970, p. 27).

In her reflection journal during the program, Ally stated that

Today in class we were asked to reflect on our experiences so far in Cape Town. We were told to think about our expectations and compare them to what we have actually witnessed. As I look back, I realize my expectations were many of the things I witnessed here at the surface. I knew there would both be poverty and beauty. I knew I would feel sad about the way people lived and also grateful for the way I lived. I knew I would feel out of my element. I thought about all of these things as separate, like I would experience them at different times. However, as I reflect on the way I feel now, I realized that I have the ability to feel all of these things at once, something I did not plan for. I also realized that many of these things that exist at the surface have much deeper roots than I ever thought possible (February, 2012).



For Ally, the Cape Town study abroad program raised her consciousness by providing her an opportunity to “critically question her presuppositions or beliefs about oppression and social justice, as it exposed her to different perspectives and values that were contrary to her currently held point of view” (Cranton, 2006, p. 143). This type of consciousness-raising reflection involves unmasking power structures, confronting hegemony, and critiquing social ideologies (Brookfield, 2005), which may lead to the development of a critical consciousness that engages the “larger struggle to improve social conditions” (Rhoads, 1997, p. 221). Rhoads asserts that an increased understanding and commitment to addressing the institutional social injustice is needed in order to foster a perspective transformation.

Ally shared how

I had a completely different view of the United States when I came back, and struggled for several months to deal with my new perspectives and realizations of how much progress still needed to happen for race, gender, and so much more (June, 2015)

Ally's narrative date indicates that the Cape Town program might well have been an ideal social justice backdrop for developing the critical consciousness of the participants. First, the context of the Cape Town location and legacy of social injustice from apartheid that still lingered in the twenty-first century was the focus of the classroom discussions. Mitchell asserts that critical service-learning programs need to “provide exposure to issues of exclusion, marginalization and oppression to encourage action beyond service” (2007, p.110). Critical service-learning differs from traditional service-learning by focusing on developing critical consciousness of participants by emphasizing service-learning around issues of social justice. Rhoads' (1997) study differentiated between “do-gooders – students who don't have a critical understanding of the factors that lead to poverty and the critical idealists, who experience a transformation and recognize the importance of working with the oppressed as opposed to the charitable notion of giving to the needy” (p. 183),

asserting that the latter outcome takes place rarely in traditional study abroad. Typically, traditional study abroad programs does not include opportunities for the visiting students to participate in service-learning within a high dissonance environment. An effective critical service- learning program allows people to make connections between their individual experiences and social issues, and generalize from single problems to the greater social system (Mitchell, 2007).

As mentioned earlier in this chapter, the Cape Town program featured a service-learning model with built-in opportunities for critical reflection and reflexive discourse in human rights classes and field based internships located in impoverished communities. In addition, the participants went on several field trips, including visits to Robben Island, where they met with former prison guards and learned about the horrific conditions that Nelson Mandela and other political prisoners endured; the District Six Museum, where they met with former displaced black and 'colored' Cape Town residents; tours of under resourced townships; a Human Rights weekend conference; and a weekend homestay in the townships. These out of class learning activities served to fuel their critical consciousness, as they attained a better understanding of the systematic nature of apartheid. After visiting Robben Island, Alisha wrote in her reflective journal how

The sight of the hard labor camps and the small cells was enough to make your stomach turn. Being brought to these places during the first week was significant because it allowed me to engage in deeper and more meaningful conversations with the locals of the Townships and people who I encountered during my stay (Journal entry, February, 2013).

Observing everyday life in the townships was also a consciousness-raising experience for Alisha as she wrote about her realization that

The pictures I had been taking were of human experiences and that by taking a picture of them and claiming them as a memory of my trip – a mere trinket

to take home, I was diminishing their lived experiences by imagining my own narrative instead of finding out the truth behind theirs. I vowed on this day to become more aware of my own white privilege, I allowed that I had much to learn but no longer could claim ignorant, and I hoped that this study abroad experience would teach me how to have difficult and often emotional conversations about race, discrimination, and human experiences. I would say that this day was significant because it pushed me out of my comfort zone as a tourist and into the realm of a learner and co-educator in Cape Town” (Journal entry, March, 2013)

It seems likely that Alisha's reconsideration of her own privilege represents a personal breakthrough facilitating her perspective transformation. Bell (1997) asserts

“In order for those people to make change, a moment of transformation has to take place whereby they gain a greater understanding of their privilege, be motivated to create change and learn how to effectively do so. I propose that the change come about through the dissonance that occurs during a social justice-oriented, critical service-learning experience” (p. 13).

Rosenberger (2000) also asserts that critical consciousness is gained primarily by students of a privileged standpoint. By exposing the participants to the realities of apartheid, the program provided context for discussions on systematic social injustice and reinforced the relative privilege of the UConn students, leading to thought-provoking dialogue with their peers. After visiting the District Six Museum, Caitlin reflected how

The Apartheid Museum made me think about activism. Immersed in academia, it is easy for me to slip into a helpless “what can we do?” mindset. Governments are so bureaucratic, every official is corrupt, and they designed the system so that we cannot change it, so what is the point of trying? However, analyzing and studying the history of the anti-apartheid struggle

always changes my mind. Not only did these citizens have a government that was not responsive to them, but it was outright attacking them. Still, they overcame the system. This victory inspires me to go back to America and work. Yes, it will not be easy. Yes, so many Americans, especially University students, are apathetic. Yes, the government is huge, racist, sexist, classist, and unresponsive. The important point to recognize is that there have been worse situations. Black South Africans were in a worse situation. Still, they fought and won. There is still hope for change in America, in society, because there have been just victories. Movements with positive, fair, equalitarian, honorable missions have emerged victorious. (March, 2010)

It is apparent that Caitlin sees the dramatic social change in South Africa after Apartheid as proof of concept that such change is possible in the United States. Her narrative, however, indicates that she has taken somewhat of a simplistic analysis from a Western-oriented perspective about a topic that is extremely nuanced. However, regardless of the merit (or lack of merit) of her argument, her firsthand exposure to those of less privilege has 'lit a fire' to fight for social justice back at home. The field trips helped the students better understand and tie the lessons learned back to the root causes of the social injustice (Ginwright & Cammarotta, 2002). The archived journal entries provided ample evidence that the participants maintained a keen focus on social justice throughout the program.

"The concepts and issues of identity, oppression, power, and privilege raised through dialogue in the classroom in tandem with the action of meaningful service in the local community and reflection on both offers the praxis that can lead to the perspective and action desired from students in developing commitments to social justice" (Mitchell, 2007, p. 109).

The social justice focus helped foster the critical consciousness as the participants went from being unsettled by witnessing instances of social injustice, to gaining an understanding of how these situations are interconnected to issues of

fairness and the consideration of a global common humanity. Critical service-learning not only challenges students to ask why, but supports the students understanding the causes of injustice, and encourages students to see themselves as agents of social change (Rhoads, 1997; Wade, 2000; Butin, 2007) along with the questioning around the fairness of one's own relative privilege along with "the distribution of power in society" (Mitchell, 2007, p. 101). Relative privilege awareness is substantially reinforced through personal relationships with those of less privilege.

"Understanding the significance that circumstances, which are often beyond one's control, play in people's lives allows students to see how misfortunes could befall anyone. As students create relationships with diverse people, it opens avenues of caring, empathy (the ability to understand and share another's feelings and compassions), a general sense of responsibility, and make commitments. Reflection promotes a sense of interconnectedness between people and a will to act to relieve suffering" (Cipolle, 2010, p. 42).

## **5.7 Analytical Category 4: Personal connections with individuals of considerably less privilege**

It is logical to assume that the developing relationships with individuals with considerably less privilege can amplify the psychological emotional discomfort. The participants all had the chance to immerse themselves within the townships surrounding Cape Town. This enabled them to connect and empathize, or develop caring (Noddings, 2005 ), from their concern for the well-being (King, 2004) of the people in the townships where the internships and homestays were located. The participants were engaged with members of the host communities in a variety of ways, from weekend homestays to semester-long community internships and individual activist projects. Service-learning researchers have indicated that frequent direct engagement with individuals in host communities is associated with self-reports of student participants experiencing a perspective transformation (Kiely, 2005; Eyler and Giles, 1997; Rhoads, 1997). This process of familiarization allows the participants to identify more closely with the perspectives of individuals" in the

townships and “critically reflect upon their own prior assumptions, beliefs, behaviors” (King, p.132). Reading about social and economic injustices in a book, or discussing this abstractly in a class, can make one aware of and perhaps uncomfortable with these type of social injustices. Observing extreme poverty firsthand by driving through an impoverished community with deplorable conditions, or visiting museums focused on the history of apartheid, can definitely unsettle Westerners and cause high levels of cognitive dissonance. While activities like short bus tours through impoverished townships can be akin to educational voyeurism or cultural tourism (Rizvi, 2003) that leads to some initial short term discomfort, Kiely asserts that “high-intensity levels of dissonance create permanent markers in student frames of reference” (Kiely, 2005), and this frame of reference underpins their ideology. However, most social scientists would agree that the type of cognitive restructuring that is needed to make someone abandon their ideology necessitates a substantial jolt to one’s critical consciousness (Curry-Stevens, 2007).

Edward Taylor recognized the importance of relationships in the perspective transformation process. His meta-study of 39 studies on transformative learning and reported that “more studies referred to the significance of relationships in a perspective transformation than any other finding in the review” (1997, p.10). I premise that deep socio-economic cognitive dissonance, the kind that can serve as a turning point and lead to an epiphany or personal breakthrough and transform deeply rooted meaning perspectives and belief systems, relies on an individual’s ability to make personal and lasting connections with those who are provided less privilege and social justice.

“Working with people from different ethnic or racial backgrounds, people living in poverty ....initiates a student’s exploration of difference, similarity, and diversity within inclusiveness. Students come to see people as individuals with their own stories, rather than statistics and stereotypes. Through these experiences, students recognize other ways of living and thinking, which encourages them to be more open-minded and to see the world from other perspective” (Cipolle, 2010, p. 41)

Both Kiely (2005) and Daloz (2000) indicate that opportunities for the participants to make personal connections with the individuals who lived in such conditions, may serve as an accelerant to fuel the questioning of their prior meaning perspectives. Kiely's study (2005) of students volunteering in Nicaragua described how

"Interacting with people who are suffering from a variety of social problems, students no longer see poverty as an abstract and detached image viewed on television. Rather, poverty is connected to real people with names, faces, and hearts. The struggle of Nicaraguans who are surviving on very little food, money, shelter, and clean water is felt viscerally and internalized by each study participant in a unique manner" ( p.9)

The UConn students submitted data in their archived reflection journals about their homestays and the community internships that evidence such attachments or relationships, and Chapter 4 indeed presents an abundance of evidence (see Template 5) that supports the contention that the homestays and community internships played a key role in transformative nature of the program. For example, in regards to her homestay, Robie's archived reflection journal recalled

The family I stayed with took me in with so much love and kindness that I found my heart aching for the family I have back home. I learned a few really valuable lessons from the people I stayed with. The one that still sticks out most in my mind is that no matter how much or how little you have, you should always share whatever you can. You don't need to have a mansion and a yacht to welcome people into your home and make them feel as if they have a second family. The people I stayed with worked as much, and hard as they could because they pay every month to send their two amazing children to school.... what extra they do have they use to help and welcome others into their lives (Journal entry, April, 2012).

As well as her internship experience at the Christel House

I have made such strong connections with my students. They've made me laugh and cry. One student today said, "You've become part of the family: part of the Christel House Family." I was so touched by that one simple phrase that was said as casually as you can imagine: As if it was an unquestionable fact. I could only smile, I was so speechless. I haven't felt like an outsider since my first week. Throughout the entire day I've been trying not to break down in tears. I actually had to leave the classroom at one point because I just felt so overwhelmed by my feelings. I knew that I would be upset, but this is different. I resigned myself to the fact that I would be leaving in the middle of the school year a long time ago, but now I'm having trouble with the fact that for a lot of the students, I may never talk to them again. I won't have to answer a hundred questions about my life, nor will I get to ask them thousands of questions about theirs. Each one of them was a huge part of my Cape Town experience, and I learned as much from them as they may have learned from me. (Journal entry, May 2012)

What Robie is describing is what Daloz (2000) calls "constructive engagement with otherness or a strong attachment with someone previously viewed as other than themselves" (p. 110). This personal experience at the internship appears to have led to a strong empathetic bond with her students and served to deepen her connection to the high level of socio-economic dissonance, "Engagement with otherness plays a key role in transformation" (pg. 112). Kiely's longitudinal study (2005) of students who participated in service-learning in Nicaragua indicated that connecting to others can serve to intensify the impact of cognitive dissonance. Kiely concluded that while low levels of dissonance may cause temporary anxiety or psychological discomfort, its high intensity dissonance that contributes to perspective transformations, especially when it involves extreme poverty. For this current study, Joyce (2013) shared how "it breaks my heart knowing that these children often struggle so much



for reasons beyond their control. The students have been teaching me so much about themselves, the world, and myself “(Journal entry, February, 2013).

Several months later as Joyce was preparing to leave Cape Town and return to the United States she described her feelings towards the children she had worked with during the semester long internship.

I arrived at CMES and then went to the Homestead in Khayelitsha. When I walked through the door, immediately the boys came running up to me and gave me hugs and colored pages with stickers on them. We didn't do any lessons for my last day and I was able to spend time with each of the seven boys. We played games, sang songs, recorded videos, handed out cards to one other, and ate sweets. I will cherish the photos, cards, and memories that I have teaching at the Homestead forever. The boys brought so much joy to my days interning and I know I will never forget them ....they now hold a place in my heart (Journal entry, April, 2013).

Over and over the participant narratives as documented throughout the study abroad provided ample evidence of how their internships helped them to identify and empathize with the people who lived and worked in the under resourced townships. Alisha described the strong personal bond she developed with her students earlier in Chapter 4. Ally described how she had

Fallen in love with Ocean View.... a community of people who were removed from their homes during Apartheid and placed in this area. Some are the sons and daughters of the people who were forced to leave, others experienced it themselves. The area is not a place you would dream of staying, and has its problems with drugs and poverty ....but it is a community full of love and personality. There are hard times but so many good people that welcomed us with open arms into their lives and made us feel like we had been there all along (Journal entry, March 2012).

These reflective statements narrated during the study abroad experience provide a glimpse of how the participants had the opportunity to build caring relationships with the people involved in the disorienting dilemma, resulting in a deepening of their struggle with cognitive dissonance. This aligns with the finding of that service-learning programs that provide multiple opportunities for direct interaction with diverse community members is a strong predictor of students' perspective transformation (Eyle & Giles, 1999). Rhoads's research (1997) indicated that students who work with resource-poor individuals "were more apt to personalize their social concerns and thus more willing to become involved in work for social change" (p. 7).

#### **5.7.1 Readjustment issues**

The participant archived reflective journals indicated that the perspective transformation process of challenging one's prior beliefs and values could cause significant angst. Mezirow (1995) asserted that transformative learning "which may involve a reassessment of one's self-concept, as is often the case in perspective transformation, is threatening, emotionally charged, and extremely difficult" (p. 48). Many of the participants described how they struggled with their personal change when arriving back home in the U.S. Alisha described how her "return to America has challenged me" as she "struggled with having conversation with people I love dearly" including "often argumentative conversations about gender, sexuality, race, discrimination, police brutality, the confederate flag ...sometimes I feel alienated within my own family".

Kasey remembered how she became

Frustrated quickly when I couldn't unlearn the things I had found in my semester away. It feels like such a short time, but I noticed inequality in my

everyday life like I never had before. My family began to think I was over sensitive or brainwashed by my liberal classes (June, 2015).

Kiely's study (2004) also found that students had trouble discussing the difficulties and social injustices they encountered overseas, and "experienced tensions between their desires for a more just society while they live and participate in a consumer driven society" (p.15). This phenomenon is often labelled 'reverse cultural shock', and it can be more difficult to deal with than the original cultural shock. The shock of cross-cultural adjustment is, however, essential for personal growth and transformation (Adler, 1975). Ally described how

When I came home I was a little lost. I felt like I couldn't relate to my old friends as much, they cared about things I didn't really care about any more. I was also surprised (and I still am surprised) by how little I wanted to talk about the experience. It felt and still feels very personal, and to talk about it so casually trivializes it a bit in my mind (June, 2015)

In her archived journal submitted after she returned home Ally wrote that "culture shock is real and intense and hard" as she had dinner with some members of her family.

I do not know how it started, but we had a debate about life circumstances. It got a bit heavy, and we argued over whether people try or expect the government and others to take care of them. One of the members in my family believed that those in tough life circumstances remained in that by choice and by not stepping up and doing something with their lives or standing together, particularly those who were black. I felt like I was stabbed in the chest. My thoughts flashed to every single person I met in Cape Town

who had been dealt very hard circumstances that gave everything they had to make other people's lives better. It struck me to my very core and the tears swelled up in my eyes almost instantly (May, 2012)

Mollie concurred, sharing that

My transition back into society in the United States was not very easy. One day shortly after I returned home my dad asked me to mow the lawn. I agreed, and went outside to do the chore. As I was mowing, I started thinking about the idea of even having a lawn to mow - and how the majority of the world and especially the people I had spent the semester interacting with, probably didn't even know that such a chore existed. By the time I was done mowing the lawn, I was in tears from thinking about unfair the world is in general. When I went inside, my dad asked what was wrong and I could only speak to how unfair I found it that we had 5 bathrooms and a lawn to mow when people that I had met and spent time with didn't even have running water. As illustrated, transitioning back into the culture I had left behind was not easy (June, 2015).

Herrmann's (2011) study of 6 students participating in service-learning in Vietnam reported findings that indicated half of the students also struggled with re-entry issues as they considered their firsthand exposure to the human toll and environmental devastation that resulted from the use of Agent Orange chemicals by the U.S. during the Vietnam War. For the participants in her study, their issues with re-entry soon dissipated as they successfully dealt with the effects of their perspective transformation, what Hermann described "holding on to transformation" (p.289). For the current study, this was true for the majority of the participants, although the findings indicated two outlier cases that are discussed in the following section in which readjustment to life back in the U.S. was more difficult.

### **5.7.2 Lingering negative effects from personalizing high socio-economic dissonance abroad**

As mentioned in Chapter 4, the study findings indicate that the Cape Town program was a positive personal development experience for an overwhelming majority of the participants. However, at least two participants had mixed student development outcomes, as they struggled with the guilt and shame associated with their relative power and privilege after witnessing the socio-economic plights of those they had encountered and gotten to know in the townships. Kiely's study (2004) found that many of the student participants experienced "tremendous difficulty adjusting to mainstream and taken for granted aspects of cultural life in the U.S. such as individualism, excessive consumerism and materialism" (2004, p. 6). As mentioned in Chapter 4, Megan recalled experiencing post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) type symptoms and months of emotional distress after returning to America, Mary described how

I couldn't eat meat when I got home because of the way I had seen meat being sold in South Africa. I had PTSD from seeing this pile of meat near the train station I passed every day on my way to work and the woman that stood there all day in the sun swatting the flies away. I got over this, but it took a month or two. Also, when I got home I tore apart my entire room and disposed of more than half of its contents. I felt claustrophobic in a space that had once been my only solace. I no longer wanted pointless belongings and with graduation coming up I was disgusted at the thought of both giving and receiving pointless gifts (June 15, 2015).

Understanding the role of guilt in the transformative learning process is nuanced at best. It appears that guilt is integral to fostering perspective transformations around hegemonic assumptions and relative privilege. "Guilt has a powerful effect....sense of complicity with a moral wrong .... we are not so sure how transformation of consciousness can occur without the existence of guilt" (Allen & Rossatto, 2009, p. 177). While guilt may serve to underpin perspective

transformations, Brookfield (1994) believes that such a perspective transformation via the transformative learning process can operate as a double-edged sword which can also lead to a disabling outcome. Andreotti (2006) also identified guilt and internal conflict as a potential problem (p. 4). Curry-Stevens (2003, 2007) asserts that “the significance of this transformative transition can be life-shattering for the privileged learner who needs to re-evaluate and re-configure their cognitive appreciation for his/her life....for the economically privileged, the transition needs to often recognize the exploitation that led to their family’s accumulation of wealth .... They will likely be less comfortable in their own skin” (p.4). She later recommends that educators need to “help keep learners away from the ‘tipping point’ of guilt where they will be unlikely to take action” (2007, p. 42).

## **6.0 Discussion**

### **6.1 Purpose of the Study Revisited**

The purpose of this study on a sample of former college students is to examine the impact of participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad. It is hoped that a better understanding of the nature and persistence of any perspective transformation that occurred, as indicated by changes in global perspectives (worldviews) and enhanced global citizenship, would also shed some light as to how and why this phenomenon occurs. I originally assumed that many of the participants in the study might not experience prolonged personal change from participating in the Cape Town program. My original thinking was that since the participants had self-selected to participate in such a high dissonance service-learning program abroad located in the developing world, they might already be altruistic in nature and therefore less apt to experience a perspective transformation. However, while this did prove to be true for several of the study participants, the study found that the high socio-economic dissonance nature of the program, supported by the human rights classes and opportunities for constructive engagement with locals of considerably less privilege, did lead to a perspective transformation and global citizenship development for the overwhelming majority of the participants.

### **6.2 Discussion and Conclusions**

The findings in Chapter 4 indicated while all 29 participants attributed some level of personal change to the Cape Town program, five participants did not believe that the program led to a perspective transformation. What happened to these participants remains an open question. I premise that either their prior life experiences, or their pre-program disposition towards change, may have affected their level of change readiness and limited the potential transformative impact of participating in the program. For example, individuals who had already participated in similar programs and made progress on the road towards transformative global citizenship may not be motivated or see the need to change. This includes Susan,

who stated that she “was not struck with many aha moments as many of my classmates were, because I had reached those moments beforehand”. Another reason might be that not all individuals are necessarily adaptable or open to new experiences, either because they are not so inclined or really don’t like being outside of their comfort zone. Anthony asserts that he was now more aware of gender inequalities, but still did not “really have too much time for involvement” in pursuing altruistic or social justice activities after he arrived back in America.

19 of the 24 study participants who felt they had experienced a perspective transformation also demonstrated the long-term impact of this personally transformative experience as they went on to take action to improve the lives of others through social justice activism and by pursuing professional careers and volunteer service in areas such as education, public health and human rights, years after they participated in the program. All of these same 19 individuals attributed this subsequent transformative action directly to their participation in the Cape Town study abroad program. Five of these 24 participants, however, submitted narrative data that indicated that a perspective transformation towards global citizenship development had occurred, but this phenomenon did not appear to persist over time or lead to subsequent transformative action towards social justice. I premise that individuals experience critical life events differently, as ideologies, frames of reference, and affective development are nuanced in nature. People are different and student development outcomes should not expect to be the same for all. It may be that there are degrees of global citizenship development, ranging from changes in attitudes to taking transformative action.

Global citizenship development might be better conceived as occurring on a spectrum, impacted by interpersonal characteristics and external environmental intervening factors that serve to mitigate or accelerate the impact of each individual’s personal experience abroad. In addition to levels of change readiness, this might include factors such as self-efficacy, internal locus of control, personal resiliency,



and the presence or absence support systems back in the U.S. Any one or a combination of several of these factors may play a role in how effective transformative learning experiences are processed. It is one thing to change your mind, and another to change your behavior and actually take action.

The findings indicate that the efficacy of a high dissonance service-learning abroad program in fostering a perspective transformation may depend on several factors. First, would be sufficient space and time for faculty-mediated critical reflection and reflective discourse. Second, the service-learning field activities need to have a social justice focus. Third, the program needs to provide the opportunity for immersive constructive engagement with locals of less privilege. The final factor involves the participant's readiness to psychologically and emotionally deal with high levels of socio-economic dissonance, which is apt to challenge their deep-rooted ideologies. Readjustment from high dissonance experiences after returning home can be difficult.

Personal resilience involves the ability to successfully adapt to adversity (Zautra, Hall, & Murray, 2010). Low levels of neuroticism and high levels of extraversion and openness are associated with resilient outcomes (Tugade & Fredrickson, 2004). The majority of these students told stories of their struggle in dealing with guilt and sometimes even shame of their relative power and privilege as they re-entered the U.S. and adjusted to the 'creature comforts' that typify life in most middle class Western societies. While the overwhelming majority of these participants reported that their readjustment issues diminished over time, two of the study participants did report negative impacts such as PTSD-type feelings and behaviors on re-entry to the U.S. that continued to linger over time. While these might be outlier cases, it is clear that program administrators need to be aware of these type of impacts as they relate to program participant selection, orientation, participant monitoring, debrief and follow-up. Crabtree recommends that follow-up support can help such participants to develop "the ability to help them process their

cultural shock and its reverberation in their attitudes about the United States” (2008, p. 5) while Allen and Rossatto (2009) suggest creating “affinity groups where feelings of guilt can be shared, discussed and transformed” (p.177). Facilitators should consider increasing their efforts to foresee and mitigate these negative effects, from initial screenings to assess student readiness for change and personal resilience, to ongoing facilitator support during the program, and robust re-entry training upon return to the U.S. (Crabtree, 2008).

A perspective transformation that leads to transformative global citizenship development involves a high degree of personal change. If this is the primary long-term goal of the program, study abroad practitioners would benefit from conceptualizing and articulating a theory of change to guide their program planning and related activities abroad. This framework would help them work backwards to map and align the desired student development outcomes of transformative global citizenship development with the key program activities (pre-departure orientation, participant assessments, classroom discussions, critical reflection journaling, community stakeholder engagement in planning critical service-learning experience, program debrief, re-entry action planning and follow-up). This approach can also provide them the opportunity to identify and mitigate potential issues (change readiness, ‘othering’ locals, reverse cultural shock, etc.) that can present barriers to personal change.

### **6.3 Significance of the Study**

In recent years, colleges and universities throughout the U.S. have been touting their efforts in creating global citizens. Many of these institutions have been somewhat vague as to what exactly they mean by global citizenship. The problem with the lack of consensus in terms of definition of global citizenship is that educators will not be able to intentionally design an effective global citizenship learning process, nor evaluate the efficacy of their programs, without a better understanding of the student development outcomes that represent global citizenship development.

Based on the review of the literature, the study was able to address the ambiguity around the term global citizenship by conceptualizing an operational definition, for the purpose of the study, for the type of 'global citizenship' that resulted in transformative action. I defined this as transformative global citizenship. This operational definition incorporated three key dimensions (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, and a commitment to act towards social justice) as the essential student development outcomes. This definition was aligned with the desired student development outcomes often cited by numerous U.S. universities (see Chapter 1). Operationalizing the definition allowed me to extract key statements from the study participants' present-day narratives as they related to these outcomes, and then work backwards through their archived personal narratives to search for an explanation for what may have caused their self-reported perspective transformation.

While many universities in the U.S. call for their students to become more globally conscious, more understanding and accepting of diversity, and committed to making the world a better place for all, they rarely provide any pedagogical guidance on how and why these student development outcomes might occur. It is almost as if they expect that by merely taking classes and graduating from their institution, through some sort of informal learning process, they will automatically become global citizens. Some of these same universities assert that their study abroad programs are the most appropriate vehicle for developing global citizenship in college student sojourners, yet little evidence exists to support how this phenomenon might occur in their traditional study abroad programs.

The study has provided both theoretical and field-based evidence that the type of perspective transformation that can facilitate global citizenship development, leading to transformative action for positive social change, will not occur in a pedagogical vacuum. It most likely requires that students internalize, through critical reflection and reflective discourse, high levels of socio-economic dissonance.

Cognitive dissonance that is powerful enough to lead individuals to reconsider their existing ideology (hegemonic assumptions, beliefs, values) and the societal inequity of their relative power and privilege. I assert that participating traditional study abroad programs located in West Europe and other similar Western societies, which do not immerse and constructively engage students with individuals and communities of less privilege, nor provide opportunities for service-learning and critical reflection around the systemic nature of global social injustice, will have little impact on developing global citizens. At least not the type of global citizens that go on to take transformative action. This study has made a significant contribution to the practice of study abroad by theoretically demonstrating that traditional study abroad will not in itself necessarily support the development of global citizenship that is transformative in nature; and by providing a roadmap to intentionally designing an alternative approach based on theories of transformative learning and critical service-learning.

#### **6.4 Contribution to Theory**

The literature indicated the need for additional longitudinal studies to evaluate the persistence of self-reported perspective transformations from participating in international service-learning programs (Kiely, 2005). “That there are very little longitudinal research efforts examining the process of transformation in service-learning should be a great concern to the service-learning community” (p. 12). Kiely also asserted that a study that “focused on the learning link between individual perspective transformation and social action ....would contribute significantly to advancing the forms and processes of transformational learning and other forms of ISL” (2011, p. 264). Hermann’s (2011) longitudinal study of six students who experienced similar perspective transformations while participating in a high dissonance service-learning program abroad also suggested that “new research could make a greater contribution to the established literature by using a larger sample, extending the research to a more longitudinal focus” (p. 291).

The longitudinal nature of this research on 29 students, which focuses on explaining the nature and persistence of perspective transformations from study abroad, addresses Kiely and Hermann's calls for additional larger studies on this phenomenon. The current study provides a theoretical bridge between theories on critical service-learning and social justice education, to student development outcomes of transformative global citizenship through a transformative learning process, as it presents a new conceptual framework for transformative service-learning abroad. The study initially investigated present day autobiographies that were narrated one or more years after the study abroad experience ended, in order to identify student development outcomes aligned with transformative global citizenship. The multi-phase data analysis process then used archived personal reflection journals, as authored by the participants during and immediately after the study abroad experience, to extract key statements aligned with transformative learning and critical service-learning theory. The findings identified numerous instances within the narratives in which the participants described high socio-economic dissonance that led them to critically reflect on the existing hegemonic assumptions or socio-distortions that framed their personal ideology, especially as it relates to their own relative privilege and power in an unequal global society. Finally, the study presented findings that connect individual perspective transformations attributed to their study abroad experience, to subsequent action towards making the world a better place.

The findings related to the archived narratives indicate that academic classes featuring reflective discourse on social justice and human rights, especially put into context of the history and legacy of the systematic and institutionalized nature of socio-economic injustice in South Africa, helped students to place the dissonance within a broader, global context. For the majority of students, this led to a disorienting dilemma, which triggered a transformative learning process and resulted in a perspective transformation. The study demonstrates the importance of immersive and constructive engagement with others of less privilege, and the use of a supportive, mediated learning environment which addresses the systematic nature of

social injustice, while providing safe spaces for processing and coping with deep emotional feelings such as guilt and shame that often accompany high levels of cognitive dissonance.

The overall theoretical implication of the study is that transformative global citizenship is what happened to the majority of the participants in the study. Transformative learning theory helps better understand the process, or how it happened, and critical service-learning theory, by incorporating concepts of social justice and critical consciousness, helps better understand why and how it happened. As mentioned earlier in the literature review, recent scholars (Mitchell, Pompa, Marullo, Rosenberger) have built off of the vast existing literature on service-learning and critical theory, to provide research on the concept of critical service-learning, or service-learning with a social justice focus. Others have integrated theories of transformative learning to define a process that explains how critical service-learning can lead to perspective transformations, and integrated into international critical service-learning programs (ISL) which may or may not persist over time. This study demonstrates how these learning theories can create a theoretical bridge to establishing *transformative service-learning abroad* as a possible new reconceived 'pedagogy for the privileged' that might facilitate transformative global citizenship development in college students that can persist over time and lead to transformative action. By re-conceptualizing the definition of global citizenship into an action-oriented framework (transformative global citizenship), this investigation takes the scholarship of Nussbaum, Oxfam, Schultz, and Davies on global citizenship from being an abstract theoretical framework to a reflective praxis in the field.

## **6.5 Contribution to Informing the Practice of Study Abroad**

The literature indicates that the ideal practice for fostering transformative learning is theory-based, with little support from empirical research (Taylor, 1997). The findings of this systematic qualitative study, which include students experiencing

a perspective transformation and taking transformative action after going through a transformative learning process, provides some empirical evidence in support of the practical application of the theory of transformative learning. This study has asserted traditional study abroad will not in itself develop global citizenship that is transformative in nature. These types of programs do not provide an environment with high socio-economic dissonance that challenges previously held ideologies, hegemonic assumptions and belief systems, nor opportunities for constructive engagement with those of less privilege. Without high levels of socio-economic dissonance, the students have no real reason to question and reconsider the fairness of their relative power and privilege. No disorienting dilemma to ignite the transformative learning process that leads a persistent perspective transformation and transformative action.

As mentioned earlier, the vast majority of traditional study abroad programs that U.S. college students typically participate in do not include opportunities for service-learning. Even for those that do, the literature suggests that while students participating in such programs might experience some personal change, such as greater tolerance, stronger leadership skills, and advanced critical thinking skills (Mitchell, 2008), they are apt to be transformative in nature. They are not designed to direct action towards the alleviation of structural inequities (Hermann, 280) or promote the reflective practice that considers the social, political, historical or cultural contexts in the areas served. As such, “they are limited in their ability to contribute to individual transformation or social transformation” (Herrmann, p. 280). The findings provide evidence that intentionally designed and instructor-mediated high dissonance service-learning experiences abroad can lead to personal transformative action that supports positive social transformation.

In addition, it is evident that higher education institutions need to take steps to institutionalize what outcomes they are seeking in their global citizenship programs.

“A careful examination of what theoretical approach and a pedagogical intent global citizenship programs adopt would thus reveal what kind of ‘global

citizens' higher education institutions aim to produce and what implications these approaches may have for social justice and equity”  
( Aktas et al, 2017, p.17)

This study is important on a practical level on several fronts. American universities send approximately 300,000 students overseas every year, costing institutions, students, and their families over \$2 billion dollars, with far less than 1% of these students participating in what the study suggests is transformative service-learning abroad. It seems clear that the typical well-intentioned study abroad semester sojourn to London, Paris or Florence is not going to lead student participants to confront their hegemonic assumptions about their own relative power and privilege. It is doubtful that such a study abroad experience, without a justice focused service-learning approach that includes constructive engagement with those of substantially less privilege within a context of systematic socio-economic injustice, will foster a perspective transformation leading to transformative global citizen action. Transformative global citizens are the type of individuals that higher education institutions desire to graduate, corporations and organizations seek to employ, and nations look to lead. This may be especially true in the 21st century, where efforts promoting greater global cooperation and mutual understandings are being met by increased calls for nationalism, religious profiling, and anti-immigration public policies throughout Europe and America due to the fear of global terrorism and economic disruption. This has become even more evident over the past year with the Brexit vote in the UK, the contentious 2016 Presidential election in the U.S., and the emergence of increasingly nationalistic worldviews and nativism in America and numerous countries throughout Western Europe.

The term transformative global citizens may be a misnomer for these students as most of the participants took action locally, in their home communities, rather than across the globe. I assert, however, that such local action is the foundation from which global change occurs. In reality, most individuals are not able to take citizenship action that is necessarily global in nature. The study has shown that such transformative global experiences fosters a ‘think global, act local’ mentality in which



the participants can consider the wellbeing of common humanity while taking action wherever they are able in order to make the world a better place wherever they can (Noddings, 2005). The internet, through social media and online communities of practice, may serve to erase geographic boundaries and link local action to global social change.

The use of archived narrative data to help explain how the study participants made sense of a high dissonance personal experience at the time was intentional. Since the current autobiographical accounts indicate that the overwhelming majority of the participants believe that this experience was transformational, the multi-phased data analysis used a reverse-engineering process; one that started with the student development outcomes (effect) and worked backwards to identify the cause. The archived narrative data helped to deconstruct the elements that the participants attributed to be the root causes (or key components) from which their perspective transformation was built. This makes a significant contribution to the practice of studying abroad as it provides a roadmap that can allow study abroad administrators and educators to intentionally design study abroad programs to foster global citizenship development that is transformative in nature. This includes adding program elements such as constructive engagement (service-learning and or homestays) with individuals and in communities of less privilege; formal and informal academic activities that include critical premise reflection and reflective discourse about the systemic nature and root cause of social injustice; and ongoing support to assist students to deal with emotions such as guilt and/or shame as they reconsider their ideologies and questions the fairness of their own relative power and privilege.

## **6.6 Issues regarding generalizing the findings of the study**

The use of archived personal narrative data that was submitted years before the study, to triangulate and help better understand present-day data, is not typical of a longitudinal study process. Longitudinal studies usually involve a researcher or research team collecting primary data before, during and after an intervention. The

secondary nature of the data collected for the archived reflection journals that did not allow for the collection of additional pre-program data from the study participants using validated assessment instruments is also an issue. For example, in addition to using one or more of a variety of outcome specific assessment instruments (global citizenship, empathy, global perspectives, emotional intelligence for pre and post-testing), the longitudinal study might have benefitted by collecting data from validated personality or change readiness assessments. There was, however, a positive side to examining archived narrative reflection journals. The study participants submitted this narrative reflective data without knowing at the time it was being submitted that it would be used for a future study. This may have minimized the chance that this data was prone to subject 'impression bias' at the time they reflected on their personal experiences abroad.

Another problem with generalizing the data from the study might be the fact that the phenomenon in question was a perspective transformation, a term that is somewhat ambiguous at best. Kegan (2000) asserts that the definition of a perspective transformation "has become so diluted that what once was described a profound shift in consciousness, frame of reference or worldview now seems to refer to any kind of change or process" (p. 47). Taylor (2000) agrees, stating that "despite the abundances of studies looking at change in a frame of reference, it is still far from clear what warrants a perspective transformation" (p. 292). While the study attempted to address this by relying on an operational definition of a perspective transformation as it related to the body of literature on transformative learning as advanced by Mezirow et al, working with such an ambiguous term is challenging at best.

## **6.7 Legitimate Challenges to the Study**

The intent of the study was to ascertain whether or not high dissonance service-learning experiences may be personally transformative in nature, developing college student participants into transformative global citizens who will go on to take

action to make the world a better place. As such, the study did not collect data involving the outcomes of the locals in the host communities. While data was not collected regarding the impact of the program on the host communities since this was beyond the scope of the program, it is important to recognize that legitimate concerns can be raised about whether such a study is exploitive in nature. I agree that this study might be considered exploitive if it perceived the locals and their communities in South Africa as objects or 'others', "alienated and subordinated" (SooHoo, 2006, p. 24), merely serving a backdrop for studying the student development outcomes. The term 'othering' is sometimes used by scholars of international development (Escobar, 1995, SooHoo, 2006; Haider Rahman, 2016).

"Othering refers to the process of marginalizing individuals for a particular social characteristic that is embedded within the political infrastructure of inequality .... A dynamic social construction imposed on individuals or groups by those who have more power and authority" (SooHoo, p.7).

The primary focus of this investigation, however, was getting a better understanding of how conscious-raising experiences in the developing world might lead to enhanced levels of global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy and social justice action. I assert that by seeking this better understanding of how and why this type of critical consciousness occurs within a context of two-way constructive engagement with individuals of less privilege, especially in a reflective process that recognizing how hegemonic Western perspectives may have been a contributing factor to the root causes of the social injustices in question, actually serves to counteract 'othering' of people living in the host communities for the UConn service-learning program.

The literature indicates that a narrow focus on student development outcomes is common in service-learning. Crabtree (2008) noted that most literature on international service-learning discussion "focuses overwhelmingly on maximizing student learning; attention to community-level concerns is underwhelming at best" (p.

22). It is important to note that this study was conceived and carried out years after the students participated in the study abroad program, with the intention of exploring current and archived narrative data to help explain the possible relationship between critical service-learning experiences abroad and the phenomenon of a perspective transformation leading to global citizenship development. While I do not believe that this type of retrospective research is exploitive, it is evident that any intentionally designed program or study that uses such host communities as mere props for the benefit of the 'learners of privilege' would be both exploitive and ill-conceived. In that one of the stated purposes and suggested key contributions of this research is to inform the practice of study abroad, it is important to recognize that these type of programs must involve two-way relationships.

In fact, numerous critical service-learning theorists (Rosenberger, 2000; Doerr, 2010; Butin, 2010; Pompa, 2002) have recognized the importance of designing service-learning projects with host community engagement throughout the program development, implementation and evaluation. Rosenberger was especially concerned, believing that the idea that power throughout the process is shared by all stakeholders should be kept at the forefront, while suggesting service-learning be reframed with the term 'community action learning'. Echoing Rosenberger's concerns about the absence of reciprocity and mutuality, Doerr asserts that "the structure of critical service-learning must create an environment where cognitive dissonance takes place through the establishment of reciprocal and mutual relationship with the community partner" (p. 80). Both parties are simultaneously teachers and learners, and both should benefit from the interaction. Butin (2010) warns that service-learning might perpetuate inequities. Freire cautioned about the 'dominant elite' thinking about people but not with them (1997), noting the importance of establishing solidarity with those of less privilege by relinquishing power and control.

The findings of this study show that a transformative service-learning abroad experience requires an understanding of shared power, collective learning and collaborative problem-solving. Participants should gain a critical consciousness about the importance of allowing their less privileged hosts to take the lead in this type of collective community action learning process. “A Freirean perspective calls for true solidarity among service learners and community members and working together to meet needs and bring about change” (Rosenberger, p. 34). Crabtree premises that such ‘cross-cultural participatory development and service-learning projects’ designed to assure mutually beneficial relationships would have greater efficacy at empowering all program stakeholders as global citizens. An approach that features mutual understandings and shared decision-making and ownership of the learning process can help reduce the risk of hegemonic influences on the study abroad experience, and reinforce the critical reflection about what the term global citizenship really represents. Fisher and Grettenberger premise that while “increased knowledge for the students must remain a key outcome of study abroad ....they are no longer the study abroad course’s sole beneficiaries” (Fisher & Grettenberger, 2015, p. 572). Their model was referred to as Community-Based Participatory Study Abroad (CBPSA), and emphasized co-learning and reciprocity activities (co-presentations by visiting students and local community members, comparative analysis of practices in the U.S. versus the host country, critical dialogues on power and privilege, etc.).

The UConn Cape Town study abroad program appears to follow a best practice community-based education model (Villani & Atkins, 2000) with substantial local community engagement and participation in the design and implementation of the program. The program provided all six of the key elements of CBPSA, including shared power, co-learning, reciprocal benefits, empowerment, community-grounded processes and sustainability. The UConn students are referred to as co-educators throughout the program. I assert that a perspective transformation leading to transformative action to advance social justice does not occur in the classroom or on a cultural field trip. Rather, enhancing someone’s global consciousness,

ethnocultural empathy and commitment to social justice requires critical reflection that explores “the inequitable systems of power that underpins the social issue being addressed” (Fisher & Grettenberger, p.573) as the students are immersed in a reciprocal co-learning environment with the host community members of less privilege.

Another legitimate challenge to the study is that the participants are applying their own Western-based inherited/lived conceptualizations of equality/justice as they make judgements about social injustice in South Africa. I assert that it is because these prior conceptualizations are actually socio-distortions based on their hegemonic perspective, their personal experience with the socio-economic conditions within the indigenous communities and townships of Cape Town is outside of their frame of reference. This incongruity subsequently causes the deep cognitive dissonance that fuels their perspective transformation and re-consideration of fairness of their own relative privilege. As mentioned in Chapter 5, my own socialization process occurred within a context of a hegemonic, Western perspective growing up in America. This no doubt influences my initial approach and subsequent decisions as I examine this topic. It is true that I had to continually reflect on my actions and conclusions as I wrote the study to make sure I was not unintentionally ‘othering’ South Africa as this unique and alien destination for a perspective transformation. This reflexivity, encouraged by my thesis supervisors, led me to make sure that I was cognizant of the racial and socio-economic injustices in America, including the Civil War and ‘Jim Crow’ era’, that were similar in nature to what is premised to be personally transformative in South Africa to the American students who participated in the program.

The American students should also be well aware of the history of slavery, racism and related social injustices in America. If this is the case, it is legitimate to ask why these students are transformed after spending four months in South Africa since America had a similar racial caste society in it’s past. I premise that since the

most egregious example of the American racial caste system took place between 1877 to 1965, it may be more abstract in nature and perhaps out of their current consciousness. Also, many of the modern day socio-economic disparities in the U.S. have been mitigated to some extent by the policies of the Great Society in the mid 1960's. Another factor may be that while racism still exists within pockets of America, institutionalized slavery in the U.S. was mostly thought of as a North-South dispute, involving a minority population of African Americans who were brought to the U.S. as slaves. In South Africa, the more recent apartheid policies reflected official national policies carried out by a minority white government on the indigenous majority of black South Africans.

I premise that it may be because these conceptualizations are actually socio-distortions based on their own hegemonic perspective, their personal experience with the socio-economic conditions living and working in the indigenous communities and townships in South Africa is outside of their frame of reference. This incongruity, strengthened by their immersive time spent within the townships, and the building of close relationships with 'others' of less privilege, subsequently leads to the deep cognitive dissonance that fuels their perspective transformation and re-consideration of fairness of their own relative privilege and the modern day socio-economic injustices that still exist back home. During my time in the field with the participants and the faculty, it was clear that the class time discussions clearly connected the lessons learned in Cape Town to similar social justice issues that continue to be a problem back in the U.S. The focus is on having the students take action when they get back home to improve the plight of others of less privilege in America.

Finally, the study aligned its operational definition of transformative global citizenship with Oxfam's definition of a global citizen, which was part of Oxfam's global citizenship education curriculum for schools in the UK. This curriculum was developed for children and young adults between the ages of 2- 19. A legitimate challenge could call into question whether the Oxfam definition is applicable for

college-aged students. I assert that by developing curriculum for such a wide age range, Oxfam's work supports how the definition works for all ages. The difference is with the curriculum design for each age group. "Oxfam's Curriculum for Global Citizenship, developed in 1997, promotes a Learn-Think-Act approach with staged learning from early years (under age 5) to upper secondary (ages 16-19)" (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, 2014, p. 24). A review of the curriculum indicates that the learning for ages 16-19 included the student development outcomes that colleges in the U.S. are seeking (global consciousness, ethnocultural empathy, and commitment to act to address social injustice). The curriculum for the older students was developed to reflect their ability to process more complex nuances of global citizenship, and learn skills through both class and out-of-class activities (action).

While the concept of global citizenship is very familiar to colleges in the U.S., it is not that common in public secondary schools in the U.S. Global citizenship education, however, is becoming increasingly part of the curriculum in private college preparatory schools in America. For example, Taft School, a college preparatory secondary school in Connecticut, established Global Studies and Service Department (GSS) in 2008 that

"Reflects Taft's commitment to preparing students to become global citizens. Through course work, co-curricular programs, and service to communities both local and global, GSS students develop self-awareness, fluency in a plurality of perspectives, act as stewards of the environment, and effect change as active citizens in order to advance causes of equity and justice" (Taft School, 2017, p.1).

It is clear that Taft School's desired student development outcomes are well aligned with the study's operational definition of transformative global citizenship. There is one key difference noted between the secondary school students in both countries and college-age students. Living away at college provides students the necessary independence and space that allows them to become increasingly self-aware as they question and explore their identity, beliefs and values. College students have the ability to explore their purpose-in-life and pursue external opportunities for gaining student agency. I assert that just as Oxfam has staged



learning for students in primary and secondary schools, the critical service-learning approach is a way of staging global citizenship education to be transformative in nature for college-aged students as they find a way to leave their unique footprint on our globalized society.

## **6.8 Directions for Future Research**

This study is limited in scope to college students from the U.S. Another area of future research could be to expand the geographic scope of a similar study on college students from other Western countries, such as European students involved in the Erasmus Student Mobility program. I assume that studying students of similar privileged backgrounds would have similar outcomes, and a companion study would help us to examine this assumption. Also, the literature indicates that college students are at a prime age for personal change, and the current study integrated additional literature from student development theory to provide some additional insight into how this stage in the life cycle affects student development outcomes. It would also be useful to collect and analyze data from a similar study conducted with older individuals who are at a different, more mature stage of their life cycle. For example, numerous multi-national corporations provide their mid-career professionals with paid time off (three months to one year) to participate in corporate social sabbaticals in the developing world. Research on such individuals would help better understand how age and stage in the life cycle might affect the outcomes.

Finally, it would be interesting to ascertain the efficacy of adding an optional short-term service-learning experience as a companion program to traditional study abroad. This might include having students travel to under-resourced host communities in Eastern Europe, Africa or Southeast Asia to participate in a three-week high dissonance service-learning program immediately following their semester-long study abroad program in Europe. If research on this type of short-term program also reports findings that indicate that the study participants experienced a similar perspective transformation that leads to transformative global citizenship

development, this would have implications for the practice of study abroad. Such evidence would support the development of short-term transformative service-learning experiences for students studying abroad in order to increase overall student participation in these type of programs. This type of student development programming could serve to advance the goal of fostering global citizenship within their student body that is transformative in nature, a goal that is often cited in the academic mission statements of institutions of higher education across the U.S.

## References

- Abercrombie, N., Hill, S., & Turner, B. (1984). *Dictionary of Sociology*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Adler, P. (1975). The transitional experience: An alternative view of cultural shock. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 15(4), 13-23.
- Agar, M. (1996). *The Professional Stranger* (Second ed.). New York: Academic Press.
- Aktas, F., et al. (2017). Institutionalizing Global Citizenship: A Critical Analysis of Higher Education Programs and Curricula. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 21(1), 65-80.
- Allen, R. L., & Rossatto, C. A. (2009). Does Critical Pedagogy Work with Privileged Students. *Teachers Education Quarterly*(winter), 163-180.
- Altbach, P., & Teichler, U. (2001). Internationalization and Exchanges in a Globalized University. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 5(1), 5-25.
- Andreotti, V. (2006). Soft versus Critical Global Citizenship Education. *Policy and Practice A Development Education Review*, 3, 1-6.
- Annette, J. (2002). Service learning in an international context. *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad*, 8, 83-93.
- Appiah-Padi, S. (2001). How study in North America shapes the global perspectives of African students. *Diversity Digest*, (Spring).
- Arneil, B. (2007). Global Citizenship and Empire. *Citizenship Studies*, 11(3), 301-328.
- Aronson, E. (1997). The theory of cognitive dissonance: The evolution and vicissitudes of an idea. In C. McGarty & S. Haslam (Eds.), *The message of social psychology* (pp. 20-36). Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Astin, A. W., Sax, L. J., & Avalos, J. (1999). Long-term effects of volunteerism during the undergraduate years. *The Review of Higher Education*, 22(2), 187-202.
- Bamberg, M. (2006). Narrative Analysis In H. Cooper (Ed.), *APA handbook of research methods in psychology*. Washington, D.C.: APA Press.
- Banks, J. A. (2008). Diversity, Group Identity, and Citizenship Education in a Global Age. *Educational Researcher*, 37(3), 129-139.
- Barbour, J. (2006). The moral ambiguity of study abroad. *Chronicle of Higher Education*, (October 6, 2006).
- Barkhuizen, G., Benson, P., & Chik, A. (2014). *Narrative inquiry in language teaching and learning research*. New York: Routledge.

- Baxter, P., & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative Case Study Methodology: Study Design and Implementation for Novice Researchers. *The Qualitative Research Report*, 13(4), 544-559.
- Bell, L. A. (1997). Theoretical foundations for social justice education. In L. A. B. M. Adams, & P. Griffin (Ed.), *Teaching for diversity and social justice: A sourcebook* (pp. 3-15). New York Routledge.
- Bennett, M. J. (1986). A developmental approach to training for intercultural sensitivity. . *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 10, 179-196.
- Biggerstaff, D. (2012). Qualitative research methods in psychology. In G. Rossi (Ed.), *Psychology- Selected Papers* Rijeka, Croatia: InTech Open Science.
- Bloomberg, L. D., & Volpe, M. (2012). *Completing Your Qualitative Dissertation: A Roadmap From Beginning to End*. Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Bogdan, R. C., & Biklin, S. K. (1998). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theory and methods*. (3rd ed.). Boston, MA.: Allyn and Bacon.
- Bold, C. (2012). *Using narrative in research*. Los Angeles:Sage.
- Bowden, B. (2003). The Perils of Global Citizenship 1. *Citizenship Studies*, 7(3), 349.
- Boyatzis, R. E. (1988). *Transforming qualitative information: Thematic analysis and code development*. Thousand Oaks, CA Sage.
- Boyle-Baise, L., & Sleeter, C. (2000). Community-based service learning for multicultural teacher education. *Educational Foundations*, 14(2), 33-50.
- Boyle-Baise, M., & Langford, J. (2004). There are Children Here: Service Learning for Social Justice. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, 37(1).
- Bringle, R., & Hatcher, J. (1996). Implementing service learning in higher education. *Journal of Higher Education*, 67, 221-239.
- Bringle, R., Hatcher, J., & Jones, S. (Eds.). (2011). *International Service Learning: Conceptual Frameworks and Research* (Vol. 1). Sterling, VA: Stylus Publishing.
- Bromley, D. (1986). *The case-study method in psychology and related-disciplines*. Chichester: John Wiley & Sons.
- Brookfield , S. (1990). Using Critical Incidents to Explore Learners' Assumptions. In J. Mezirow (Ed.), *Fostering Critical Reflection in Adulthood* (pp. 177-193). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Brookfield, S. (1994). Tales from the dark side: A phenomenology of adult critical reflection. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 13(3), 203-216.
- Brookfield, S. (2005). *The power of critical theory*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

- Brookfield, S. (Ed.) (2000). *Transformative learning as ideology critique*. San Francisco: Jossey- Bass.
- Brunner, C. C. (1994). *Emancipatory research: Support for women's access to power*. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association.
- Burnard, P., Gill, P., Stewart, K., Treasure, E., & Chadwick, B. (2008). Analysing and presenting qualitative data. *British Dental Journal*(204), 429–432.
- Butin, D. (2010). *Service-Learning in Theory and Practice; The Future of Community Engagement in Higher Education*. London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Charmaz, K. (2006). *Constructing grounded theory: A practical guide through qualitative analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Chickering, A., & Braskamp, L. (2009). Developing a Global Perspective for Personal and Social Responsibility. *Peer Review*, 11(4), 27-30.
- Cipolle, S. (2010). *Service-Learning and Social Justice*. Plymouth, UK: Rowman & Litchfield.
- Corden, A., & Sainsbury, R. (2006). Using Verbatim Quotations in Reporting Qualitative Social Research: Researchers' Views. Retrieved from <https://www.york.ac.uk/inst/spru/pubs/pdf/verbquotresearch.pdf>
- Crabtree, R. D. (2008). Theoretical Foundations for International Service-Learning *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning, Fall*, 18-41.
- Cranton, P. (2006). *Understanding and Promoting Transformative Learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research design: Quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methods approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Curry-Stevens, A. (2003). *Pedagogy for the Economically Privileged: 'Tuning In' to the Privileged Learner*. Paper presented at the Fifth International Transformative Learning Conference Columbia University.
- Curry-Stevens, A. (2007). New Forms of Transformative Education: Pedagogy for the Privileged. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 5(1), 33-58.
- Daloz, L. (2000). Transformative learning for the common good. In J. Mezirow (Ed.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress* (pp. 103-123). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Davies, L. (2006). Global citizenship: abstraction or framework for action? *Educational Review*, 58(1), 5-25.
- De Chesnay, M. (2014). *Nursing Research Using Life History: Qualitative Designs and Methods in Nursing*. New York: Springer Publishing Company.

- Delanty. (2006). The Cosmopolitan Imagination: Critical Cosmopolitanism and Social Theory. *The British Journal of Sociology*, 57(1), 25-47.
- Denzin, N. (1989). *Interpretive biography*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Dewey, J. (1922). *Democracy and education: an introduction to the philosophy of education*. New York: MacMillan Company.
- Dewey, J. (1933). *How We Think. A restatement of the relation of reflective thinking to the educative process*. Boston: D. C. Heath.
- Dewey, J. (1938). *Experience & Education*. New York, NY: Kappa Delta Pi.
- Doerr, E. (2011). Cognitive Dissonance in International Service-Learning: Possibilities and Challenges for Service-Learning Pedagogy. In B. Porfilio (Ed.), *Critical-Service Learning as a Revolutionary Pedagogy: An International Project of Student Agency in Action (Critical Constructions)*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.
- Dogan, M., & Pelassy, D. (1990). *How To Compare Nations: Strategies in Comparative Politics*. (Second ed.). Chatham: Chatham House.
- Durbin, D. (2007). Durbin introduces Paul Simon Study Abroad Foundation Act. Retrieved from [capitolwords.org/date/2007/06/06/](http://capitolwords.org/date/2007/06/06/)
- Elliot, A., & Devine, P. (1994). On the motivational nature of cognitive dissonance: Dissonance as psychological discomfort. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 67(3), 382-394.
- Engle, L., & Engle, J. (2003). Study abroad levels: Toward a classification of program types. *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad*, IX(Fall), 1-20.
- Escobar, A. (1995). *Encountering Development*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Eyler, J., & Giles, D. (1997). *Report of a National Study Comparing the Impacts of Service-Learning Program Characteristics on Post Secondary Students*.
- Eyler, J., & Giles, D. (1999). *Where's the Learning in Service-Learning*. San Francisco: Jossey- Bass.
- Eyler, J., Giles, D., & Schmiede, A. (1996). *A Practitioner's Guide to Reflection in Service-Learning: Student Voices and Reflection*. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University.
- Featherstone, M. (2002). Cosmopolis. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 19(1-2), 1-16.
- Festinger, L. (1957). *A theory of cognitive dissonance*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

- Fisher, C. M., & Grettenberger, S. E. (2015). Community-Based Participatory Study Abroad: A Proposed Model for Social Work Education. *Journal of Social Work Education, 51*(3), 566-582.
- Flyvbjerg, B. (2006). Five misunderstandings about case-study research. *Qualitative Inquiry, 12*(2), 219-245.
- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York: Herder and Herder.
- Friedman, T. L. (2005). *The world is flat: A brief history of the twenty-first century*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.
- Furia, P. A. (2005). Global citizenship, anyone? Cosmopolitanism, privilege and public opinion. *Global Society, 19*(4), 331-359.
- Gaines-Hanks, N., & Grayman, N. (2009). International Service Learning in South Africa and Personal Change: An Exploratory Content Analysis. *NASPA Journal, 46*(1), 72-93.
- Germann Molz, J. (2005). Getting a "Flexible Eye": Round-the-World Travel and Scales of Cosmopolitan Citizenship. *Citizenship Studies, 9*(5), 517-531.
- Giles, J. D. E., & Eyler, J. (1994). The Theoretical Roots to Service-Learning in John Dewey: Towards a Theory of Service-Learning. *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning, 1*(1), 77-85.
- Ginwright, S., & Cammarota, J. (2002). New terrain in youth development: The promise of a social justice approach. *Social Justice, 29*(4), 82-95.
- Golay, P. (2006). *The Effects of Study Abroad on the Development of Global-Mindedness Among Students Enrolled in International Programs at Florida State University*. Dissertation.
- Goldkuhl, G. (2012). Pragmatism vs interpretivism in qualitative information systems research. *European Journal of Information Systems, 21*(2), 135-146.
- Goleman, D. (1996). *Emotional Intelligence: Why it Can Matter More Than IQ*. New York: Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Goleman, D. (2006). *Social Intelligence: The New Science of Human Relationships*. New YORK, NY: Random House.
- Goodman, D. J. (2001). *Promoting diversity and social justice: Educating people from privileged groups*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Gramsci, A. (1995). *Further Selections from The Prison Notebooks*. London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Gruenewald, D. A., & Smith, G. A. (2008). *Place-based education in the global age: Local Diversity*. New York: Lawrence Erlbaum.

- Gunesch, K. (2004). Education for cosmopolitanism. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 3(3), 251-275.
- Habermas, J. (1971). *Knowledge and Human Interests* (t. J. J. Shapiro Ed.). London: Heinemann.
- Haider Rahman, Z. (2016). So, Now I am Bangladeshi? *New York Times*, (April 8, 2016).
- Harris, M. (1968). *The rise of anthropological theory*. New York: Crowell.
- Hatcher, J. A. (1997). The moral dimensions of John Dewey's philosophy: Implications for undergraduate education. *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning*(4), 22-29.
- Herrmann, S. (2011). Holding on to transformation. In B. Porfilio & H. Hickman (Eds.), *Critical-Service Learning as a Revolutionary Pedagogy: An International Project of Student Agency in Action* (pp. 273- 296). Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.
- Hett. (1993). Development of an instrument to measure global mindedness. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 54(10).
- Hett, E. J. (1993). *Development of an instrument to measure global mindedness*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of San Diego.
- Hovey, R., & Weinburg, A. (2009). Global Learning and the making of citizen diplomats. In R. Lewin (Ed.), *Study Abroad and the making of global citizens: Higher education and the quest for global citizens* (pp. 33-48). New York: Routledge.
- Illich, I. (1968 April 20, 1968). *To Hell with Good Intentions*. Paper presented at the Conference on Inter- American Student Projects (CIASP), Cuernavaca, Mexico.
- Institute of International Education. (2009). Meeting America's Global Education Challenge Issue. Retrieved from <http://www.iie.org/Research-and-Publications/Research-Projects/Study-Abroad-Capacity-Research-Initiative#.WE77XLrLcs>
- Institute of International Education. (2010). Open Doors Data : U.S Study Abroad Duration of Study Abroad". Retrieved from <http://www.iie.org/Research-and-Publications/Open-Doors/Data/Fast-Facts#.WE77m7lrLcs>
- Institute of International Education. (2014). Open Door Report: International Students in the United States and Study Abroad by American Students are at All-Time High. Retrieved from <http://www.iie.org/Who-We-Are/News-and-Events/Press-Center/Press-Releases/2014/2014-11-17-Open-Doors-Data#.WE78LrLrLcs>
- Kaufmann, N., Martin, J., & Weaver, J. (1992). *Students abroad: Strangers at home. Education for a Global Society*. Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press.



- Keen, C., & Keen, J. (1998). *Bonner Student Impact*. Retrieved from bonnernetnetwork.pbworks.com/f/midpoint+08-09+report+final+10.09.doc
- Kegan, R. (Ed.) (2000). *What "form" transforms? A constructive developmental approach to transformative learning*. San Francisco: Jossey- Bass.
- Kennedy, W. (1990). Integrating personal and social ideologies. In J. Mezirow (Ed.), *Fostering Critical Reflection in Adulthood* (pp. 99-115). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Kiely, R. (2002). *Towards An Expanded Conceptualization of Transformational Learning: A Case of International Service-Learning in Nicaragua*. Dissertation. Cornell University.
- Kiely, R. (2004). A Chameleon with a Complex: Searching for Transformation in International Service-Learning *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning, Spring*, 5-20.
- Kiely, R. (2005). Transformative international service-learning. *Academic Exchange Quarterly*, 9, 275- 282.
- Kim, Y. Y., & Ruben, B. D. (1988). Intercultural transformation. In Y. Y. Kim & B. Gudykunst (Eds.), *Theories of intercultural communication* (pp. 299-321). London: Sage.
- Kimmel, M. (2002). Toward a Pedagogy of the Oppressor. In M. Kimmel & A. Ferber (Eds.), *Privilege: A Reader*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- King, J. (2004). Service-learning as a site for critical pedagogy: A case of collaboration, caring, and defamiliarization across borders. *Journal of Experiential Education*, 26(3), 121-137.
- King, N. (2004). Using templates in the thematic analysis of text. In C. C. Cassell & G. Symon (Eds.), *Essential Guide to Qualitative Methods in Organizational Research*. London: Sage.
- Kirk, J., & Miller, M. L. (1986). *Reliability and validity in qualitative research*. Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.
- Kitchenham, A. (2008). The Evolution of John Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory. *Journal of Transformative Education*, 6, 104 - 120.
- Kitsantas, A. (2004). Studying Abroad: The Role of College Students' Goals on the Development of Cross-Cultural Skills and Global Understanding. *College Student Journal*, 38(3), 441-452.
- Kolb, D. A. (1976). *The Learning Style Inventory: Technical Manua*. Boston, MA.: McBer & Co.
- Langridge, D. (2007). *Phenomenological Psychology: Theory, Research and Method*. London Pearson, Prentice Hall.

- Lapayese, Y. (2003). Toward a Critical Global Citizenship Education. *Comparative Education Review*, 47(4), 493-501.
- Leonard-Barton, D. (1990). A dual methodology for case studies: Synergistic use of a longitudinal single site with replicated multiple sites. *Organization Science*, 1, 1-19.
- Levinson, L. M. (1990). Choose engagement over exposure. *Combining service and learning: A resource book for community and public service* (pp. 68-75). Raleigh, NC: National Society for Internships and Experiential Education.
- Levy, D. (2000). The shock of the strange, the shock of the familiar: Learning from study abroad. *Journal of National Collegiate Honors Council*, 1(1), 75-83.
- Lewin, R. (Ed.) (2009). *Introduction: The quest for global citizenship through study abroad*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Lutterman-Aguilar, A., & Gingerich, O. (2002). Experiential Pedagogy for Study Abroad: Educating for Global Citizenship. *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad*, Volume VIII(Winter 2002), 41-82.
- MacKenzie, N., & Knipe, S. (2006). Research dilemmas: Paradigms, methods, and methodology. *Issues In Educational Research*, 16(2), 193-205.
- Madill, A., Jordan, A., & Shirley, C. (2000). Objectivity and reliability in qualitative analysis: Realist, contextualist and radical constructionist epistemologies. *British Journal of Psychology*, 91, 1-20.
- Malterud, K. (2001). Qualitative research: Standards, challenges and guidelines. *The Lancet* (358), 483-488.
- Marullo, S. (1999). Sociology's essential role: Promoting critical analysis in service-learning. In G. Ostrow (Ed.), *Cultivating the sociological imagination: Concepts and models for service-learning in sociology*. Washington DC: American Association of Higher Education.
- Matthews, J., & Sidhu, R. (2005). Desperately seeking the global subject: international education, citizenship and cosmopolitanism. *Globalisation, Societies & Education*, 3(1), 49-66.
- Maxwell, J. A. (2009). *vidence: A critical realist perspective for qualitative research*. Walnut Creek, CA: Left Coast Press.
- McAdams, D. P., Bauer, J. J., Sakaeda, A. R., Anyidoho, N. A., Machado, M. A., Magrino-Failla, K., Pals, J. L. (2006). Continuity and Change in the Life Story: A Longitudinal Study of Autobiographical Memories in Emerging Adulthood. *Journal of Personality*, 74(5), 1371-1400.
- McCabe, L. T. (1994). The development of a global perspective during participation in Semester at Sa: A comparative global education program. *Education Review*, 46(3), 275-286.

- McDonald, M. G. (2008). The Nature of Epiphanic Experience. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology*, 48(1), 89-115.
- Merriam, S. (1998). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Mezirow, J. (1978). Perspective Transformation. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 28(2), 100-110.
- Mezirow, J. (1981). A critical theory of adult learning and education *Adult Education Quarterly*, 32(3), 3-24.
- Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Mezirow, J. (2006). An overview of transformative learning. In P. P. Sutherland & J. Crowther (Eds.), *Lifelong learning: Concepts and contexts* (pp. 24-28). New York: Routledge.
- Mezirow, J. (Ed.) (1990). *How Critical Reflection Triggers Transformative Learning*. San Francisco Jossey Bass.
- Miles, M., & Huberman, A. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis (2nd edition)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications
- Mishler, E. (1999). *Storylines: Craft artists' narratives of identity*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Mitchell, T. (2007). Critical service-learning as social justice education: A case study of the citizen scholars program. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, 40(2), 101-112.
- Mitchell, T. (2008). Traditional vs. Critical Service-Learning: Engaging the Literature to Differentiate Two Models. *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning*, 4(2), 50-65.
- Monard-Weissman, K. (2003). Fostering a sense of justice through international service-learning. *Academic Exchange Quarterly*, 7(2), 164(166).
- Morton, K., & Campbell, J. (2007). Reflection. In J. Campbell & J. Hamerlink (Eds.), *Civic Engagement in higher education: reflections on power, evaluation, and risk management* (pp. 7-38): Upper Midwest Campus Compact Consortium.
- Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Muetzelfeldt, M., & Smith, G. (2002). Civil Society and Global Governance: The Possibilities for Global Citizenship. *Citizenship Studies*, 6(1), 55-75.
- Noddings, N. (Ed.) (2005 ). *Educating citizens for global awareness*. New York: Teachers College Press.

- Nussbaum, M. C. (1997). Kant and Stoic Cosmopolitanism. *Journal of Political Philosophy*, 5(1), 1-25.
- Oxfam. (1997). *A Curriculum for Global Citizenship* London: Oxfam.
- Parekh, B. (2003). Cosmopolitanism and global citizenship. *Review of International Studies*, 29(01), 3-17.
- Parker, B., & Dautoff, D. (2007). Service-Learning and Study Abroad: Synergistic Learning Opportunities *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning*(Spring), 40-53.
- Patton, M. Q. (1990 ). *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*. Newbury Park: Sage.
- Patton, M. Q. (2001). *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods*. (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Peräkylä, A. (1997). Reliability and validity in research based on tapes and transcripts. In D. Silverman (Ed.), *Qualitative research: Theory, method and practice*. London: Sage.
- Philliber, S., Schwab, M., & Samsloss, G. (1980). *Social research: Guides to a decision-making process*. Itasca, IL: Peacock.
- Pietro, R. (2010). *Learning to lead thru international service: the role of transformative learning and perspective transformations in authentic leadership development*. Unpublished research paper. University of Bath.
- Pisano, R. H. (2007). *Transforming Students through Service in Study Abroad: A Case Study of an International Service -Learning*. Dissertatation. University of California- Los Angeles.
- Polkinghorne, D. (1988). *Narrative knowing and the human sciences*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Polkinghorne, D. (1995). Narrative configuration in qualitative analysis. *International Journal of qualitative studies in Education*, 8(1), 12-28.
- Pompa, L. (2002). Service-Learning as Crucible: Reflections on Immersion, Context, Power, and Transformation. *Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning*, 9(1), 67-76.
- Putnam, H. (1990). *Realism with a human face*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Redden, E. (2010). Academic Outcomes of Study Abroad. Inside Higher Education. Retrieved from <http://www.insidehighered.com/news/2010/07/13/abroad>
- Rhoads, R. A. (1997). *Community service and higher learning: Explorations of the caring self*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

- Rhoads, R. A. (1998). Critical multiculturalism and service learning. In R. A. R. A. Rhoads & J. P. F. Howard (Eds.), *Academic service learning: A pedagogy of action and reflection* (pp. 39-46). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Rice, K., & Pollack, S. (2000). Developing a critical pedagogy of service learning: Preparing self-reflective, culturally aware, and responsive community participants. In C. O'Grady (Ed.), *Integrating service learning and multicultural education in colleges and universities* (pp. 115-134). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Riessman, C. J. (2008). *Narrative methods for the human sciences*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Rizvi, F. (2003). Democracy and education after September 11. *Journal of Globalization, Societies and Education*, 1(1), 25-40.
- Rizvi, F. (2009). Towards cosmopolitan learning. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 30(3), 253-268.
- Root, E., & Ngampornchai, A. (2012). "I Came Back as a New Human Being": Student Descriptions of Intercultural Competence Acquired Through Education Abroad Experiences. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 17(5):513-532.
- Rosenberger, C. (2000). Beyond empathy: Developing critical consciousness through service learning. In C. R. O'Grady (Ed.), *Integrating service learning and multicultural education in colleges and universities* (pp. 23-43). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Rosenthal, G. (2000). Social transformation in the context of familial experience: biographical consequences of a denied past in the Soviet Union. In R. Breckner (Ed.), *Biographies and the division of Europe: experience, action, and change on the "Eastern Side"*. Opladen: Leske & Budrich, 115–138.
- Rosenthal, G. (2002). Family history: Life stories. *The History of the Family*, 7(2), 175-182.
- Schattle, H. (2009). Global citizenship in theory and practice. In R. Lewin (Ed.), *The handbook of practice and research in study abroad* (pp. 3-20). New York: Routledge.
- Schulz, D. (2007). Stimulating social justice theory for service-learning practice. In J. Z. Calderón (Ed.), *Race, poverty, and social justice: Multidisciplinary perspectives through service learning* (pp. 23-35). Sterling, VA: Stylus Publishing.
- Searle, J. R. (1995). *The Construction of Social Reality*. New York: Free Press.
- Shultz, L. (2007). Educating for Global Citizenship: Conflicting Agendas and Understandings. *The Alberta Journal of Educational Research*, 53( 3 ), 248-258.

- Smith, J. (2004). Reflecting on the development of interpretative phenomenological analysis and its contribution to qualitative research in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*(1), 39-54.
- Smith, J. (2004). Reflecting on the development of interpretative phenomenological analysis and its contribution to qualitative research in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*(1), 39-54.
- Smith, J. A., Flowers, P., & Larkin, M. (2009). *Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis: Theory Method and Research*. London: Sage Publications.
- SooHoo, S. (2006). *Talking Leaves: Narratives of Otherness*. Cresskill, NJ: Hampton Press
- Stake, R. (1995). *The art of case study research* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory (2nd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Strawson, G. T. (1989). *The Secret Connexion: Causality, Realism and Hume*. Oxford: Clarendon.
- Taft School. (2017). Global Studies and Service. Retrieved from <https://www.taftschoool.org/academics/academic-departments/global-studies-and-service>
- Tamboukou, M. (2010). *In the fold between power and desire: women artists' narratives*. Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars' Publishing.
- Taylor, E. (1994). A Learning Model for becoming Interculturally Competent *International Journal for Intercultural Relations*, 18(3), 389-408.
- Taylor, E. (1997). Building upon the theoretical debate: A critical review of the empirical studies of Mezirow's transformative learning theory. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 48, 32-57.
- Taylor, E. (1998). The theory and practice of transformative learning: a critical review. *Eric Clearinghouse on Adult, Career, and Vocational Education, Informational Series N.374*.
- Tenant, M. (1993). Perspective transformation and adult development. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 44(1), 34-42.
- Tight, M. (2003). *Researching higher education*. England: Society for Research into Higher Education and Open University Press
- Tugade, M., & Fredrickson, B. (2004). Emotions: Positive emotions and health. In A. N. (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Health and Behavior* (pp. 306–310). Thousand Oaks, CA Sage.

- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. (2014). Global Citizenship Education. Retrieved from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0022/002277/227729E.pdf>
- University of Bournemouth. (2016). What is a Global Perspective. Retrieved from <https://microsites.bournemouth.ac.uk/the-global-perspective/what-is-a-global-perspective/>
- University of Connecticut. (2014). Creating Our Future: UCONN's Path to Excellence. Retrieved online <http://academicvision.uconn.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/643/2014/04/academic-plan-single-hi-optimized.pdf>
- U. S. Department of State & U. S. Department of Education. (2007). International Education Week 2007. Retrieved from <http://iew.state.gov/>
- van Manen, M. (1990). *Researching lived experience: Human science for an action sensitive pedagogy*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Villani, C. J., & Atkins, D. (2000). Community-based Education. *School Community Journal*, 10(1), 39-44.
- Wade, R. C. (2000). From a distance: Service-learning and social justice. In C. R. O'Grady (Ed.), *Integrating service learning and multicultural education in colleges and universities* Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Walker, C., & Braskamp, L. (2008). Relationship between well being and global perspective. Retrieved from [www.gpinv.org](http://www.gpinv.org)
- Wang, Y., & Rodgers, R. (2006). Impact of service-learning and social justice education on college students' cognitive development. 43(2), 316-337.
- Weiner, B. (1985). An attributional theory of achievement motivation and emotion. *Psychological Review*, 92, 548-573.
- Willig, C. (2001). *Introducing Qualitative Research in Psychology: Adventures in Theory and Method*. Open University Press: Philadelphia.
- Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA.: Sage.
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods* London: Sage.
- Yoshikawa, M. J. (1987). Cross-cultural adaption and perceptual development. In Y. Y. Kim & W. B. Gudykunst (Eds.), *Cross-cultural adaption* (pp. 140-148). London: Sage.
- Zautra, A., Hall, J., & Murray, K. (2010). Resilience: A new definition of health for people and communities. In R. Reich, A. Zautra, & J. Hall (Eds.), *Handbook of Adult Resilience* (pp. 3-30). New York Guilford: Guilford.
- Zemach-Bersin, T. (2007). Global Citizenship & Study Abroad: It's All About U.S. *Critical Literacy: Theories and Practices*, 1(2), 16-26.



## Appendix A

### SPRING 2015 Education Abroad UConn IN CAPE TOWN, SOUTH AFRICA

*Drawing on the university's core value of Human Rights, the Cape Town Education Abroad Program provides one of the best ways to learn about yourself, expand your worldview, and work for social justice while gaining skills essential to becoming a well-informed global citizen.*



**Appropriate for any major**, an opportunity to embark upon a life-changing experience designed to enhance your academic career! A chance to live in one of the most beautiful settings in the world while studying the multiple concerns facing South Africa as it strives to become one of the world's most progressive democracies.

**Intern three days a week** at a non-governmental organization, school, clinic, hospital, or government agency, whose mission it is to address issues of social injustice.

**Take three academically engaging courses:** The History & Politics of South Africa; Comparative Analysis of Race & Gender; and an Internship Research Seminar.

**Immerse yourself in greater understanding** of South Africa's troubled past while contributing to its vibrant hope for the future.



For a more details and to apply see the Study Abroad Website at <http://www.studyabroad.uconn.edu> and search for "Cape Town" or contact Marita McComiskey [marita.mccomiskey@uconn.edu](mailto:marita.mccomiskey@uconn.edu)



## Appendix B

From: Pietro, Roy

Sent:

To:

Subject: FW: Seeking Cape Town alumni as volunteer participants for follow-up research study

Dear Alumni of the UConn Cape Town Study Abroad Program,

You are invited to participate in this survey of program alumni of the UConn Cape Town Study Abroad program. I am completing my doctoral dissertation and am interested in examining the long-term impact of participating in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad in college.

Your participation in this study will require the completion of a questionnaire. This should take approximately 30 minutes of your time to complete the questionnaire. Your participation will be anonymous. You will not be paid for being in this study, although all participants who complete and return the questionnaire will receive a \$5 Amazon gift card via email that can be redeemed online. This study does not involve any risk to you. However, the benefits of your participation in the study may impact society by informing the policies and practices of college study abroad programming for the benefit of future college students in the U.S. and beyond.

You do not have to be in this study if you do not want to be. You do not have to answer any question that you do not want to answer for any reason. I will be happy to answer any questions you have about this study. If you have further questions about this project or if you have a research-related problem, you may contact me at 860-486-4252 or [roy.pietro@uconn.edu](mailto:roy.pietro@uconn.edu).

Thank you for your time. Please sign and email back the attached informed consent form as soon as possible if you would like to participate in this study. Once I receive the informed consent form back, I will email you the study questionnaire.

Best regards.

Roy Pietro

Principal Investigator

Working Title of Study: *Examining the Long-term Impact of Participation in High Dissonance Service-Learning Programs while Studying Abroad*

## Appendix C

### Consent Form for Participation in a Research Study

**Principal Investigator:** Roy Pietro

**Study Title:**

*Examining the impact of participating in a high dissonance service-learning program on the global perspectives and global citizenship of college students studying abroad*

You are invited to participate in a research study concerning the impact of participation in a service-learning program while studying abroad. You are being asked to participate because you participated in a UConn sponsored semester long study abroad program in Cape Town, South Africa during 2007- 2013.

Why is this study being done?

I am conducting this research study to examine the nature and persistence of any personal change that occurs during and after college students participate in a high dissonance service-learning program while studying abroad.

What are the study procedures? What will I be asked to do?

If you agree to take part in this study, you will be asked to provide 3-4 pages of guided autobiographical data that prompts you to provide your best recollections of your personal experience studying abroad and how this experience may have had an impact on you in present day. The guided autobiographical questionnaire will be emailed to you as an attachment so you can complete it and return it at your convenience. It should take approximately 30 minutes to complete the questionnaire.

Some research requires that the full purpose of the study not be explained before you participate. We will give you a full explanation as soon as you complete the study. All participants will be send an analytical summary of their submitted autobiographical information and asked to provide any corrections or additional clarifications within (4) weeks of submitting it.

What are the risks or inconveniences of the study?

We believe there are no known risks associated with this research study; however, a possible inconvenience may be the time it takes to complete the study.

What are the benefits of the study?

While you may not directly benefit from this research; however, we hope that your participation in the study may will help make a scholarly contribution to, and a better understanding of, best practices in college study abroad programming.

### Will I receive payment for participation? Are there costs to participate?

There are no costs and you will not be paid to be in this study. If you complete study questionnaire, you will receive a \$10 Amazon gift card via email that can be redeemed on line.

### How will my personal information be protected?

The following procedures will be used to protect the confidentiality of your data. I will keep all study records (including any codes to your data) locked in a secure location and destroyed after one year. Data that will be shared with others will be coded as described above to help protect your identity. At the conclusion of this study, I may publish the findings. Information will be presented in summary format and you will not be identified in any publications or presentations.

I will do our best to protect the confidentiality of the information I gather from you but I cannot guarantee 100% confidentiality. Your confidentiality will be maintained to the degree permitted by the technology used. Specifically, no guarantees can be made regarding the interception of data sent via the Internet by any third parties.

### Can I stop being in the study and what are my rights?

You do not have to be in this study if you do not want to. If you agree to be in the study, but later change your mind, you may drop out at any time. There are no penalties or consequences of any kind if you decide that you do not want to participate. You will be notified of all significant new findings during the course of the study that may affect your willingness to continue. You do not have to answer any question that you do not want to answer.

### Whom do I contact if I have questions about the study?

Take as long as you like before you make a decision. I will be happy to answer any question you have about this study. If you have further questions about this study or if you have a research-related problem, you may contact me at 860-486-4252.

### **Documentation of Consent:**

I have read this form and decided that I will participate in the project described above. Its general purposes, the particulars of involvement and possible risks and inconveniences have been explained to my satisfaction. I understand that I can withdraw at any time. My signature also indicates that I have received a copy of this consent form.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Participant Signature:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Print Name:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of Person  
Obtaining Consent

\_\_\_\_\_  
Print Name:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date:

## Appendix D

### Guided Autobiography of Personal Experience-- UConn in Cape Town

#### **Dear Participant,**

Thank you for volunteering to participate in this study. Please use the following prompts to reflect on and share your personal experience participating in the UConn in Cape Town program for a spring semester during the timeframe of 2008 through 2013. Additional space is provided at end for optional open-ended comments. Please save the document and then write as much as you wish to fully answer each question, and save your responses before emailing your completed questionnaire back.

- Q1:** Please discuss why you chose this study abroad program. Please describe your initial concerns, if any, you had before enrolling in this program?
- Q2:** If I was to ask your family or close friends to use three to five adjectives that best described you before you studied abroad, what would they say?
- Q3:** What do you most remember about your feelings and emotions during your arrival and initial week in Cape Town?
- Q4:** Please recount your most memorable moments (people, places, program activities, etc.) of the Cape Town program and explain what makes them so memorable.

- Q5:** Please describe anything you found in Cape Town that fascinated you, unsettled you, disappointed you, enlightened you or inspired you and explain why.
- Q6:** Please describe how you felt when the program ended and left Cape Town, and also when you arrived back to the United States.
- Q7:** Please discuss what you think the ‘essence’ was of what you learned or took away from the UConn Cape Town program? Was this program important to your personal development, and if so why?
- Q8:** If I was to ask your family or close friends to use three to five adjectives that best described you after you studied abroad, what would they say? What, if anything, would be different today about you from before your study abroad experience?

**Q9:** Please share any personal change you feel occurred during or after the program, and note what you believe the reason or cause was for this personal change. If you didn't experience personal change, please indicate this as well.

**Q10: (Optional)**

Please feel free to share anything else about your personal experience in the UConn Cape Town Study Abroad, especially in regards to its impact on your personal and /or professional life today.

# Appendix E

## Follow-up Email

From: Pietro, Roy

Sent:

To:

Subject: additional information

I have asked all participants a couple of quick follow-up questions and if you can take another moment to answer these questions it would be greatly appreciated.

First, what was your major at UConn?

The second follow-up question is listed below. This question was intentionally left off of the initial questionnaire so as not to bias responses to first nine questions. Your great responses to the first 10 questions have provided somewhat of an answer to question 11 already, but if you could take a moment to answer this last question that would be great.

Q 11. Please share some information about your current professional interests, life passions, and level of community involvement and note if any of your choices, actions or decisions regarding these was impacted by your study abroad experience in Cape Town. Has your view of the world, perspective on life or self-identity changed as of this personal experience, and if so, in what way?

## Appendix F

### Sample form for Extracting Data from Individual Cases

**Participant Number:**      **Pseudonym:**

**Gender:**                      **Cohort Year:**                      **Major:**

**Comparison of Start/ end adjectives:**

### Explicated statements by Theme

#### Major Theme 1

##### Perspective Transformation

(Broadened worldviews/ global perspectives, reconsidered beliefs, reconstituted values)

#### Major Theme 2

##### Global Citizenship Development

##### Sub-theme 1

*Enhanced global consciousness*

##### Sub-theme 2

*Enhanced ethnoempathy*

##### Sub-theme 3

*Enhanced social justice orientation*



### **Major theme 3**

#### **Transformative Global Citizenship Action**

(Changes in career or education choices, civic engagement, local and/ or global social activism)

### **Major theme 4**

#### **Internal conflict with high socio-economic dissonance**

### **Major theme 5**

*Personal connections to those impacted by issues of social justice*

### **Major theme 6**

*Questioning of relative privilege and life purpose: readjustment issues back in the U.S.*

**Nature and Persistence of Personal Change (check highest level of personal change)**

No personal change: \_\_\_\_\_

Informed perspective): \_\_\_\_\_

Perspective transformation: \_\_\_\_\_

Enhanced levels of global citizenship development: \_\_\_\_\_

Transformative global citizenship: \_\_\_\_\_

**Impact of High Socio-economic dissonance (yes/no)**

Internal conflict with high socio-economic dissonance \_\_\_\_\_

Personal connections to those impacted by issues of social justice \_\_\_\_\_

Readjustment issues upon return to U.S. \_\_\_\_\_

**Notes:**

## Appendix G

### Participant Background Information

#	Pseudonym	Cohort	Gender	Major(s)
1	Donna	2009	Female	Political Science
2	Abby	2012	Female	English
3	Mary	NA*	Female	Communications and Psychology
4	Linda	2011	Female	Urban & Community Studies
5	Kasey	2013	Female	History
6	Lucia	2008	Female	Human Development
7	Annette	2013	Female	Journalism
8	Shellie	2014	Female	Philosophy
9	Joyce	2013	Female	Human Rights
10	Anthony	2013	Male	Healthcare
11	Caitlin	2010	Female	International Studies
12	Sammie	2013	Female	Earth Science
13	Robert	2012	Female	Anthropology and Psychology
14	Jake	2008	Male	Resource Economics
15	Robie	2012	Female	History
16	Susan	2013	Female	Molecular/ Cell Biology
17	Cindy	2010	Female	English
18	Megan	NA*	Female	English
19	Peter	2013	Male	Political Science/ Human Rights
20	Rachel	2011	Female	Psychology
21	Nick	2011	Male	History
22	Jessie	2009	Female	Environmental Policy
23	Carla	2008	Female	Women's Studies and Sociology
24	Mollie	2011	Female	Allied Health
25	Ashley	2012	Female	Anthropology and French
26	Pattie	2008	Female	Political Science/ Human Rights
27	Ally	2012	Female	Speech
28	Elly	2013	Female	International Relations
29	Alisha	2013	Female	Allied Health

**Gender Breakdown:** Female 25 (86%)

Male 4 (14%)

\* Not available

## Appendix H

### Template 1:

#### Major Theme 1: Perspective Transformation

##### Participant

##### Key statements from participants

<b>Kasey</b>	"Since I have come back I have a ....desire to treat others with kindness and dignity ....changed entirely as a person ....am still changing."
<b>Lucia</b>	"This program shaped my world view. ....program was the most transformative experience of my life, thus far."
<b>Jake</b>	"The most important experience I had in my college years ....has had lasting effects on the way I approach every pursuit in my life and on my development.... new ways of thinking and taking in the world around me"
<b>Shellie</b>	Different way in which I look at the world.... gift Cape Town gave me .... capacity to love and care for individuals whom I will never meet"
<b>Mollie</b>	"Cape Town changed me as a person.... most influential thing that has happened in my life to date.... Cape Town was a life altering experience"
<b>Caitlin</b>	"My experience has irrevocably changed my life, my views, and my future. I cannot imagine who I would be today without those four months.... I have had a life altering experience here in Cape Town"
<b>Nick</b>	"I do believe that the Cape Town program laid out the foundation for the values I live with today. One of many changes that occurred was my concern for human rights ....I have a better understanding and care for the world."
<b>Abby</b>	"I was looking at everything back at home through changed eyes .... my perspective has changed because I always try to look at the bigger picture now and recognize my privilege"
<b>Carla</b>	"I realized that I didn't want to just exist in the world, I wanted to be a part of it and make it better.... giving to the less privileged ....try to ensure that I am making a positive impact on the world That trip did change my life"
<b>Ashley</b>	"I left with such a different sense of the world ....My view of the world and perspective on life has changed"
<b>Annette</b>	"My view of the world, perspective on life and self-identity have all changed PROFOUNDLY because of my Cape Town experience. Where I work, live, what I do for a living, who I interact with, how I interact with people - it's all changed"
<b>Robert</b>	My perspective on life and worldview is completely different from before and after my time in Cape Town .... I now have a greater appreciation of the lives of poor people throughout the world and the daily struggles of a person of color in our world.... it was life changing"
<b>Robie</b>	"Cape Town changed my life. I am now more adventurous, tougher, and more quizzical about the world I live in"
<b>Ally</b>	"This program changed me as a person. It has molded me into a global citizen, into a human rights activist"
<b>Megan</b>	"Experienced tremendous personal change ....I experienced life in a 3rd world country firsthand .... became more personally-invested than ever before in humanitarian issues"
<b>Rachel</b>	"I certainly view the world through a different lens. I pay much more attention to race and class, as well as other inequalities and I view the purpose and goal of life much differently"
<b>Mary</b>	"Cape Town definitely changed my outlook on life .... My view of the world has changed drastically"

<b>Linda</b>	"Beliefs will be the light by which you see, but they will not be what you see, and they will not be a substitute for seeing." When you get out of your comfort zone and challenge your beliefs about the way the world works, you learn to see things in new and different ways"
<b>Joyce</b>	"My view of the world is less narrow and I am so grateful for that. I grew up with a sheltered life with great parents and went to private school until college .... the American way of life is not the only one and may not even be the best one"
<b>Sammie</b>	"Going to Cape Town and seeing how different the world can look ..... I struggled a lot when I was in Cape Town with the way my view on the world was changing. I saw and experienced beautiful things but it wasn't without ugly counterparts. I still have faith in the world but my view of the world is less-disillusioned I guess is how I would describe it."
<b>Cindy</b>	"My perspective has changed because I always try to look at the bigger picture now and recognize my privilege"
<b>Peter</b>	"My view of the world has changed through an enhanced sense of critical thinking. Thinking critically changes how I see the world, see my relationships, it changes everything"
<b>Jessie</b>	"I am just beginning to figure out how to incorporate who I was before, with who I was there, with who I can be in the future ....reason that I do humanitarian work is because of Cape Town. I think that the thing about life in Cape Town that I really don't think that I'd experienced before, but haven't lost since is the Ubuntu type idea that social justice issues are inseparable from everyday life"
<b>Alisha</b>	"For the first time in my life I can feel my white flesh and I am ashamed that so little means that I have so much more.... my return to America has challenged me in many ways.... I have most struggled with having conversation with people I love dearly yet who are in many ways unobservant of the world around them and their impacts on others"

## Template 2:

### Major Theme 2: Global Citizenship Development

#### Sub-theme *Global Consciousness*

#### Participant                      Key statements

<b>Mollie</b>	"The program really opened my eyes to so many issues that exist in.... the world ....the essence of the program ....equality and fairness for all"
<b>Kasey</b>	"Cape Town gave me an awareness I didn't have before. ....really gained a view of the world ....started seeing a bigger picture.... working to acknowledge those who have been left out of the collective image"
<b>Joyce</b>	"My view of the world is less narrow --the American way of life is not the only one and may not even be the best one"
<b>Shellie</b>	"Cape Town made me grow up very fast and I mostly had to for my internship but also to be comfortable in a country that was different my own two. The change that happened for me was at all levels – I have different career goals and a different way in which I look at the world"
<b>Jake</b>	"this experience gave me a much broader view of the world than I had previously" and that "I also feel more in tune with issues in the world that I may have not been as cognizant of before taking part in this experience"
<b>Caitlin</b>	"South Africa exposed me to realities to which I had previously been ignorant. I came to understand the world and my place in it in a totally new way"
<b>Ally</b>	"had a completely different view of the United States when I came back, and struggled or several months to deal with my new perspectives and realizations of how much progress still needed to happen for race, gender, and so much more ....my only hope is that my perspective as well as other peoples can be broadened in order to get a richer sense of the world around us and what can be done to make it better for all people"
<b>Robie</b>	"The changes I, and my fellow students, have made are not on the surface but are inside us somewhere (probably next to my spleen actually, ahaha just kidding). It might be in the willingness we now have to fight for what we believe in, or a larger awareness of the world"
<b>Megan</b>	"I am much more aware about how decisions that I make politically, economically, and socially affect people in other parts of the globe"
<b>Mary</b>	The program did a lot to ....direct my views on global socioeconomic issues .... adjusted the way I looked at humanity, at necessity....what it means to live a meaningful life"
<b>Annette</b>	"More than anything I took away new perspective ....realized how messed up our world is ....and how it looks through the eyes of the oppressed (Annette, 2013)
<b>Abby</b>	"Cape Town helped me see how everyone is connected, and how everyone can help each other. Everyone in this world has something to offer, and bringing people together who need different things from each other is what can make for a sustainable and community-oriented world"

<b>Cindy</b>	"I realized how similar our countries are, that institutionalized racism and disadvantages are pervasive in our country too, even if we don't have it explicitly written in laws"
--------------	---

### Sub-theme *Ethnoempathy*

#### Participant                      Explicated statements

<b>Robie</b>	"The essence of what I learned.... around the world people have such vastly different cultures and life experiences and it is truly important to try and understand the different human experiences around the world"
<b>Shelli</b>	"Became more thoughtful, empathetic, brave, friendly ....view of the world has changed....better understanding of .... how to be empathetic"
<b>Jake</b>	"Learned a great deal about another culture....and to be more open minded, caring, and compassionate during this program"
<b>Robert</b>	"The essence of my time in Cape Town was learning how another culture lives and thrives, to appreciate the role poverty plays in someone's life, and to learn to adapt to a setting that is completely different than what you are used to"
<b>Ashley</b>	"I learned how to be open, adaptable and respectful of all cultures, histories and experiences ....learned to question things around me and why they are the way they are"
<b>Caitlin</b>	"My lens through which I see the world has been opened. The curtain which shielded me from seeing certain issues before has been removed....I have changed. Irreversibly.... never not see racism, sexism, classism, ageism, or any other -ism"
<b>Kasey</b>	"My views and perspectives definitely shifted thanks to this experience. Leaving my small community exposed me to an amazing amount of people, ideals and cultures. It not only gave me an image of the diversity in the world but also pushed me to continue to explore"
<b>Ally</b>	"I had a completely different view of the United States when I came back, and struggled for several months to deal with my new perspectives and realizations of how much progress still needed to happen for race, gender, and so much more"
<b>Alisha</b>	"I am appreciating how hard people with disabilities have to work to keep an upbeat attitude about not being able to do certain things ....has also helped me to be more aware of those people with disabilities who despite all odds achieve their life goals. I have newfound admiration for such individuals and it inspires me to make better use of the body I have found myself renting"
<b>Abby</b>	"Being a more aware and accepting person .... If you disagree with someone on something, and you really think you should change or open their mind, you can't do this without truly understanding where they are coming from and why they think they way that they do"
<b>Linda</b>	"The CPT trip made me into a more compassionate person"
<b>Sammie</b>	"This program has pushed me to not be comfortable, be knowledgeable about current events, and to be passionate about caring for people"
<b>Cindy</b>	"I was inspired by the resilience of the people there and how they were so willing to forgive and push forward.... I loved the experience of

	working with small groups of children--I learned in South Africa this is the best way for me to connect to others"
<b>Peter</b>	"I took away how to be a better individual, more understanding of other's situations, more alert to gender and racial differences"

### Sub-theme *Social Justice Orientation*

#### Participant                      Explicated statements

<b>Mollie</b>	"The program really opened my eyes to so many issues that exist both in South Africa, the United States and the world in general. I think the essence of the program, no matter how cheesy it may seem, is all about equality and fairness for all"
<b>Shellie</b>	"Important to understand....different levels of privilege....history has stacked the deck in their favor. I thought I understood privilege before Cape Town .... I've learned it's about recognizing injustice on which it is built upon"
<b>Caitlin</b>	"I had a renewed urgency in working for justice when I returned -- I was definitely more focused on activist efforts and causes in my community and in the world community"
<b>Kasey</b>	"It's allowed me to address my privilege, to notice injustices in my world and to start combatting unfair aspects of my community"
<b>Alisha</b>	"Cape Town ....helped me to reorganize my priorities ....visceral reactions to injustice....understand what true empathy can feel like."
<b>Ally</b>	"I always loved serving other people, but now I understand why I serve. I want to dedicate my life to equality, and giving people equal opportunity to live the life they choose"
<b>Joyce</b>	I also try to be more in touch with human rights issues all over the world....I have a deep longing to serve others. This experience has made that desire stronger."
<b>Jake</b>	"volunteered my time and effort for some causes I'm passionate about ....I understand my responsibilities to other people in a way that I wasn't as aware of prior to taking part in this program"
<b>Robie</b>	"Today I consider myself a feminist and human rights activist. That's the biggest thing that changed about me on this program. I care more about social issues now then before the program"
<b>Lucia</b>	"My family and closest friends would tell you that I returned so much more alive and hungry for the kind of world I want to occupy. They would likely tell you that I probably would not have dedicated my life's work to ending gender-based violence and I would probably agree"
<b>Nick</b>	"One of many changes that occurred was my concern for human rights .... committed to studying more about human rights and working to make the world a better place for those less fortunate than me"
<b>Carla</b>	"I learned to appreciate the opportunities, lifestyle and environment that I was privileged to have and grow up in. I felt like I could make a difference in the world, even it is was just by making one person's life easier, even if just for a day. Everybody can make the world a better place just by realizing that we all live here and we all affect each other. We can all help each other, living as a community and not alone"



<b>Rachel</b>	"I pay much more attention to race and class, as well as other inequalities and I view the purpose and goal of life much differently as well, in terms of helping others versus getting ahead.... gained this sense of confidence in my views of what was right in the world and what was not"
<b>Sammie</b>	"This trip began the process of finding my confidence and voice in speaking out against hate and injustice"
<b>Cindy</b>	"My perspective has changed because I always try to look at the bigger picture now and recognize my privilege"
<b>Peter</b>	"Because of Cape Town I've become more interested in race and gender relations in the United States....it's something I can hopefully consistently advocate for over my entire life"
<b>Jessie</b>	"I think that the thing about life in Cape Town that ....haven't lost since is the Ubuntu type idea that social justice issues are inseparable from everyday life .... the reason that I do humanitarian work is because of Cape Town"

### Template 3

#### Major Theme 3: Transformative Global Citizenship Action

##### Participant                      Action attributed to participation in study abroad program

<b>Linda</b>	Felt more committed to a path in the nonprofit sector..... working towards making something better for the community / the greater good....work in the community economic development field ....at the Los Angeles Local Initiatives Support Corporation.... focused on making neighborhoods safe places to work, play and raise children.
<b>Kasey</b>	Work with people living with HIV/AIDS ....at a residential home for HIV positive individuals who are at risk for homelessness ....starting a new position through AIDS United in New Orleans doing HIV testing and prevention outreach. .... would love to be involved in international aid and relief work focusing on health
<b>Lucia</b>	Cape Town gave me exposure to gender-based violence through a policy lens ....working at Trinity College's Women & Gender Resources Action Center .... returned to UConn to coordinate our Violence Against Women Prevention Program .....great deal of time talking to my students about the importance of public policy as a vehicle for social change.
<b>Annette</b>	Begged Planned Parenthood for an internship in community organizing, advocacy and policy ....managed to get one for the academic year .... I organized UConn's first ever Consent Day - to get the campus community talking about issues of sexual assault, resources available and the importance of consent....volunteered at the Women's Center
<b>Joyce</b>	Decided to get a Human Rights major ....did a summer service program called LeaderworX in New Jersey.... am currently doing another volunteer program with Covenant House New York, a shelter for homeless youth.....leaning towards getting an MSW and pursuing a career in counseling or activism.
<b>Caitlin</b>	Worked with people with disabilities - first supporting them at their place of work, then residentially, and then in a high school.... attending graduate school to study Political Theory at UNC Chapel Hill in the fall. I want to study broadly issues around race, gender, oppression .... experiences in South Africa contributed to the kind of politics I want to study and practice .... interested in a critical study of power... and in questioning the real impacts of organizations that are supposedly "doing good."
<b>Robert</b>	Cape Town showed me ....I loved working with and talking to kids. In particular, getting to know my student John really opened my eyes to a career working counseling students. I am currently working on my Master's in School Counseling and attribute my decision to do so in large part due to my time in Cape Town.
<b>Jake</b>	Working in environmental and regulatory consulting ....moved on to working as a consultant for energy efficiency programs. I think these choices were directly related to the experience I had working on highly impactful environmental programs in Cape Town. I feel committed to helping create a better environment for the future and the experience I had in Cape Town has been both directly and indirectly related to that ....work I do is important to how we interact with the environment as a society.
<b>Robie</b>	Teaching job in an urban school district ....pursued a teaching career in .... a "tough area" because in Cape Town I worked at a school where students from the townships .... showed me the power schools can have ..... Cape Town not only made me passionate about educating those who are underprivileged but also gave me the courage I needed to do it.
<b>Cindy</b>	I learned I wanted to be a speech therapist when I studied abroad .... I am a speech and language pathologist at a charter school in Harlem .... for children from very poor areas whose parents really wanted them to get out of their district school and have a chance to succeed (just like Thondakhulu). I loved

	....working with small groups of children....I learned in South Africa this is the best way for me to connect to others.
<b>Megan</b>	Co-founded a non-profit social art project ....its purpose was to increase awareness, induce empathy, and inspire change through artistic projects that address important social issues. Undoubtedly, the ZA study abroad induced me to desire to continue with, and actually increase, the activism I was participating in in ZA.
<b>Rachel</b>	I currently work as a LCSW for a nonprofit hospice care agency in rural Colorado. I am very passionate about volunteering, giving back and having a career that helps others..... I particularly enjoy helping our poorest elders get linked up with resources. I decided to become a social worker directly related to the experiences I had in Cape Town, particularly working....awesome social workers and advocates
<b>Nick</b>	My professional interests and community involvement have all been positively impacted by my trip to Cape Town.....committed to studying more about human rights and working to make the world a better place for those less fortunate than me .... enrolled in ....AmeriCorps and ....the program allowed me to work for one year in a nonprofit in the Bay Area .... I've stayed committed to working in my community by volunteering with youth at an afterschool program as a football coach and by fundraising for organizations whose missions I agree with.
<b>Jessie</b>	The reason I work abroad now, and the reason that I do humanitarian work is because of Cape Town .... the humanitarian field isn't perfect and I have many discussions about with colleagues about the amount of harm vs help that the NGO community does here ....something that does come from the forced introspection in Cape Town
<b>Carla</b>	I graduated from uconn with a job at the ct sexual assault crisis service in Hartford. I worked there for three years .... I am still in the non profit field and don't plan to leave that. ....I would like to go back to working with sexual or domestic violence victims, even in a volunteer capacity. I am trying to find the best avenue to live and feel the passion I used to. I do feel like I take Cape Town with me everyday ....that trip did change my life.
<b>Mollie</b>	Will graduate in August with an MSN. The decision to apply to nursing school was rooted in the time I spent working with the nurse at Beautiful Gate in Cape Town. I am very committed to working towards a universal, single payer health care system.... address the unequal access to health care.....spend an average of 10-15 hours a month volunteering with various organizations ....most of my volunteer work is health related
<b>Ally</b>	I am a teacher through the program Teach for America ..... my passions are to bring opportunity to youth who are not given equal chances, whether it be because of the poverty they live in, the school they grow up to, or the food they are given every day....very involved in my community. All of this was directly impacted by my time in South Africa
<b>Alisha</b>	South Africa transformed the focus of my undergraduate studies .... when I returned I began volunteering extensively at the Women's Center on campus ....academic aspirations ....pursue a Master's in Public Health with emphasis on providing health access to women and children in developing and underserved areas. I feel that having my experiences in Cape Town led directly to this shift in priorities .... participated in 4 protests / sit-ins
<b>Mary</b>	I spent a year working in a school with a low socio economic background and learned about how a person's background can influence his or her ability to learn

#### Template 4:

#### Major Theme 4: High socio-economic dissonance experienced in Cape Town

Participant	Key Statements
-------------	----------------

<b>Joyce</b>	"The disparity of wealth was so shocking.... a highway could divide a wealthy area from a township of shacks ....unsettling to be living so comfortably while knowing so many people were still suffering in poverty....One of the hardest parts of the trip was staring poverty in the face that was mostly caused by the country's history of apartheid laws'
<b>Rachel</b>	"Another moment that hit me very hard was during our first few weeks here in Cape Town. We had gone to church and were coming home and driving through the township of Khayelitsha on our big touristy bus. I saw three little kids playing on the side of the road in a pile of garbage. One of the boys picked up a broken crate to play with and I watched as a little girl whacked him over the head with a piece of garbage because she wanted to play with the crate. These kids were literally fighting over garbage because that was all that they had to play with. I nearly burst into tears. I could remember fighting over toys with my brother when I was younger and they were certainly new, clean and innumerable"
<b>Mollie</b>	"I was shocked by the racial divide that still exists ....the classes that we took regarding social constructs, inequalities, and social disparities ....made me angry, made me cry and really tested my ways of thinking and forced me to reflect from the inside out"
<b>Annette</b>	"Today was the first day of my internship - which there's a lot to say about - but one moment that really stuck out to me was when I was just walking down a sandy dirt road looking at the ground ahead of me to avoid stepping on the broken glass that was everywhere.... can't imagine having none of that around me. It's impossible for me to imagine growing up in a stunted township in Africa in a one room shack with no running water .... People are products of their environments ....many in that township are victims- denied of their human rights and human dignity"
<b>Jake</b>	"The thing that was most troubling to me was being confronted with extreme poverty and hardship in ways that I had never before seen. I never got used to seeing poverty on such a large scale as in the townships that we visited, and I still struggle with the feelings that those sights gave me. Things like visiting an orphanage/group home where many of the very young children had been orphaned by having parents die of AIDS was so striking to me and made me feel so terrible"
<b>Caitlin</b>	"Remember being totally blown away and overwhelmed by the country as a whole. It was my first time being a racial minority.... I remember trying to make sure I never forgot how awkward and out of place I felt.... had several sort of upsetting and confusing revelations"
<b>Ally</b>	The houses got dirtier and sadder ....trash is everywhere and the houses are extremely close together. There is graffiti everywhere and many shops in the area are little shacks. Many people ....are unemployed. There are stray dogs and the roofs are made of asbestos"
<b>Lucia</b>	"The xenophobia and racism was unsettling"

<b>Alisha</b>	<p>"I was enraged after hearing about the frequent rapes that would occur when women tried using the bathroom at night as well as the complete lack of dignity and sanitation in the toilets. This image still bothers me .... For the first time in my life I can feel my white flesh and I am ashamed that so little means that I have so much more....I just want to get across how very sorry I am for not understanding how privileged I have been my whole life and how that has been at the expense of others unintentionally." ... "I want to be overjoyed by this experience and I am, but at the same time I keep crying"</p>
<b>Kasey</b>	<p>"We had spent hours touring townships and seeing such hardships and these kids just reassured me of why I'm here. There have been dozens of instances in the past ten days when I felt like I was losing hope or faith or whatever"</p>
<b>Robie</b>	<p>"Grappling with the extreme poverty I was witnessing in the townships. I come from a blue collar city in Massachusetts so I understood on a surface level the poverty some experience, but I had never seen anything like the poverty in the townships"</p>
<b>Linda</b>	<p>"The whole experience has made me find American materialism disturbing ....some of these wonderful South African children live in one room shacks with barely enough to eat while many people in America enjoy lives of abundant material excess. Of course, one doesn't even have to go as far as America to see the harsh disparities. I doubt you would have to drive more than fifteen minutes out of Nyanga township to find people living lives of incredible privilege. It's disgusting and has been one of the things that I've found the hardest to process here"</p>
<b>Robert</b>	<p>Me: "So at the orphanage, they feed you, right?"  Him: "Yes."  Me: "What do you eat for dinner?"  Him: "Bread and coffee."  Me: (afraid of the answer) "What do you eat for breakfast?"  Him: "Bread and coffee."  Bread and coffee. Can you imagine? Try going to school on that and trying to learn. Try doing any kind of athletic activity on that. Try and just stay awake for an entire day on that. And the thing is, this student isn't the only one in a situation like that. Another student is the skinniest person I have ever seen, legitimately skin and bones. Another student cannot manage to stay awake for the entire school day....it's not because he is tired"</p>
<b>Cindy</b>	<p>"And I am certainly not in my comfort zone here ....It made me realize how much I have taken my education for granted. My schooling was literally handed to me. I hardly lifted a finger when it came to learning; in fact, I actually resisted education and instruction of any kind. Fortunately, unfairly some might say, I had the resources and support to graduate with ease. ....these are privileges that were literally just handed to me, and these students work so hard just to get a fraction of that"</p>

<b>Nick</b>	When I first interviewed the refugees, I was somewhat overwhelmed ....all of their conditions were so poor....the refugee center offers to pay for one month's rent or provide money for food. The refugees find it very hard to have to choose between the money for rent or the money for food but very often they choose the money for rent because they believe that it is more important to have a place to stay every night.....I already have noticed all the things that I've taken for granted"
<b>Jessie</b>	"We were shocked....The fact that this fourteen-year-old has been through so much trauma is beyond me. I cannot believe that in his short life he has experienced so much that a person should never have to go through"
<b>Carla</b>	"Many of these stories have brought me to tears instantly or at least later on that day. The things that these women have gone through, and still are able to get up each day with faith, hope and a peace with God, renews my faith"
<b>Megan</b>	"Generally unsettled by the anxiety I felt everyday living in a place that I knew was not nearly as safe as my nice, upper-middle class neighborhood at home", her white privilege " I saw people favor me and discriminate against darker skinned people; this made me feel guilty and angry' and social injustice in South Africa "the difficulties of township life (especially for women and children), racism both among and WITHIN races, poverty, lack of healthcare, lack of proper sanitation"
<b>Mary</b>	"I started crying. Here is a boy in torn up sneakers a stretched out shirt whose grandfather died fighting for equality, whose grandmother lives with a bullet in her leg that was shot from the same gun that killed her husband, who's raised by his grandmother, whose situation, though changed, has not improved much more than his grandfather's conditions, who calls Marita and the work she is doing the "medicine" that South Africa needs"

## Template 5

### Major Theme 5: Personal connections to high socio-economic dissonance

#### Participant                      Key Statements

<b>Mollie</b>	<p>“Beautiful Gate, a group home for children who have circumstances that prevent them from living with their parents or other family .... I walked in to find the doctor busy with a young girl and her dad..... the clinic we were at is strictly an ARV clinic, meaning that every patient is suffering from HIV/aids.... The 2nd doctor I shadowed ....sees about 50 patients a day, and has almost 500 patients total. They are all children under the age of 10 living with the disease.... I watched in awe as this 9 year old correctly pointed to her drugs and told her each of their dosages .... Claire then asked the girl if she knew why she was taking the medications .... They little girl looked down at her lap, was silent for about 30 seconds, and then replied, "Because I'm HIV positive." When she looked up there were tears streaming down her face”</p>
<b>Joyce</b>	<p>“I arrived at CMES and then went to the Homestead in Khayelitsha. When I walked through the door, immediately the boys came running up to me and gave me hugs and colored pages with stickers on them .... I will cherish the photos, cards, and memories that I have teaching at the Homestead forever. The boys brought so much joy to my days interning and I know I will never forget them.... It breaks my heart knowing that these children often struggle so much for reasons beyond their control. The students have been teaching me so much about themselves, the world, and myself”</p>
<b>Robert</b>	<p>“Bongi is an incredible individual who has the capability of inspiring everyone around him. From my initial conversation with him I knew that he was someone that I wanted to be around....I grew closer to him as we both worked towards making the Firefighters as great as their potential.... The soccer players were just as amazing.... I was doing something that I loved with a group of people who provided for me as much as I provided for them .... The relationship I built over these few months has been one of the most rewarding and yet emotionally taxing experiences of my life”</p>
<b>Jake</b>	<p>“It was inspiring and eye opening to see people all around me every day working to make their country better with great resilience and passion”</p>
<b>Caitlin</b>	<p>“The students in the book club at both Thandokhulu and Sophumelela are absolutely amazing. They are so motivated and excited about reading and learning.... even though the students really do appreciate the club so much, I asked kids at each school how we could make the club better and many had only one answer: food. It killed me. At lunch time during Thandokhulu, I stay in my office because so many of the kids have nothing to eat”</p>

<b>Kasey</b>	<p>“Most people I came in contact with at my internship at Thandokhulu Secondary School were unbelievably amazing. They were so welcoming, warm and loving that it’s been hard to find people as collectively beautiful since that moment ....my learners at Thandokhulu have welcomed me and accepted me more than I could have ever expected. They are constantly showing me how hard they are willing to work to achieve their goals; mainly by working against the system that makes it easier for them to fail”</p>
<b>Ally</b>	<p>“I chose to do a home stay in the township Ocean View ....a community of people who were removed from their homes during Apartheid ....the area is not a place you would dream of staying, and has its problems with drugs and poverty. However, I have fallen in love with Ocean View. It has its struggles, but it is a community full of love and personality. There are hard times but so many good people that welcomed us with open arms into their lives and made us feel like we had been there all along”</p>
<b>Megan</b>	<p>“At an Easter party hosted by one of the girls on Sunday afternoon, I remember stepping back, looking around the room, and truly appreciating my new life in Cape Town—a life that will be over in just a few short days! It’s futile to describe in words just how much I will miss the people of Cape Town, but I can say that I have never before had the privilege of meeting so many amazing people in such a short period of time”</p>
<b>Robie</b>	<p>“After staying for three nights in a family’s home in Ocean View....the family I stayed with took me in with so much love and kindness that I found my heart aching for the family I have back home ....really valuable lessons from the people I stayed with. ....no matter how much or how little you have, you should always share whatever you can.”</p>
<b>Annette</b>	<p>“The kids were absolutely adorable and so full of life and excitement. They were so happy to be at school and surrounded by friends that it was mildly contagious.... the children would play outside on the rusted-metal or splintering-wooden play sets....two children did get bloody lips after smacking their heads into the structures at different times and even more children (running barefoot) complained about stepping on sharp things – glass in the sand, which was everywhere ....but still it wasn’t just the lack of safety that depressed me. It was the lack of everything”</p>
<b>Lucia</b>	<p>“The memories that make me smile the most are those I shared with my friend and internship supervisor Claire. Claire was originally from Zimbabwe but had been living in Cape Town for years when I arrived. Her disdain for Americans was no secret and initially I remember thinking she would never warm up to me. I still don’t know how I managed to win her over but she is someone I will never forget”</p>



<b>Linda</b>	<p>"We have been working with the Girl Child Movement, which aims to empower girls by providing a venue for them to come together and discuss the specific challenges that they face as they grow up and mature into women..... Josie, the coordinator of the GCM is absolutely amazing ....the girls were wonderful – because nearly 60% of South African women can't afford access to traditional feminine hygiene products such as disposable pads and tampons, menstruation is tied to social stigma. Some girls miss school during that time of the month, something that I was shocked and angry about"</p>
<b>Carla</b>	<p>"Place of Hope is an amazing place and truly fits its name. I love spending time with the kids and getting to hear the life stories of them and their families. I have built some amazing relationships with the clients and the people who work there. I am only sad that it took so much time to build these and now my time is almost up. But I try to spend as much time as I can with my new friends, including visiting their churches on Sundays or getting lunch with them on the weekends"</p>
<b>Rachel</b>	<p>"I have grown as a person on this trip and changed. I have learned so much from my internship, our classes, my professors, this community and my peers. I know that I will never forget this experience here in this amazing country with these awesome people"</p>
<b>Nick</b>	<p>"I have also been lucky enough to have made friends with people from Cape Town such as Bongi and Mkhululi, a student at Thandokhulu High School. They both have taught me about the sense the spirit of ubuntu. Ubuntu literally means "I am because we are" The spirit of ubuntu relies on the fact that we are all inter-connected and dependent one another.... I was sad to leave because I know that some of the people that I interacted with on a daily basis, I will not get to see again.... I can feel the beautiful and friendly atmosphere all around me and I cannot help but to take part "</p>
<b>Cindy</b>	<p>"One boy's response was, "Anything. Just any book. English please." It absolutely broke my heart. I'm going to look at some second hand book stores on Monday, so they should be all set with a book by Tuesday. I just have had a hard time getting those boys out of my mind.... I can pick up a book and think of a specific student who would love it.... What I have found most moving is the culmination of Thandokhulu's first library"</p>
<b>Alisha</b>	<p>"These dang kids have broken me down in so many ways I can't describe it even to myself but I will try to for the benefit of this paper- and maybe in years to come I will have a better idea of what exactly they've done to this heart of mine. I think they have stolen it. Taken it in their little hands and kept it as a pet. My mind wanders to them in my free time, my hands fiddle toward my computer to look up more activities to give to them, and always- every time I think of them I feel riddled with guilt that I haven't lived up to an expectation.... They run to hug your legs, and they smile just when they see your face bobbing up the street. Somehow all the anxiety that you felt the whole week dissolves and you feel like you are their person, that thing that they have been waiting to see all day. I can't describe how special that makes me feel. I am honored to be someone's person"</p>

<b>Mary</b>	<p>“I met Jabu. Jabu’s grandfather was one of the 69 people shot in the back and killed. His grandmother was one of the 108 people injured and she still lives with a bullet in her leg. His grandfather, died at the age of 30 on 21 March 1960. Every year, for the past three years, Jabu waits for Marita, his “mom” as he affectionately referred to her as, and her students. He watches for the big embarrassingly glamorous coach buses. As I sat next to Marita who had Jabu’s arm draped around her he said one of the most touching things I have ever heard; he told Marita “you are the medicine that this country needs. I started crying”</p>
-------------	--

## Template 6

### Major Theme 6 – Readjustment issues back in the U.S.

#### Participant Key statements

<b>Jake</b>	"I had a hard time adjusting to being back at UConn....my friends back at UConn didn't understand the experience I had had, and were uninterested in some of the changes that I felt I had undergone....that was disappointing to me."
<b>Ashley</b>	"It quickly became clear how much I had actually changed while away ....I noticed inequality in my everyday life like I never had before. My family began to think I was over sensitive or brainwashed by my liberal classes. I felt like I had been blind to things that now seemed so obvious and it was difficult having the people I loved not share my passions or at the very least, try to understand them"
<b>Robie</b>	"Sometimes when people have been asking about my trip I try to avoid answering .... I'm scared that someone will judge what I'm saying and think I'm just being an idealist.... I want to keep my experiences locked inside me where no one can look at them funny and make sarcastic comments....I don't want anyone to tarnish my experience"
<b>Alisha</b>	My return to America has challenged me in many ways.....struggled with having conversation with people I love dearly yet who are in many ways unobservant of the world around them and their impacts on others. I have had various difficult and often argumentative conversations about gender, sexuality, race, discrimination, police brutality, the confederate flag etc... .. and I sometimes feel alienated within my own family"
<b>Ally</b>	"When I came home I was a little lost. I felt like I couldn't relate to my old friends as much, they cared about things I didn't really care about any more ....I had a completely different view of the United States.... and struggled or several months to deal with my new perspectives and realizations of how much progress still needed to happen for race, gender, and so much more"
<b>Mollie</b>	"My transition back into society in the United States was not very easy. One day shortly after I returned home my dad asked me to mow the lawn. I agreed, and went outside to do the chore. As I was mowing, I started thinking about the idea of even having a lawn to mow - and how the majority of the world and especially the people I had spent the semester interacting with, probably didn't even know that such a chore existed. By the time I was done mowing the lawn, I was in tears from thinking about unfair the world is in general. When I went inside, my dad asked what was wrong and I could only speak to how unfair I found it that we had 5 bathrooms and a lawn to mow when people that I had met and spent time with didn't even have running water. As illustrated, transitioning back into the culture I had left behind was not easy"
<b>Joyce</b>	"I did experience a lot of culture shock and life seemed easier in a sense because I was now so comfortable again. I was excited to see family and friends but I wish they could all experience what I was able to. It was sad thinking I may or may not be back to Cape Town but I really hoped that I would. I felt very bitter-sweet"

<b>Jake</b>	<p>"I had a hard time adjusting to being back at UConn, and felt that my friends back at UConn didn't understand the experience I had had, and were uninterested in some of the changes that I felt I had undergone. That was disappointing to me. I expected to be able to bring more of what I learned and experienced into my day-to-day life at college, but found life back in the states to be pretty boring upon first returning"</p>
<b>Kasey</b>	<p>"I was excited to see my family and try to catch up on 5 months of being apart but it quickly became clear how much I had actually changed while away. I became frustrated quickly when I couldn't unlearn the things I had found in my semester away. It feels like such a short time but I noticed inequality in my everyday life like I never had before. My family began to think I was over sensitive or brainwashed by my liberal classes. I felt like I had been blind to things that now seemed so obvious and it was difficult having the people I loved not share my passions or at the very least, try to understand them"</p>
<b>Caitlin</b>	<p>"Lots of people either felt that I went "crazy" or that I grew or learned a lot... depending on their politics! But either way, it was clear that I was more vocal and sure of my convictions"</p>
<b>Alisha</b>	<p>"Having a really difficult time thinking about all of the things I was learning in the first week of and could not really find any way to express my new emotions. I was angry with myself for not having been aware of how privileged my life is because of my white skin. I was also very guilty and ashamed that I did not know very much history about my own country's civil rights movements and have never looked into learning more for empathy's sake....I have most struggled with having conversation with people I love dearly yet who are in many ways unobservant of the world around them and their impacts on others. I have had various difficult and often argumentative conversations about gender, sexuality, race, discrimination, police brutality, the confederate flag etc... etc... and I sometimes feel alienated within my own family"</p>
<b>Lucia</b>	<p>"Was in a pretty dark place when I arrived home. I found it hard to connect with old friends and family and wanted desperately to go back. It took me a very long time to accept that the experience was over"</p>
<b>Megan</b>	<p>"ZA was a trigger for me in both a positive ways (first hand education about some of humanity's most complicated issues and histories) and negative ways (3.5 months of stress and periodic mood issues since then) ....that those who are already predisposed to empathy and have a high level of functioning empathy already should avoid the program because the overload of saddening stimuli and lack of familial and familiar support systems and safety may effect such students in frightening ways. For me, the experience had wonderful days full of enrichment and horrific days full of terror and isolation"</p>

<b>Mary</b>	<p>“I couldn’t eat meat when I got home because of the way I had seen meat being sold in South Africa. I had PTSD from seeing this pile of meat near the train station I passed every day on my way to work and the woman that stood there all day in the sun swatting the flies away. I got over this but it took a month or two. Also, when I got home I tore apart my entire room and disposed of more than half of its contents. I felt claustrophobic in a space that had once been my only solace. I no longer wanted pointless belongings and with graduation coming up I was disgusted at the thought of both giving and receiving pointless gifts”</p>
-------------	---

# Appendix I

## Analytic Category 1: *Transforming global perspectives and enhancing global citizenship*

Sample Participant Quotes	Literature Quotes
<i>Global Perspective Transformation</i>	
Left Cape Town program “with such a different sense of the world ....My view of the world and perspective on life has changed” Ashley My experience has irrevocably changed my life, my views, and my future. I cannot imagine who I would be today without those four months.... I have had a life altering experience here in Cape Town” Caitlin	“becoming critically aware of how and why our presuppositions ....constrain the way we perceive, understand and feel about our world; of reformulating these assumptions to permit a more inclusive, discriminating, permeable and integrative perspective; and of making decisions or otherwise acting on these new understandings” (Mezirow, 1991, p.14).
This program shaped my world view. ....program was the most transformative experience of my life, thus far.” Lucia “Learned a great deal about another culture....be more open minded, caring, & compassionate during this program” Ashley	“ theory of perspective transformation provides a model of the learning process of intercultural competency” (Taylor, 1994, p.. 394)
“My view of the world has changed through an enhanced sense of critical thinking. Thinking critically changes how I see the world, see my relationships, it changes everything” Peter My view of the world, perspective on life and self-identity have all changed PROFOUNDLY because of my Cape Town experience. Where I work, live, what I do for a living, who I interact with, how I interact with people - it's all changed” Annette	“the traditional-aged college students needs to develop and internalize a global perspective into her thinking, sense of identity, and relationships with others” (Chickering and Braskamp, 2009, p.27).
"Beliefs will be the light by which you see, but they will not be what you see, and they will not be a substitute for seeing." When you get out of your comfort zone and challenge your beliefs about the way the world works, you see things in new/different ways” Linda	“assessing the grounds of one’s beliefs” (Dewey, 1933, p. 9) and “examining our assumptions by which we have justified our convictions”.
<i>Global Citizenship Development</i>	
“Cape Town helped me see how everyone is connected, and how everyone can help each other. Everyone in this world has something to offer, and bringing people together who need different things from each other is what can make for a sustainable and community-oriented world” Abby I learned how to be open, adaptable and respectful of all cultures, histories and experiences “ Ashley	“The global citizen understands ....her role in building relationships through embracing diversity and finding a shared purpose across national boundaries. Seeks to engage others in a sense of shared common humanity ----and shared concerns -- --compassionate responses to injustice” (Schultz, 2007, p.256) “shared values and mutual respect” (Muetzelfeldt and Smith, 2002, p.61).
“suddenly become aware of new problems that exist --richer sense of the world (global consciousness) around us and what can be done to make it better for all people “ Ally  “I think what has most changed about me is that I now have honest visceral reactions to injustice and have come to understand what true empathy can feel like. I try to be an ally in activism for the causes that I feel I should stand up for.” Alisha	“global citizen as someone who is aware of the wider world and their role as a world citizen; respects and values diversity; has an understanding of how the world works economically, politically, socially, culturally, technologically and environmentally; is outraged ----by social injustice; participates in and contributes to the community at a range of levels from the local to the global; is willing to take action to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place” Oxfam, 1997)

## Analytic Category 2: *Persistent perspective transformations/ transformative global citizenship*

Sample Participant Quotes	Literature Quotes
<p>"The decision to apply to nursing school was rooted in the time I spent ....with the nurse at Beautiful Gate in Cape Town .... I spend an average of 10-15 hours a month volunteering....most of my volunteer work is health related" (Mollie, 2011)</p> <p>"Cape Town ....helped me to reorganize my priorities .... inspired me to change my career path. ....saw more injustices and inequities ....moved to take action .....began volunteering extensively at the Women's Center" (Alisha, 2013)</p> <p>"Co-founded a non-profit social art project ....its purpose was to increase awareness, induce empathy, and inspire change ....The ZA study abroad induced me to ....to increase, the activism I was participating in in ZA" (Megan, 2013)</p> <p>"I can genuinely say that I actively pursued a teaching career in what many people would deem a "tough area" because in Cape Town I worked at a school where students from the townships .... Cape Town changed my life (Robie, 2012)</p> <p>"I am a teacher through the program Teach for America. My passions are to bring opportunity to youth who are not given equal chances, whether it be because of the poverty they live in, the school they grow up to, or the food they are given every day. As a teacher, I am very involved in my community. All of this was directly impacted by my time in South Africa. I feel like it is my responsibility to share my privilege with those who face oppression (Ally, 2012)</p>	<p>There is not much point in transformation is nothing occurs out of it (Mezirow, 1938).</p> <p>"Transformative citizens take action to promote social justice" (Banks, 2008, p.136).</p> <p>"Those who are truly transformed by an experience need to demonstrate the willingness to act on their new perspective" (Taylor, 1997)</p> <p>Critical global citizenship education involves "critical thinking, meaningful experiences, and radical activism (Lapayese, 2003)</p> <p>Global citizen "is willing to take action to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place" (Davies, 2006, p.206)</p>

### **Analytic Category 3: *Reconsidering ideologies, hegemonic assumptions and relative privilege after high levels of socio-economic cognitive dissonance***

Sample Participant Quotes	Literature Quotes
<p>“Regarding social constructs, inequalities, and social disparities really enlightened me and inspired me to be a more conscious member of society. Things that we learned fascinated me, made me angry, made me cry - and really tested my ways of thinking and forced me to reflect from the inside out” Mollie</p> <p>“The disparity of wealth was so shocking.... a highway could divide a wealthy area from a township of shacks ....unsettling to be living so comfortably while knowing so many people were still suffering in poverty” Joyce</p> <p>“Another moment that hit me very hard was during our first few weeks here in Cape Town. I saw three little kids playing on the side of the road in a pile of garbage. One of the boys picked up a broken crate to play with and I watched as a little girl whacked him over the head with a piece of garbage because she wanted to play with the crate. These kids were literally fighting over garbage because that was all that they had to play with. I nearly burst into tears.” Rachel</p> <p>“having a very difficult time trying to balance the appreciation for the fortune I have been given in my life with the guilt I feel at my internship”. Shelly</p> <p>“For the first time in my life I can feel my white flesh and I am ashamed that so little means that I have so much more.... I just want to get across how very sorry I am for not understanding how privileged I have been my whole life and how that has been at the expense of others unintentionally .... I want to be overjoyed by this experience.... but I keep crying” Alisha</p> <p>“For my personal development, this has been an extremely important realization. It’s allowed me to address my privilege, to notice injustices in my world and to start combatting unfair aspects of my community that I had previously accepted”. Kasey</p> <p>It made me realize how much I have taken my education for granted. My schooling was literally handed to me Fortunately, unfairly some might say, I had the resources and support to graduate with ease. ....these are privileges that were literally just handed to me, and these students work so hard just to get a fraction of that” Cindy</p>	<p>“social norms other than those to which we ascribe can also be a disorienting” (Cranton, 2006, p. 62)</p> <p>Cognitive dissonance represents “a temporary gap that exists between what we think we already know and a contradictory experience ....it is this moment of dissonance that drives the service-learner to question the way in which she or he previously viewed the world” (Morton and Campbell (2007, p.12).</p> <p>“interactional moments of experiences which leave marks on people’s lives ....alter “the fundamental meaning structure in a person (Denizen, 1989, pg. 70).</p> <p>“For a mature transformation to occur, at some point there must be conscious, critical reflections our early assumptions about life” (Daloz, 2000, p. 113).</p> <p>“Sociocultural distortions involve take for granted belief systems that pertain to power and social relationships, especially those currently prevailing and legitimized ....by institutions” (Mezirow, 1990, p. 14).</p> <p>“Process by which people learn to recognize how uncritically accepted and unjust dominant ideologies are embedded in everyday situations and practices – critical reflection as ideology critique focuses on helping people come to an awareness of how capitalism shapes belief systems and assumptions (ideologies) that justify and maintain economic and political inequity” (Brookfield, 2000, p. 128).</p> <p>“questioning practices and assumptions that appear to make our lives easier” (Brookfield,1995, p. 7)</p> <p>“their lives have been significantly affected by their social location one’s life” (Curry- Stevens, 2007, p. 49)</p> <p>“difficult and often unpleasant to acknowledge that all of the good things that have happened to you are not simply the result of your hard work and talent and motivation but the result over which you have no power” (Kimmel, 2002. p. 5)</p> <p>Questioning around the fairness of one’s own relative privilege along with “the distribution of power in society” (Mitchell, 2007, p. 101)</p>



#### **Analytic Category 4: *Impactful personal connections with individuals of considerably less privilege***

Sample Participant Quotes	Literature Quotes
<p>“it breaks my heart knowing that these children often struggle so much for reasons beyond their control. The students have been teaching me so much about themselves, the world, and myself “ Joyce</p> <p>“These dang kids have broken me down in so many ways I can’t describe it even to myself but I will try to for the benefit of this paper- and maybe in years to come I will have a better idea of what exactly they’ve done to this heart of mine. I think they have stolen it. Taken it in their little hands and kept it as a pet” Alisha</p> <p>“Fallen in love with Ocean View.... Some are the sons and daughters of the people who were forced to leave, others experienced it themselves....has its problems with drugs and poverty .... which has its struggles, but it is a community full of love and personality. There are hard times but so many good people that welcomed us with open arms into their lives and made us feel like we had been there all along.” Ally</p> <p>“the family I stayed with took me in with so much love and kindness that I found my heart aching for the family I have back home ....really valuable lessons from the people I stayed with. ....no matter how much or how little you have, you should always share whatever you can.” Robie</p> <p>“Most people I came in contact with at my internship at Thandokhulu Secondary School were unbelievably amazing. They were so welcoming, warm and loving that it’s been hard to find people as collectively beautiful since that moment ....my learners at Thandokhulu have welcomed me and accepted me more than I could have ever expected. They are constantly showing me how hard they are willing to work to achieve their goals” Kasey</p>	<p>“more studies referred to the significance of relationships in a perspective transformation than any other finding in the review” (Taylor, 1997, p.10).</p> <p>“Working with people from different ethnic or racial backgrounds, people living in poverty .... Initiates a student’s exploration of difference, similarity, and diversity within inclusiveness. Students come to see people as individuals with their own stories, rather than statistics and stereotypes. Through these experiences, students recognize other ways of living and thinking, which encourages them to be more open-minded and to see the world from other perspective” (Cipolle, 2010, p. 41)</p> <p>“Interactions with people who are suffering from a variety of social problems, students no longer see poverty as an abstract and detached image viewed on television. Rather, poverty is connected to real people with names, faces, and hearts. The struggle of Nicaraguans who are surviving on very little food, money, shelter, and clean water is felt viscerally and internalized by each study participant in a unique manner” ( Kiely, 2005, p.9)</p> <p>Service-learning programs that provide multiple opportunities for direct interaction with diverse community members is a strong predictor of students’ perspective transformation (Eyler &amp; Giles, 1999).</p> <p>Students who work with resource-poor individuals “were more apt to personalize their social concerns and thus more willing to become involved in work for social change” (Rhoads, 1997, p. 7).</p>

## **Appendix J**

### **Operational Definition of Key Terms**

#### **Study abroad**

Study abroad is a program in which college students participate in academic courses in a location outside the geographical boundaries of their own country

#### **International Service-Learning (ISL)**

A structured academic experience in another country in which students (a) participate in an organized service activity that addresses identified community needs; (b) learn from direct interaction and cross-cultural dialogue with others; and (c) reflect on the experience in such a way as to gain further understanding of course content, a deeper appreciation of the host country (Bringle & Hatcher, 2010)

#### **Critical Service-Learning**

A philosophical instructional approach that support students in understanding the causes of injustice, and encourages students to see themselves as agents of social change (Doerr, 2011)

#### **Transformational Learning**

Multi-step process by which the learner critically reflects about cognitive dissonance (disorienting dilemma) as they construe, validate, and reformulate the meaning of their experience and change their previous beliefs, values, attitudes, and/ or worldviews (Mezirow,2000)

#### **Perspective Transformation**

A perspective transformation is a process of challenging previously held beliefs and assumptions, representing a development shift to a new worldview (Tennant, 1993)

**Transformative Global Citizenship**

Awareness of the wider world and one's role as a world citizen; respects and values diversity; has an understanding of how the world works economically, politically, socially, culturally, technologically and environmentally; is outraged by social injustice; participates in and contributes to the community at a range of levels from the local to the global; is willing to take action to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place; and takes responsibility for their actions (Oxfam, 1997)

**Global Consciousness**

Self-awareness of one's place within an economically, socially, politically, and environmentally interdependent global society. Acceptance of one's rights, privileges, obligations and responsibilities as a 'citizen of the world' as part of a common humanity.

**Ethnocultural Empathy**

Accepting, respecting and valuing diversity. Empathy for cultures, ethnicities and religions that are different from one's own

**Social justice Activism**

Taking action, either globally or locally, to make the world a more equitable and sustainable place